Surpassing “Survival”: On the Urbanity of “Traditional Religion” in the Afro-Atlantic World

by J. Lorand Matory

Introduction

Both African “survivals” in the Americas and the endurance of “traditional” religion in Africa are often assumed to depend on the isolation and poverty of the practitioners. However, many religions that have been showcased as the foremost instances of “survival” reveal, on closer inspection, the active involvement of prosperous travelers, scholars, merchants, and bourgeois cultural nationalists. These cases lead us to question the worth of the “survival” metaphor in the analysis of how “traditional” and African-inspired religions are reproduced over time in the Afro-Atlantic world.

The scholarly literature frequently assumes that the “survival” and centrality of African religious traditions depend on the cultural isolation of the host region. Similarly, students of religion in West Africa have often predicted the demise of “local” religions amid colonialism and the influx of Islam and Christianity. Robin Horton offers the subtler point that conversion to Islam in West Africa is actually also a turn toward high-god traditions inherent in the local cosmology, but this turn, he argues, reflects the people’s increasing exposure to long-distance and cosmopolitan economic and political forces that appear to be beyond the authority of “local” gods. Moreover, such conversion heralds the marginalization of those “local” gods. Yet, as I have argued elsewhere, Islam appeared in West Africa over a millennium ago, and the demise of “local” gods remains but a prediction.

The Afro-Americanist literature too has tended to posit that rural isolation and poverty are the normal conditions for the “retention” of African culture. Roger Bastide accordingly describes Bahia as exceptional in being a large city that retained its African religion with relative purity; Melville J. Herskovits recognizes Paramaribo, Port-au-Prince and Bahia as similarly exceptional, and Newbell Niles Puckett represents New Orleans as exceptional. Rather than “exceptions,” these numerous urban cases might better be seen as disproving any simple rule. Pierre Verger argues (from a viewpoint closer to mine) that the “high social class” of certain enslaved Africans—such as royals and priests—largely explains why their religious practices prevailed over those of other Africans.

My own hypothesis is more radical still: that religious practices around the Atlantic perimeter actually benefited critically from their practitioners’ ongoing interclass and interregional connections, and from their facility with the modalities of Western power, such as the printing press; this applies to many of the religions that allegedly exemplify African “survival,” “retention,” and “preservation.” In this essay, I reexamine several exceptions to the dominant “survival through isolation and poverty” explanatory paradigm for African religion in the age of Anglo-Saxon global dominance, and I hypothesize that the cases where that paradigm actually applies are the real exceptions. In this controversy, the very model of African cultural “survival” stands on trial.

Like many I am grateful for what the Herskovitian metaphors of “survival,” “retention,” and “preservation” have taught us. But
I am dissatisfied with their analytic inattention to contextual meaning and to agency. For the same reason, I am skeptical of the way that the metaphorical term "collective memory" has often been used.

I am grateful to Sidney Mintz and Richard Price for their Baside-inspired "creolization" model, which acknowledges the New World institutions that made the convergence of African models socially possible in the Americas and productively transformed them into African-American models. However, I would caution against the possible suggestion that creole languages are the paradigm case for the production and reproduction of African-American cultures—that like creole languages, African-American cultures are quick forming, internally systematic, and typically bounded in discrete units.

Paul Gilroy's notion of the "discontinuous" reproduction of culture in the African diaspora positively acknowledges cultural exchange among diverse populations, but problematically represents that exchange entirely as a reaction to exclusion from the promises of Euro-American democracy/modernity, one that is furthermore constitutionally disconnected from Africa. I also appreciate Joseph Roach's notion of "circum-Atlantic performance," which observes that diverse peoples on that ocean perimeter have accurately, fictionally, or ironically mimicked each other for 500 years, as a fundamental condition of each such people's formation of its cultural identity. But, again, this reciprocal mimicry ignores the historical and ongoing reality of a real, live Africa constantly in our midst.

