

**Who Saves the Day?:
Racial Messaging in Superhero Cartoons**

by
Francesco Pucci

*An honors thesis submitted to the faculty of the Department of Sociology at Duke University for
graduation with a Bachelor of Arts with Distinction in Sociology*

Duke University
Durham, North Carolina
Advisor: Dr. Maria Febbo

Abstract

Literature shows the effects that portrayals of gender and violence in superhero TV and movies can have on viewers, but little is known about the effects of race. This study sought to understand the messaging of superhero cartoons intended for viewership by children related to race. Through a content analysis of *Batman: The Animated Series*, *The New Batman Adventures*, and *Batman Beyond*, racial messages were explored in detail. Results showed most of these messages related to stereotypical physical appearance, language, and costuming of characters. The stereotypes present can affect the way children view themselves and others in regard to race. Therefore, this study shows the importance of portraying characters of color free of stereotypes.

Acknowledgements

I would like to first thank my thesis advisor Dr. Maria Febbo for the constant support throughout this entire process. Through all the ups and downs, Dr. Febbo continually provided her wisdom and guidance, and this project would never have come close to completion without her. I cannot thank her enough for the role she played throughout this entire process.

Additionally, I would like to thank the other faculty members that impacted me throughout my four years at Duke. Dr. Martin Smith, Dr. David Malone, and Dr. Jenifer Hamil-Luker have all played huge roles in my academic career. Thank you Dr. Smith for taking me under your wing and engaging my curiosity. My growth as a person has been greatly impacted by your constant care and willingness to challenge my thinking. Thank you Dr. Malone for believing in me during my first year. Being pushed from the start of my time in college was crucial to putting me on the right path and I do not think I would be where I am now without your initial guidance. Thank you Dr. Hamil-Luker for the support you provided as my Sociology advisor. Your teaching in and out of class served as a great confirmation of my decision to pursue Sociology.

I would like to thank my family and friends for all their support during my time at Duke. They have been there for me through thick and thin and I cannot even begin to imagine my time here without them.

Finally, I would like to thank Bruce Timm and Paul Dini for creating the series I analyzed in this paper. Their work has a special place in my heart and has been an inspiration long before I decided to write a paper on it.

Introduction

Cartoons are an essential part of most people's childhoods. The week was spent in anticipation of Saturday morning and the new adventures to be seen on screen. Animated characters and stories have maintained their place in the popular culture due to their wide appeal and relatability to people of all ages. This age-inclusive sphere of influence is arguably one of the largest of any form of entertainment, but it is not given the same respect in the cultural or academic landscape as its live action counterparts.

One of the most prominent uses of the animated medium has been with the superhero genre. Superheroes have been depicted in animated shows for over fifty years now and continue to be one of the stalwarts of animated content today. Even with the past decade putting more of an emphasis on content aimed at teenagers and adults, the most impactful content is still that aimed at younger audiences. While the amount of new animated superhero content for children is not as large as it has been, the superhero genre has exploded in the mainstream due to the large success of the Marvel Cinematic Universe. Superhero content has reached arguably its most influential state in its history and is constantly being discovered and revisited by people of all ages.

Due to its booming appeal and role in the cultural landscape, the superhero genre has been at the center of calls for social change in entertainment. Lately calls for racial diversity have been front and center in the genre and have been met with new minority characters and stories centered around them. Marvel made waves with *Black Panther*, *Shang-Chi and the Legend of the Ten Rings*, and *The Eternals* which feature characters of color in leading roles. This said, these three movies make up an extremely small portion of the Marvel Cinematic Universe and have all been released in the past four years, with two of them coming in the tail end of the previous year.

In the animated superhero world, there have been three major television hits featuring protagonists of color. Of these three, two series were aimed at strictly at adult audiences. This leaves just one series, *Static Shock*, made with a younger audience in mind. The superhero genre in popular culture has been dominated by stories of white characters.

While exploring the role of diversity in both live-action and animated content is important, cartoons play a much different role than live-action due to a large quantity of animated content being aimed at a younger audience. The role of media during younger, more impressionable ages has been explored in relation to depictions of violence and gender, but race has not been given the same treatment. By examining the way characters of different races are portrayed in superhero cartoons, this paper looks to explore the messages presented and what they are conveying to their audience.

