Usability Test Report: Tool for Books & More Bento Box

Summary

Emily Daly and Bendte Fagge conducted usability testing that compared books and media search results using the Books & More tab in the search box on the Duke Libraries homepage against Summon scoped to catalog results. The test was held outside of the Von der Heyden Pavilion on April 8, 2014 from 12:00 – 1:00pm. A pilot was conducted with Steph Matthiesen. The test consisted of a short set of background questions, two tasks, and three post-test questions that lasted approximately 10 minutes.

Each participant was asked to search for a term of their choosing in both the Books & More tab and Summon scoped to catalog results. We asked each participant to do this twice, searching for two terms or phrases of their choosing. We alternated the starting task for each participant so that all participants did not first search for books and media via the Books & More tab and then duplicate their search in Summon. Three participants started with task one (search via Books & More tab first) and two participants started with task two (search via Summon first). See Appendix for test script.

Participants

Five individuals (excluding our pilot participant) completed this test. Participants included two graduate students, one staff member, and two undergraduates representing the following departments: chemistry, Duke Institute for Brain Sciences, divinity/MSW program, history and political science, and public policy.

Four out of five participants said they have used the Duke Libraries website to search for books. Of those four: one searches for books every day, one searches for books once a month, and two search for books less often.

Key Findings

1. Three out of five users preferred the search results using the Books & More tab in the search box on the Duke Libraries homepage. *Note*: This is the overall preference after both tasks were completed.

2. For individual tasks, the preference for search results was split between the Books & More tab and Summon. For task one, users started their search using the Books & More tab; 3 out of 5 users preferred the results from Summon. For task two, users started their search using Summon; 4 out of 5 users preferred the results from using the Books & More tab.

3. While we did not ask about user interface, two users who preferred Books & More results also preferred the Endeca search results interface. These users cited liking the following functions of

---

For more information, please contact *emily.daly@duke.edu*

the Books & More search and results interfaces: keyword and title search options; search and subject refinement options; number of displayed search results (20, as opposed to Summon's 10); and the inclusion of the item format and image for each search result.

4. Of the two users who preferred Summon, one user mentioned that this tool gave a wider spectrum of search results.

Key Recommendations

1. Continue to investigate the possibility of using Endeca to power the Books & More section of the Bento interface.

2. If the development work needed to use Endeca for Books & More in the Bento interface is too complex and time consuming, then use Summon to power Books & More, but link the Endeca results interface from 'See more' at the top of the Books & More column.

3. Consider displaying more than 5 results in the Books & More Bento interface. (One user liked that there were 20 results displayed at a time using the Books & More tab whereas Summon only displayed 10 results at a time.)

4. Consider displaying an item description for results in the Books & More section of the Bento interface. (One user mentioned liking the item description that displayed in the search results.)

Results

Task One: Search for books and media using Books & More on DUL homepage

Task one required participants to search for books and media using the Books & More tab on the Duke Libraries homepage; participants were then asked to conduct the same search using Summon.

Participant	Search terms	Tool preference	Preference reason
1	angels and hebrews	Books & More tab DUL homepage	Results are more specific to what I'm looking for and there is a more general understanding of Hebrews. The other tool (Summon) gives more general results, so I would have to look through the books to see if they were what I wanted.
2	self help	Summon	Titles seem to be more specific to the subject I'm looking for and you notice the different types of literature available.

			For the other search (Books & More tab DUL homepage), I would want to narrow my results.
3	campaign financing legislator behavior	Summon	The results are more relevant, but I would need more recent titles. The other search (Books & More tab DUL homepage) gave me collections, which doesn't seem helpful.
4	heat of combustion sugars	Summon	There are more results that look relevant. For the other search (Books & More tab DUL homepage), I only get 3 results that are not relevant, but maybe I should have refined my search.
5	navy british 18th century	Books & More tab DUL homepage	This tool returns more items on the topic and they are more relevant. I wouldn't have to spend as much time looking through search results. The results from the other tool (Summon) looked less on topic --- only 1 relevant book.

Task Two: Search for books and media using Summon scoped to catalog

Task two required participants to search for books and media using Summon; participants were then asked to conduct the same search using the Books & More tab on the Duke Libraries homepage.

Participant	Search terms	Tool preference	Preference reason
1	William Blake as artist	Books & More tab DUL homepage	More interesting and specific results. I also like that I can refine results by type such as subjects, format, and location. The other tool (Summon) is more like an Ebsco search where you can only refine by format or type and lower down in the interface is the subject refinement.
2	body language and communication	Books & More tab DUL homepage	The titles seem to be more in line with what I'm interested in. The titles are more striking. For the other search (Summon), I

			would like to see more of a 2-3 sentence description of the book/content. Some of them have a description and it draws me to it.
3	history of pork barrel spending	Summon	Found one that is the best result and another one that is good. The first 2 results are not that useful. Third result is probably outside of what I'm researching. Other items don't look that interesting.