The analytic metaphor that I propose assumes the historical and cultural "coevalness," to borrow Johannes Fabian's term, between Africa and the Americas. Africa is not to the Americas as the past is to the present. The analytic metaphor I propose instead of "survival," "reinterpretation," "memory," and "creolization" is "dialogue." It highlights the ways in which the mutual gaze between Africans and African-Americans, via travel, migration, and commerce between the two hemispheres, as well as the movement of ideas through letters, pamphlets, newspapers, and books have shaped African and African-American cultures in tandem and over time. I wish to offer a few illustrations of the phenomenon and to demonstrate the utility of "dialogue" as an analytic metaphor in general. I call attention to the importance of cosmopolitan, bourgeois agency in the most "African-looking" religions of the Americas and in the religions of the most rural, poor, and seemingly isolated areas of Africa.

There are obvious examples of 20th-century bourgeois cultural nationalisms in Haiti, the French empire, Cuba, Brazil, and the United States. Reacting against US imperialism and to local bourgeoisies' feelings of inferiority to the whiter bourgeoisies of other nations and regions, the first half of the 20th century saw these nationalisms awash with literary, artistic, musical, and scholarly tributes to the cultural dignity of their dark compatriots. Haitian, Senegalese, Martinican, Cuban, and Brazilian elites gave new legitimacy to their nations' African-inspired religious practices, particularly those that seemed (from their readings and conversations with literate informants) to be the most African. In the United States since the late 1950s, African-inspired religious practices have emerged as a major growth industry in New York and Miami, having become emblems of collective identity for many Latinos and African-Americans. Though leaders (like Luisah Teish and Ola OsojemanmadeFun Ede) have justified the growth of these religions in terms of cultural "survival," that growth has clearly relied on lively industries in manufacture, publishing, and retailing, which in turn shape a live y interaction among diverse classes.

Yet, before these obvious 20th-century Afrophile cultural nationalisms and cosmopolitan dialogues, there were others.

Travel and the Transatlantic Candomblé

Much African religious culture that is thought to have "survived" Africans' enslavement was in fact introduced, sustained and deeply modified by free migrants circulating between Africa and the Americas.
The Brazilian Candomblé religion is often identified as an exemplary survival of African culture in the Americas. Yet the oral history identifies many of its founders as voluntary immigrants from Africa. For example, Otampé Ojarô, founder of Bahia’s Alakétu temple,15 Marcos Pimentel, a 19th-century chief priest of the Mocambo Temple on the island of Itaparica,16 and, most importantly, Iyà Nasò, founder of the ancient Casa Branca temple in Bahia, Brazil, are all identified as free immigrants from Africa.

Iyà Nasò’s mother is said to have secured her own manumission in Bahia and returned to Africa but then voluntarily returned to Bahia to found this first of the three most famous Candomblé temples in Brazil. Her successor, Marcelina, is said to have gone voluntarily from Africa to Bahia and returned to Africa for an extended sojourn before returning finally to Bahia, where she too, assumed the leadership of the Casa Branca temple.17 Verger reports that it was Marcelina who first brought to Bahia the famous Bangobose — babalawo diviner from Oyo or Abeokuta and founder of Brazil’s most illustrious line of male priests.18 Today Bangobose’s Brazilian great-great-grandson, Aizinho de Oxaguia*, commands the wealthy and prestigious Pilao de Prata Candomblé temple in Bahia. Pai Aizinho’s Nigerian cousin Paul Lola Bangobose-Martins is a priest of Sango. These “jet-setters” supply ritually important commodities and priestly services to their far-flung clients. Whereas Paul regularly shuttles between Lagos and Rio, Aizinho’s occasional visits to Lagos punctuate his frequent sojourns in New York, Paris, and Geneva. Sumptuous imported cloth, kolanuts, beads, black soap, fly whisks, and sacred art are all available for purchase in his temple compound.