Literature Review

Superheroes operate in a unique space in our society. As fictional characters, they often start as normal people and then through some set of extraordinary circumstances become superhuman. They are more than human, yet normally appear in human form. By relaying themes of justice, heroism, and bravery, superheroes inspire people to live up to the hero's moral standards while at the same time creating unrealistic expectations for how to achieve this. Moreover, animated superheroes operate in an even more unique space as they can push the suspension of disbelief even further than in person adaptations. They also allow for the careful creation of images tailored exactly to the creator's vision, giving the creator power over what is portrayed on screen and the messages it conveys, both intended and not. The ways cartoons have portrayed gender and violence have been influential in their own right, but the ways they have portrayed race have been explored less.

Gender

The superhero genre has long come under fire for its depiction of gender. Both male and female characters have been stereotyped in both their physical depiction and actions. Male characters are often characterized with overly stereotypic masculine qualities like strength, assertiveness, power, and a muscular build to compliment (Collier, Coyne, Nelson, Rasmussen, and Ruh Linder 2014). A strong focus is often given the transformation of the male body into a hypermasculine version of itself. The masculinization of the normal male body into one that is stronger, more resilient, powerful, and attractive (Brown 2016) is a common occurrence. This shows the normal male body as something that can be easily changed to perform heroic tasks and receive the gifts of meeting high beauty standards. As the male body is continually presented in this hypermasculine way, the viewer is told to idolize this version of the body. The celebrated body is moved to an unattainable place of power, heroic, and sexually attractive men that creates a hegemonic normalization of the appearance of men and the relationship between the male and female genders (Brown 2016). This hegemonic hold on the viewer is extremely damaging given the younger age demographic at which superhero cartoons are normally aimed. Male children watching these cartoons will be socialized with damaging stereotypes about their body and how they relate to females. Their play and activities have even been more stereotyped due to the watching of superhero programs (Collier et al. 2014).

Male heroes consistently fit into a single archetype that portrays an emphasized version of traditional masculinity. This overly positive and traditional look at masculinity is problematic in its own right, but the depictions of women are much more alarming. Women are also often given bodies that meet unrealistic beauty standards, but they do not often exemplify the same strength that male superhero bodies do. Instead, female bodies are overly sexualized as the peak of the

female form. Even if female characters can be viewed as empowering, the sexualization of their bodies can overshadow their power and produce stereotypical gender perceptions (Behm-Morawitz and Pennell 2015). Additionally, the presentation of their bodies is made even more problematic by the way they are clothed. Female characters are costumed in overly sexual ways that continue to affect how women view gender. The combination of body types and costuming work to reinforce traditional gender roles for women (Behm-Morawitz and Pennell 2015).

Looking at both the male and female genders, we see an emphasis on the body. The body is presented in ways that elicit certain responses on the drawing of gender boundaries (Dallacqua and Low 2021). This has been done in a variety of ways in cartoons, especially those aimed at children. Male superheroes are often portrayed as muscular while females more often have average body types. The expression of gender in these cartoons furthers this divide. Males are often depicted as aggressive, angry, tough, and threatening while females are often depicted as more emotional, inquisitive, excitable, and concerned with their appearance (Baker and Raney 2007). The gendered depictions of superheroes have been able to socialize their viewers through the maintenance of traditional gender norms.

Violence

Violence is a central facet of the superhero genre. As the genre is generally telling the story of good versus evil, the eventual clash of the two usually ends in a violent fight that is the culmination of past violent conflicts. This use of violence is no different in cartoon adaptations of superhero stories. While the content aimed towards children is less graphic than those aimed at teenagers and adults, violence is still heavily featured and has the ability to influence viewers.

Despite preconceived notions about “good guys” in superhero films, protagonists perform more acts of violence than antagonists (King, Lolo, Moroco, Muller, Olympia, Portolese, and Wakefield 2020). The characters the viewers are supposed to look up to are the most violent. As these are the characters whose behavior is deemed appropriate and even praiseworthy, their actions hold increased weight. Especially when considering children are being socialized with these films, this is extremely concerning. Having characters framed by the pursuit of justice act violently creates a false picture of the merits of violence. The most common motives for violence in children’s programming complicate this further. Anger was the leading motive for violence with revenge, self-defense, and mean-spiritedness coming in behind (Kort-Butler 2012). Furthermore, the mix of anger and firearm use sends a message that firearm use is an acceptable way to handle this emotion (Klein and Shiffman 2011). Justification for violence is a continual theme in superhero media and sets an unrealistic precedent for judging whether, when, and how to use violence.