For the other tool (Books & More tab DUL homepage), the results don't seem very useful. There are collections and papers, but I'm not sure what they are referring to. The first result might be good. However, I'm not sure about the Barack Obama book is in the results. |
| 4 | angiotensin II in the kidney | Books & More tab DUL homepage | I like the images of the books so I know what I'm looking for when I go get it. The results look good and would be good if I was looking for something more specific. The interface and information is clearer. Gives you more specific niche of the titles.

The results look pretty good for the other tool (Summon), but I prefer the results from the Books & More tab on the DUL homepage. |
| 5 | jane austen emma | Books & More tab DUL homepage | Both are showing relevant results, but the Books & More tab on the DUL homepage shows more results on the first page. The results are bringing up versions of Emma. And later results look like they are looking at text from a critical standpoint. Norton version is showing up which is nice. Video recordings are showing up.

The results look pretty good for both tools, but I prefer the results |

			from the Books & More tab on the DUL homepage.

Post-Test Interview

Participants had the following responses in their post-test interview.

Overall preference of either Books & More tab on the DUL homepage or Summon:

- 3 users prefer Books & More tab on the DUL homepage
- 2 users prefer Summon

What users liked about the Books & More tab on the DUL homepage:

- When I do a keyword search, I am looking for something more specific. But there are things I like about the Interface: Title search, keywords search, subject refinement.
- The titles seem to be more relevant to what I would be interested in reading.
- I like that it brings up more results on the first page rather than having to go to another page. I like to refine my searches and I like how the results are displaying in Books & More. I like that the format is listed and I like the image of the books.

What users liked about Summon:

- Gives wider spectrum --- hopefully will get what you want.

Appendix: Tool for Books & More Bento Box Test Script

Thank you for agreeing to take part in this study.

We are currently trying to improve the search tools available from the Duke Libraries homepage and would like your input.

I will be asking you to complete two tasks involving finding books, videos, government documents and other media through Duke Libraries. Note that we're not focusing on articles today – just the items you'd find if you did a search in the "Books & More" search box.

Keep in mind that there are no right or wrong answers and that we're testing a tool — not you.

Okay, first some general questions:

1. Are you an undergrad, grad student, faculty member, staff member?

a. If you are an undergrad, what year are you?

b. If you are an undergrad, what is your major?

c. If you are a grad student or faculty or staff member, what department are you in?

2. Have you ever used the Duke Libraries website to search for books (NOT articles)?

a. If yes, would you say you search for books from Duke Libraries every day, every week, every month, once a semester, or less often?

Now I'd like you to complete a couple of tasks to test two different tools that display results from the Books & More search. It would be really helpful if you would share your thoughts and observations as you are completing the tasks, so try to think aloud as much as you can. Like I said, there are no right or wrong answers.

TASK ONE

a. Think of a topic you're currently thinking about or researching for a class, project or personal interest.

b. Would you mind telling me what the class/project is? [If users don't have a class that requires research, ask them to search for a topic that interests them, or suggest "climate change", "food and globalization" or "African American dance."]

c. Use the Books & More search on the Libraries homepage, http://library.duke.edu/, to search for books and other media (not articles) that would help you with your research. Take a moment to consider the results – try to overlook the interface and focus only on the results.

d. Now, do the same search using this site, http://people.duke.edu/~tcrich/summon.html.

e. Consider the results – not interface – of your search in both tools. What are your thoughts about each set of results?

f. Which set of results do you prefer for your research topic?

g. Why do you prefer that set of results?

[SWITCH TOOLS for TASK TWO]

TASK TWO

Now, I'm going to ask you to do the same task but with a different search topic.

a. First, think of another topic you're interested in researching, either for a class or for personal interest.

b. Use this site, http://people.duke.edu/~tcrich/summon.html, to search for books and media on this topic.

c. And now use the Books & More search box on the Libraries homepage, http://library.duke.edu/, to search for books and media on the same topic.

d. Once again, consider the results – not interface – of your search in both tools. What are your thoughts about each set of results?

e. Which set of results do you prefer for your research topic?

f. Why do you prefer that set of results?

Okay, that concludes our tasks. I have a few questions I'd like to ask you about your experience.

POST-TEST INTERVIEW

1. Based on the searches you just conducted and the results you received (again, we're not talking about the interface), do you have a preference between Books & More (show Endeca results) and this tool (show scoped Summon results)?

    a. If so, what is your preference?

    b. Why?
    OR

   c. If not, why do you have no preference?

2. Is there anything else you'd like to tell us about your experience using these two tools?