Similarly, in Cuba, the famous African-born Adechina is said to have been enslaved in Cuba but to have returned to Africa for initiation as a babalawo diviner, later returning to Cuba.19 The oral history also identifies a free-born African woman named Efuneche (also Efusnetan or La Funche) who traveled as a free person to Cuba and there reformed Afro-Cuban relig-

gion in the 19th century.20 These reports are made largely credible by archives documenting the return of thousands of Afro-Brazilians and hundreds of Afro-Cubans to the West African coast.21 Moreover, in the lamentably incomplete Bahian archives of return voyages from Lagos, I have counted dozens of ships and hundreds of free Africans traveling from Lagos to Bahia or through Bahia to Rio or the State of Pernambuco, Brazil, between 1855 and 1898. Journalistic, epistolary, and ethnographic evidence from that period reveals repeated journeys of another score of African-Brazilian travelers up to the 1930s.22 Many of them carried British passports, and most appear to have engaged in commerce, selling ethnically marked Brazilian merchandise (such as salted meat and Afro-Brazilian religious paraphernalia) to returnees in West Africa and “authentically African” merchandise (such as the kolanuts and woven cloth used in the Candomblé) to their black customers in Brazil. Like Aizinho and Paul, many of these people worshiped and subsidized the worship of gods that have ordinarily been described as “local”—such as Ogun, Sango, Yemoja, Osoosi, and Da-.23

As their worship blossomed in early-20th-century Brazil, they displayed not only the “memory” or “survival” of religious icons, myths and practices from the Africa that preceded the slave trade, but also the radical ideological transformations of late-19th-century coastal West Africa. By the mid-19th century, the British-colonized coves of Lagos and Freetown hosted large populations of Western-educated Africans and formerly-enslaved returnees from the Americas. The majority of them (or their parents) originated in the contiguous regions that came to be known as “Yorubaland”—Oyo, Ekiti, Ijebu, Egba, Egbado, Ilesha, etc.24 Their literacy allowed them an unparalleled opportunity to articulate and publish their own vision of their culture and history. Thus, at the British-dominated crossroads of African and African-American interaction, the Yoruba acquired a highly publicized reputation for superiority to other Africans. This reputation was useful in the 1880s and 1890s, as bour-
geois black Lagosians faced new forms of economic disadvantage and racial discrimination. Their reaction was the Lagosian Cultural Renaissance, whose literary champions extensively documented Yoruba "traditional" religion, advocated racial and cultural purity, and popularized the adoption of African names instead of the European ones with which most of these westernized Africans had grown up.

Though the Lagosian Cultural Renaissance articulated a preservationist logic, the values it advocated were hardly "survivals" of an African past. On the contrary, the cultures of the Guinean Coast, including the forebears of Yoruba culture, had long embraced the virtues of inter-ethnic marriage and cultural hybridity. The extraordinary value placed on black racial and religious purity by advocates of the Brazilian Candomblé since the early 20th century, does not then originate in pre-19th-century West Africa. Rather, these purity-based values seem rooted in the racial and cultural nationalism of the Lagosian Cultural Renaissance in the 1890s, during and after which time Afro-Brazilians were traveling back and forth between Lagos and Bahia. Long after that time, letters, newspapers, and Lagosian Renaissance-inspired writings on the alleged superiority and purity of "Yoruba traditional religion" continued to cross the Atlantic. At least one priestly traveler who sojourned in late-19th-century Lagos appears to have used his readings to justify the invention of a new category of priestly officials—the ojú, or ministros, of Xangó— in what is still described as Brazil's most "purely African" Candomblé temple, Ijé Áxe Òpó Afọnjù.

African Religion and International Politics

Though it is often assumed that isolation and poverty are the normal conditions under which African "traditions" and "survivals" endure, the signs of a cosmopolitan and interclass dialogue both accent and structure the most "African"-seeming of practices. The Lagosian Cultural Renaissance was only the first in a series of cultural nationalisms that reshaped black Atlantic cultural politics between the 1890s and the 1940s. The cultural "content" of these politics was often Africanized rather than simply African. Some of its most persistently shared institutions and motifs derive from a British institution—Freemasonry. Freemasonry took its modern form as a male fraternal order and speculative philosophy in early 18th-century Britain. Over the next two centuries, it spread to other parts of Europe and to Europe's overseas colonies, where membership often became a highly prestigious marker of bourgeois status or an equally prestigious context of conspiracy against European rule, as in the British North American colonies. Aversion based on pre-Christian philosophical and religious principles, and parallel to many Afro-Atlantic religions in its fraternal secrecy, Freemasonry has proved inviting to numerous West African, Afro-Brazilians, Afro-Cubans, Haitians, and black North Americans. Thus, thousands of black men around the Atlantic perimeter are united by their shared membership in this British-founded fraternity.