Exposure to violence in media presents a health risk to children that can result in aggression, bullying, antisocial attitudes, and sleep disturbances (Bauer, Georgeson, King, McNamara, Olympia, Wakefield 2017). Violence is not a positive theme to show, yet it permeates the superhero cartoons that are supposed to be designed for children. This is especially problematic when the characters on screen appear as human. The closer the images on screen are to the real world, the larger the influence on aggressive behaviors in the viewer (Kirsh 2006). Superhero cartoons can be both close to reality and extremely far from it. Characters that do not rely on the supernatural are easier to relate to than those with superpowers. Additionally, cartoons set on Earth provide a relatively common setting that viewers can picture. Many

Batman cartoons exist in this space as the protagonist is consistently shown to be a regular person in a normal city.

Media violence also leads children to use violence as a tool to resolve conflict (Thompson and Yokota 2000). Depictions of cartoon violence increase aggressiveness and place violence as a useful resource to solve problems. Viewers see superheroes on screen using violence to solve problems and being celebrated for it, thus violence is viewed as a valid response to problems. Additionally, children see adults committing acts of violence on screen far more than they see children doing so, thus violence may be seen as something acceptable for adults to partake in (Turkmen 2016). By framing violence as a tool, it becomes normalized and painted as a positive rather than a negative. This is especially dangerous for children as it once again paints violence in a positive light.

Race

There is not as much research done on the effects of race in the superhero genre. The messages of gender and violence from superhero media are well documented, but messages on race are not. There is some scholarship on the importance of characters of color (Cho and Johnson 2020; Claverie 2017), but not on the effects of racial depictions. When it comes to superhero cartoons, the images, voices, and attitudes on screen are all crafted to the exact specifications of a creative team. This places them in a unique position to affect the way race is portrayed. The effects of superhero cartoons are well documented and looking at them with race in mind can help provide a glimpse into how viewers may receive and interpret racial messages on screen and apply them to the real world.

Methods

The sheer number of superhero cartoons would be far too long to view and analyze, so a sample needed to be created to narrow down the vast library of content. From here, the first step was deciding what would be representative of the genre and medium. As most animated superhero movies are either aimed at an older audience or have limited releases, television shows became the clear choice to analyze. The next choice from this was deciding which show or shows to work with. One series immediately came to mind – *Batman: The Animated Series*. The early 90s cartoon is often thought of as the greatest superhero cartoon of all time and spearheaded a new era of superhero cartoons leading into the turn of the millennium. As a representative of the genre, few series exist that can compare to *Batman: The Animated Series* (hereby referred to as *BTAS*) in terms of commercial success and critical acclaim. To get a more comprehensive look though, two additional series centered around Batman were produced by the same creative team as *BTAS*. *The New Batman Adventures* and *Batman Beyond* would keep Batman on the small screen through 2001 and maintain the same characters and voice cast in addition to the creative teams from *BTAS*. These three series combined make for a prime example of the genre.

With the series decided, the next question that arose was how much of each series should be evaluated. Totalling a combined 161 episodes, it became clear that a selection of episodes would have to be selected rather than exploring every episode. To select the episodes that would be included in this study, purposive sampling was used. This sampling technique is useful when studying specific populations, events, or instances might be underrepresented when using random sampling methods. As the exploration into these series is to see what racial messages, if any, are present, it became clear that episodes would need to be selected that have characters of

color present. For this reason, it was determined that random sampling would not suffice, and purposive sampling would be the best method.

Episode selection began with a mix of watching and reading episode summaries. From here episodes were marked for further evaluation. These episodes were all watched again to determine if there was material suitable for the analysis and a final sample of 11 episodes was chosen. Episodes were chosen based on presence of characters of color, racialized situations, and interactions between characters. The episodes are as follows (all references via the Internet Movie Database):

1. *BTAS* Season 1, Episode 12- “Appointment in Crime Alley”
2. *BTAS* Season 1, Episode 19- “Fear of Victory”
3. *BTAS* Season 1, Episode 28- “Night of the Ninja”
4. *BTAS* Season 1, Episode 55- “Day of the Samurai”
5. *BTAS* Season 3, Episode 1- “Bane”
6. *The New Batman Adventures* Season 1, Episode 5- “You Scratch My Back”
7. *The New Batman Adventures* Season 1, Episode 9- “Mean Seasons”
8. *Batman Beyond* Season 2, Episode 5- “Hidden Agenda”
9. *Batman Beyond* Season 2, Episode 6- “Bloodsport”
10. *Batman Beyond* Season 2, Episode 17- “Armory”
11. *Batman Beyond* Season 3, Episode 10- “The Curse of the Kobra: Part 1”

Each of these episodes was then watched and coded according to a set of criteria explained below.

1. Physicality

This looks at the physical characteristics of character designs.

2. Language/Dialogue

This looks at how characters speech is presented. Emphasis will be put on how speech is accented for characters of different races and also what words characters use (broken English, slang, etc.).

3. Costuming

How are characters designed outside of their physical characteristics? This will encompass dress, hair, tattoos, and any other additions to the design of a character.

4. Perceived Intelligence

By examining how a character is presented and how they interact with other characters, the way a character's intelligence is represented comes to light.

5. Relative Power

The structure of different characters related to each other shows how a character's power and agency is depicted.

6. Tropes/Stereotypes

Any other scenarios where characters or situations meet with racial stereotypes or character tropes that do not fall within the categories above.

Results

Table 1. *Frequency of observed racial messages*

Type of observed message	Number of occurrences	Percent of whole
Physicality	47	44.34
Language/Dialogue	22	20.75
Costuming	22	20.75
Perceived Intelligences	2	1.89
Relative Power	1	0.94
Tropes/Stereotypes	12	11.32
Total	106	≈100.00

Table 1 shows there was a clear frontrunner in terms of observed messages throughout all of the episodes. Physicality was by far the most common type of racial message. The overwhelming number of occurrences more than doubles any other observed message and makes up for just under 45 percent of all messages. Characters were constantly being designed to exhibit stereotypical phenotypes based on the color of their skin and facial features.

Throughout the analysis, Black characters were the most present racial minority. By far the unifying factor amongst these characters was the depiction of larger, fuller lips when compared to white characters. Many times, throughout, a Black character would be standing next to a white character and there was always a noticeable difference in the size of the lips. Surprisingly, there were not as many instances of physicality outside of the large lips for Black characters. One character had an extremely wide nose, but for the most part Black characters were designed relatively free of other phenotypical stereotypes or were drawn in ways consistent

with their gendered counterparts. The second most prominent minority were Asians. Most of these Asian characters were not specifically given an ethnicity, but the episodes refer to Japan or takes place there. All of the Asian characters were all given extremely slanted eyes. Most times, when an Asian character was not shown in a close up or medium close up shot, their eyes were reduced to only slanted lines. This characteristic came to be a defining feature of all Asian characters.

Language/Dialogue and Costuming were the other two most prominent type of observed messages. Each one accounting for just under 21 percent of all observed messages.

Language/Dialogue also was mostly seen in Black and Asian characters. Black male characters had extra deep voices while Black females had high raspy voices. Asian characters had thick accents or spoke in broken English. Additionally, Black characters often spoke in slang or “street” sounding voices. Costuming presented itself in a myriad of different ways. For Black characters this most commonly played out with characters wearing backwards hats, baggy clothes, and sunglasses (often inside). In one extreme instance a Black male was dressed in tribal dress complete with a blow dart and javelin like spear. For Asian characters this came in the form of ninja outfits, Fu Manchu style moustaches, and kung fu training uniforms. Additionally, a group of South American males are dressed in light colored suits with their shirts unbuttoned to expose their chests.

The other three messages only comprised about 14 percent of all observed messages with Tropes/Stereotypes taking the most prominent role accounting for over 11 percent. Occurrences of Relative Power or Perceived Intelligence were not very present, but they did each show up at least once. Tropes/Stereotypes mostly took form in common stereotypes applied to racial groups.

Older black women being maternal, Asian characters obsessing over honor to the point of death, and oversexualized South Americans were all present as Tropes/Stereotypes observed.

Discussion

Before coding even started, the process of selecting episodes provided valuable insight into the role race played in these cartoons. Finding episodes with characters of color proved to be difficult. This lack of racial representation is a message in it of itself. White characters dominate the screen and characters of color are normally placed in the background, if they are present at all. Most characters of color can be found as villains who appear in one or two episodes or as props to provide legitimacy to a “foreign” theme. The one major exception can be found in Batman Beyond. This series has a single major character of color. She serves as a sidekick to Batman but is held away from the action and is normally only allowed to help from afar speaking to Batman through an earpiece. When looking more wholistically at these series, it is clear that whiteness is a defining feature.