Moreover, Freemasonry has inspired several neo-traditional spin-off organizations, such as Nigeria's Reformed Ogboni Fraternity and Aborigne Ogboni Fraternity of Nigeria, while the Masonic compass, the All-Seeing Eye, and the secret handshakes turn up in the apparently "traditionalist" religions of Nigerian villages, Haitian Vodou temple, the Afro-Cuban Palo Mayombe order, and at least one Afro-Brazilian diviner's office.

West African nation-states in the 21st century have tended to marginalize non-Christian and non-Islamic religions, recognizing only Christian and Islamic religious holidays through civil service and school vacations. But the West African-inspired religions of the African diaspora have grown exponentially in wealth and membership since the 1960s. In Latino and African-American communities in the US, these religions embody a vivid cultural nationalism in Brazil, Cuba, Trinidad, and Haiti. These religions have become both emblems of national identity and conduits of state influence. In Brazil, despots and politicians alike have sought popular support through the temples of...
Afro-Brazilian religion.

During the past 40 years, the Brazilian government, the United Nations (UNESCO) and various US corporate foundations have repeatedly sponsored Brazil's exchange of priests, professors, and museum exhibitions with state institutions in Nigeria and the People's Republic of Benin (formerly Dahomey). These exchanges have highlighted the Yoruba and Ewe-Gen-Aja-Fon religious legacy that Brazil shares with Africa. Brazil's official support appears motivated partly by its desire for political and commercial leadership in what used to be called "the non-aligned world." The Brazilian government effectively established African-diaspora religion as a medium of transatlantic diplomacy and helped pave the way for numerous trans-oceanic priestly exchanges that have included Haitians, US Latinos, Trinidadians, and black North Americans.

Thus, Western-hemisphere governments, foundations, and priests have inspired changes in the official cultural policies of at least one African government. The Beninese government has now established an official and annual holiday for the vodun gods, on January 10. And in February 1993 Benin Republic's newly elected President Nicephor Soglo reversed the atheistic policies of his Marxist predecessors and hosted a "Reunion of Voodoo Cultures," which was intended to call back the priests of Western-hemisphere traditions that are affiliated with those of Benin Republic, and to celebrate their shared legacy in its putative homeland.

The Haitian religion known as "Vodoo," or "Vodou," is complex in its hybridity and highly adapted to the conditions of life in the Western Hemisphere. It embodies a whole pantheon, known as the Petro gods, said to have come about locally in Haiti and, specifically, to manifest the rage of the slave against the white oppressor. Even the Rada pantheon of gods, so closely identified with Ginen, or Africa, and apparently named after the Beninese town of Allada, includes gods that are said to be white, such as Ogou Badagri, whose own name suggests a hybrid of Yoruba and Goun (or Egun) origins.

Since 1797, various authors have followed Moreau de Saint-Méry in describing the Haitian gods and their worship as "Vaudoux" (or its cognates). Haitian psychiatrist and cultural nationalist Jean Price-Mars, in turn, lightly privileged Dahomean origins in his explanation of Haitian folk religion. However, Haitian worshipers do not typically call their religion or their gods "vaudoux." The gods are instead called "lwa," a Haitian word of unclear origin. The one Haitian priestess attending Soglo's "Reunion," a brilliantly black woman, had hitherto avowed no ancestral connection to any part of Africa. However, her trip to Benin strongly enhanced her emphasis on race as a constituent of her identity, and her Beninese roots as a constituent of her religion.

The "Reunion of Voodoo Cultures" that brought this priestess "back to" Benin/Dahomey finds authoritative precedents in the writings of de Saint-Méry, Price-Mars and Herskovits—and also finds a parallel in the International Conference of Orisha Tradition and Culture held in Ile-Ife, Nigeria, in 1981. And it duplicates the performances of populist, Afrophilic politicians, who pose for the cameras with priestesses throughout the Caribbean and Brazil. (It also parallels those efforts by multiple West African governments to encourage African-American tourism by building monuments to the slave trade and by monumentalizing the cultural similarities that travelers, anthropologists, and cultural nationalists in the Western hemisphere have tried so hard to name and reify.)

Yet Haiti's action in specifying and strengthening the ties that bind it to Africa did not begin in the 20th century. The ruler of North Haiti from independence in 1804 until 1820, King Henry Christophe, sponsored the immigration to Haiti of 4,000 Africans, mostly Dahomean, to serve in his army. One hundred-fifty of the Dahomeans served as an elite guard. He chose Dahomeans not because they had any greater historical or demographic relationship to Haiti than any other African group (Dahomeans had never predominated in the Haitian population) but because he had heard that the Dahomeans were excellent soldiers. This post-colonial and state-engineered migration
may or may not have directly influenced the subsequent character of Haitian religion, but it clearly undermines any assumption that after the end of the slave trade, African culture in Haiti was inert and isolated.

Thus, religions that might now appear to prove objective historical connections between African-American and African cultures have not always been recognized as such, defined as significant, or interpreted as the grounds for shared national or transnational identities. Nor do the connections that nowadays appear natural result automatically from the demographics of the slave trade and the “preservation” or gradual fading of the peasants’ "collective memory.” Rather, politicians, literary nationalists, anthropologists, and other thinking people on both sides of the Atlantic have played a significant role in constructing the memory, the reality, and the present-day social consequences of “African cultural survivals” in the Americas.

The cultural history that unites African and African-American religions consists of much more than pre-slave trade African origins and American “memories,” “survivals,” and “retentions.” Much that appears to be primordial is in fact the product of an Afrotropical dialogue, and much that appears to “survive” of African religion in the Americas is in fact shaped by an African or African-American cultural politics that long postdated the slave trade. Those politics have also dramatically superseded contexts of poverty and isolation.

Conclusion

In AFROTROPICAL SOCIETIES, isolation from the workings of international commerce and cultural exchange has hardly ever been a reality, much less a good explanation for local cultural histories. And the paradigm cases of African “survival” that have been said to result from it seem far more indebted to the vividly interregional and interclass dialogues that continually re-shape and strengthen African-inspired religion in the Americas even today.

The study of the black Atlantic has generated a series of productive analytic metaphors, highlighting the cultural, historical, economic, and political dimensions of the diaspora with increasing refinement over time. Yet much that the existing analytic metaphors of this circum-oceanic region have led us to overlook is productively highlighted in a new metaphor—one that represents homelands not as the past, but as the contemporaries of their diasporas, and diverse diasporic locales not as diverge it streams, but as interlocutors in supra-regional conversations. Africa and its American diaspora reflect the effects of an enduring dialogue and a dialectic of mutual transformation over time.

Endnotes


6 Verger, Pierre, Trade Relations Between the Bight of Benin and Bahia from the 17th to 19th Century, trans. Evelyn Crawford (Ibadan, Nigeria: Ibadan University Press, 1976/1968) 1, Le Cible de Vodoun d’Abomey
Aurai-Il Était Apporté à Saint-Louis de Maranhon par la Mère du Roi Gbezo" Mémóire de l'Institut Français d'Afrique Noire 27:157-60

7 Matory, J Lorand, "The 'New World' Surrounds an Ocean On the live Dialogue Between African and African-American Cultures," in Afro-Atlantic Dialogues Anthropology in the Diaspora, ed Kevin Yelvington (Santa Fe, NM School of American Research, forthcoming)