This can be seen in the heroes of the series. Batman is white. Robin is white. Commissioner Gordon is white. Batgirl is white. The people we get to see in action saving the day are all white. Even in Batman Beyond when Batman has a Black sidekick, it is rare that this character gets to save anyone but themselves. The people in danger are always saved by one of the white characters. When answering the question of who is allowed to save the day, a white person is always involved. This presents another question about the series: what role does the white savior complex play? While often times even the people being saved are white, there is no question who they need to save them. People seek out Batman at every turn and refuse to accept anything less than him. Even with a mask, Batman is known as white. There is some room to wonder in the Batman Beyond as the Batman’s skin is not visible, but even here there are

multiple people who know the true identity of Batman. Additionally, Batman always takes it upon himself to be the city's savior. He sees himself as the only person qualified and worthy enough to save others. In turn, this shows a clear message of who is supposed to save the day. It is not a role that can be assumed by any person, it is one strictly created for a white body. White people take the lead in saving the day, and everyone else falls behind (there is an additional avenue to explore the intersectionality of race and gender as it relates to heroism in media, but that is a subject for another time).

Looking at the analysis, Physicality took a convincing lead in terms of observed messages. There was an overwhelming number of phenotypical stereotypes. As previously stated, this was mostly found in Black and Asian characters. Within these groups, two features stood out amongst the rest: large lips and slanted eyes. There was not a single Black or Asian character that was exempt from these two traits. Differences in physical characteristics are extremely noticeable too. Many times, these characters are seen next to white characters which makes the contrast even more jarring. This consistently reinforces the idea of difference between white and non-white characters. These messages take a toll on the children watching them. Children are curious about physical differences at an early age and the ways they engage with these differences can inform ways they think about themselves and others (Harris, Kemple, and Lee 2015). By basing physical representations of characters of color on stereotypical phenotypes, the series provides harmful depictions with the capacity to affect how children view racial minorities.

In addition to the physical representation of the characters, the way these characters speak also affects characters of color. Black males spoke in deep voices and often used slang or talked in a stereotypical "street" voice. The main black female who spoke had a high, raspy voice that

often had a sassy tone. Another spoke with a very maternal inflection likening the mammy stereotype. The way characters spoke evoked a certain perception of Blackness that aligns with and elicits racial stereotypes. Additionally, Asian characters speaking in thick accents or broken English helped promote harmful stereotypes about Asians. Speech is presented as a facet of the characters' identities in these cases. They are a continuation of the stereotypes already presented by their appearance. Stereotypical speech can lead the listener to activate racial stereotypes in their expectations of physical appearance (Kurinec and Weaver 2021). This brings us back to the physical appearance of characters and continually reinforces the idea that there are stereotypical differences that define people.

Costuming became a major way to present characters of color throughout the series. Asian characters were put in ninja costumes, ancient looking robes, and kung fu training uniforms. Black characters wore sunglasses inside, baggy clothes, backwards hats, and even tribal looking tattoos and attire. The Hispanic characters wore light colored suits with no ties and their shirts unbuttoned to expose their chests or were dressed in a luchador mask. There was no attempt to present any of these characters in a neutral light. Their race was almost always a determining factor in how they were presented. Most of the exceptions to this were with background characters and characters who were presented with above average intelligence (Black scientists, Black star student, and Black CEO). The messages here are very clear. Certain races present themselves in ways that differentiate them from white people. Besides the costumes worn by Batman and Robin and some villains, white characters are presented in very unassuming clothes. Two of the main white villains in the selected episodes wear suits. Nothing is special or different about these suits, they look just like any other character. The main Asian villain wears a ninja outfit and sports a large tattoo of a devil made to look Asian. One of the Black villains'

identities is crafted around the idea that he is a skilled big game hunter, so he is dressed in tribal tattoos and a loincloth.