11 Fabian, Johannes, Time and the Other (New York Columbia University Press, 1983)

12 Consider the activities of Francois Duvalier, Jean Price-Mars, and the Haitian Bureau of Ethnology from the 1910s to the 1940s, the Neocratie de Léopold Sédar Senghor, Aimé Césaire, and others in the French Empire of the 1930s and 1940s, the Afro-Cubanismo of Fernando Ortiz, Nicolás Guillen, and others from the 1930s to the 1940s, the Northern Regionalism of Gilberto Freyre, Edison Carneiro, Jorge Amado, and others from the 1930s onward, and black North American cultural nationalism ranging from the Harlem Renaissance of the 1920s to Afrocentricity and the Yoruba Renaissance in the 1980s and 1990s. All of these movements promoted the study and appreciation of a distinctively black and, often, African religiousity (a phenomenon well preceded in the wranglings of Edward Wilmot Blyden and W.E.B. Du Bois as well). Just as importantly, they gave impetus to each other, through travel and the exchange of correspondences and publications.


16 dos Santos, Juana Elbein and dos Santos, Deocóscere, "O Culto dos Ancestrais na Bahia," in Olsona, ed Carlos Eugéno Marcondes de Moura (Sao Paulo Agora, 1981, pp 159-60)


20 David H Brown, personal communication—July 1995


22 Arquivo Público do Estado da Bahia (hereafter APEB), Registro de Entrada de Estrangeiros, 1855-56, Secção Colonial e Provincial, livro #5667 (9 January 1855, 1 March 1855, 20-21 November 1855, 11 January 1860, 28 January 1856), APEB, Presidência da Província, Polícia do Porto, Mapas de saída e entrada de embarcações, 1866-1893, (Secção) Colonial e Provincial, 150 #194-5, File for 1889 (nr), 12 June 1889 (n b, this 1869 item is out-of-place but was indeed found in the 1889 file), APEB, Presidência da Província, Polícia do Porto, Mapas de saída e entrada de embarcações, 1873-1878, 150 (package) #194-5, see 31 January 1876 See also APEB, Presidência da Província, Polícia do Porto, Mapas de entradas e saídas de embarcações, 1878-1885, 150 #194-49, file for 1879, 15 July 1879, APEB, Presidência da Província, Polícia do Porto, Mapas de entradas e saídas de embarcações, 1878-1885, Secção Colonial e Provincial, 150 #194-4, 20 December 1878, APEB, Presidência da Província, Polícia do Porto, Mapas de saída e entrada de embarcações, 1886-1893, Secção Colonial e Provincial, 150 #194-5, file for 1889, 4 June 1889, APEB, Polícia do Porto, Registro de Entrada de Embarcações, 1886-1890 (150 #1975, e.g., 27 May 1885 [v/r], 22 Oct 1889 [v/r]) and 1889-92
Matory, "The English Professors of Brazil," op cit


29 Matory, "The English Professors of Brazil," op cit, Black Atlantic Religion, op cit


31 Matory, "Candomblé’s Newest Nation Brazil," in Regionalism and National Identity in Brazil and Mexico, ed. Thomas Skidmore, Matthew Gutman, and Liza Bakerwell (forthcoming)


33 Brown, Karen McCarthy, "Telling Lives: Race and Gender, Memory and Historical Consciousness," lecture at Harvard Divinity School, 8 February 1999


35 Price-Marris, No Spoke the Uncle, op cit


37 I borrow the term negronizing from Alberto Pames’ preface to the 1978 edition of Fernando Ortiz’s Los Negros Brasiles (Miami: DeSimone University Press, 1968). Pames describes Ortiz by this neologism to indicate that Ortiz came to value Afro-Cuban culture in the same sense that Brazilian white elites in the 19th century, and Mexican white elites in the 19th century, adopted indigenism, or Indians, as emblems of nationalist projects.

38 Métraux, Voodoo in Haiti, op cit, p. 360, Trouillot, Michel-Rolph, Silence of the Past (Boston: Beacon Press, 1999) 65-66


Copyright © 2001. All rights reserved.