The Tropes/Stereotypes observed were mostly associated with general media tropes related to different races. Asian characters obsessed with honor and committing honorable suicide rather than admitting defeat. Hispanic characters being oversexualized. Black characters presented as extra cool, maternal, or as tribal warriors. While not every trope or stereotype may seem necessarily harmful, they present a certain harmful image of the races the characters are associated with. Even the stereotypes that seem to highlight positive things can create misunderstanding between people of different races that result in actions driven by prejudice (Czopp 2008). The presentation of these stereotypes can affect the ways viewers approach the validity of them (Ramasubramanian and Scharrer 2015). Additionally, positive stereotypes are more quickly associated with whiteness (Dovidio, Evans, and Tyler 1986), so it is all the more important that characters of color are not painted in negative lights through harmful stereotypes.

Lacking in observed messages were Perceived Intelligence and Relative Power. Both of these came up a combined three times which was initially surprising, but the lack of characters of color explains the lack. The two moments of Perceived Intelligence came with Asian women speaking English. The broken English they spoke presented a lack of ability, especially when compared to the Asian men, providing another interesting intersection between race and gender. As previously mentioned, it was not easy finding characters of color as the show is mostly comprised of white characters. Many of the structures that would present power structures were comprised of characters of the same race (mostly all white). The lone occurrence of this had to do with a mixed-race group of criminals with a white leader and a Black member. This moment sees the white character use fear tactics to exert dominance over the Black character. While at

the time we do not know that the leader is white, the reveal shortly thereafter adds an interesting twist to the way the moment is read. The continual use of white characters in positions of power makes this a maintenance of the status quo of the show. This maintenance helps normalize existing racial structures in the real world as well.

Overall, the messages seen throughout the series present whiteness as normal while othering other races. Black, Asian, and Hispanic characters are presented as harmful stereotypes while white characters get to play the hero. Even characters of color who are helping the hero are presented as less than our heroes and never get to truly save the day. These stereotypes present people of color as nothing more than tropes and relay negative messages to those watching.

Appendix

Coding Sheet (multiple observations of the same message grouped together)

BTAS Season 1, Episode 12- “Appointment in Crime Alley”

<u>Timestamp</u>	<u>Type of observed message</u>	<u>Description</u>
4:38, 5:46, 19:08	Physicality	Black girl has large lips
4:57, 5:46, 19:08	Physicality	Black woman has large lips that also appear with red makeup, image is strikingly similar to the common blackface makeup
6:15, 7:44	Physicality, Language/Dialogue, Tropes/Stereotypes	Larger, older Black woman with large lips and red lipstick speaks in a stereotypical “black voice” with a very maternal inflection while crossing her arms and telling a white woman to be careful
15:17, 16:38	Physicality	Black woman has large lips
16:56	Physicality	Black man has large lips
19:10	Tropes/Stereotypes	Darker skinned people overrepresented in a group of “underclass”
19:55	Physicality	Black man has large lips

BTAS Season 1, Episode 19- “Fear of Victory”

<u>Timestamp</u>	<u>Type of observed message</u>	<u>Description</u>
1:56, 21:32	Physicality	Black man has large lips
4:28	Physicality	Black man has much larger lips than the white characters in crowd

BTAS Season 1, Episode 28- “Night of the Ninja”

<u>Timestamp</u>	<u>Type of observed message</u>	<u>Description</u>
1:37	Physicality	Black man has large lips
1:50	Physicality	Character dressed as ninja has slantier eyes
4:18	Physicality	Asian character’s eyes are only shown as black pupils
4:32, 6:42	Physicality, Costuming, Tropes/Stereotypes, Language/Dialogue	Old Asian sensei has lines drawn for eyes, has a long beard, and is dressed in robes and a skirt-like bottom; additionally speaks English with heavy accent
4:37	Language/Dialogue	Asian character talks in stereotypical accent and calls Bruce Wayne “Wayne-son”
5:06	Costuming	Asian character has large tattoo of devil with big teeth and slanty eyes
12:56	Tropes/Stereotypes	Asian sensei speaks of honor and punishes a student for breaking that honor

BTAS Season 1, Episode 55- “Day of the Samurai”

<u>Timestamp</u>	<u>Type of observed message</u>	<u>Description</u>
1:32, 3:30, 8:34, 15:47	Physicality	Asian woman has slanty eyes
1:47, 8:34, 16:34	Physicality	Ninja has slanty eyes
1:52, 8:34	Language/Dialogue	Ninja and Asian woman speak Japanese to each other with thick accents
2:37	Physicality, Costuming	Painting of Asian man features thin lines for eyes, a chonmage haircut, and a long, thin mustaches that comes to a point in the middle
2:58, 4:40, 7:54, 21:00	Physicality	Sensei character from “Night of the Ninja” returns with same design (slanty eyes, beard, dress)

3:38, 11:11, 13:53, 14:15, 14:51	Physicality	Ninja character from “Night of the Ninja” returns with more pronounced slanty eyes
4:26	Costuming	The devil tattoo from “Night of the Ninja” is drawn on a piece of paper (slanty eyes, big teeth)
4:40, 7:54, 14:15, 21:01	Language/Dialogue	Sensei character talks with thick accent and refers to Bruce Wayne as “Wayneson”
6:02	Physicality, Costuming	A group of Asian men in martial arts attire all have slanted lines for eyes, ponytails, and facial hair (long beards, fu Manchu moustaches)
8:28	Costuming	Picture of Japanese woman in geisha makeup with slanted lines for eyes
11:46, 14:10	Language/Dialogue	Ninja character speaks Japanese in thick accent
11:57, 14:13	Physicality	Ninja characters smiles slyly, and eyes get even slantier
12:50	Physicality	Two Asian men have slanty eyes (one with only small lines for eyes) and one has fu manchu-esque moustache
12:57	Language/Dialogue	Asian man speaks in high pitched stereotypical accent
14:46	Physicality	Asian man selling produce has only small lines for eyes
15:08, 16:34	Language/Dialogue	Ninja character speaks English with heavy accent
15:50	Language/Dialogue, Perceived Intelligence	Asian woman speaks broken English in thick accent
18:03	Costuming	The devil tattoo reappears on the body of the ninja character
20:12	Tropes/Stereotypes	Ninja character chooses to die with honor rather than let Batman save him (character bows before kicking away lifeline)

BTAS Season 3, Episode 1- “Bane”

<u>Timestamp</u>	<u>Type of observed message</u>	<u>Description</u>
2:23, 3:04, 6:22, 10:27, 11:49, 13:29, 14:30	Costuming, Language/Dialogue	Hispanic character wears luchador mask and speaks in heavy accent
6:22, 10:27, 11:49, 14:30	Costuming	Luchador mask is complimented with entire wrestling outfit
10:27, 11:49, 13:29	Language/Dialogue	Hispanic character speaks extremely slow and smooth
10:39	Tropes/Stereotypes	Hispanic character is given extra sexualization
20:09	Physicality	Hispanic character has larger lips

The New Batman Adventures Season 1, Episode 5- “You Scratch My Back”

<u>Timestamp</u>	<u>Type of observed message</u>	<u>Description</u>
2:53	Physicality	South American character has dark circles around his eyes
5:59, 16:49	Physicality, Costuming	South American character is wearing a white suit with high waisted pants and a black shirt unbuttoned to reveal chest hair
7:53, 16:50	Language/Dialogue	South American character speaks in thick accent
8:02, 14:07, 16:40	Costuming	Additional South American characters sport similar looks with suits, high waisted pants, and shirts unbuttoned to expose chest hair

The New Batman Adventures Season 1, Episode 9- “Mean Seasons”

<u>Timestamp</u>	<u>Type of observed message</u>	<u>Description</u>
2:02, 2:19, 4:56, 11:44, 18:04	Physicality	Black henchman has larger lips
2:16	Physicality	Black cop has larger lips
3:20	Physicality, Language/Dialogue	Black man has larger lips and extremely deep voice

4:35, 9:47	Physicality, Language/Dialogue	Black man has larger lips and a deep voice
4:48	Physicality, Costuming	Black boy has larger lips and is dressed in a backwards cap with baggy clothes
10:46, 12:01	Physicality	Black man has larger lips
11:20	Physicality, Costuming	Black teen has large lips and is dressed in a backwards hat, baggy clothes, and sunglasses
11:22	Tropes/Stereotypes	TV show featuring Black teen is described as “inner city street drama” (TV show is meant to be a joke)

Batman Beyond Season 2, Episode 5- “Hidden Agenda”

<u>Timestamp</u>	<u>Type of observed message</u>	<u>Description</u>
1:19, 8:00, 9:53, 15:21, 17:31	Costuming	Black henchman has red painted lips giving striking resemblance to blackface makeup, additionally character is wearing multiple gold chains
4:17	Relative Power	Black henchman is physically threatened when challenging white leader
4:44, 9:11, 11:46, 14:18, 16:24, 19:07	Physicality	Black teen has larger lips
4:50, 9:11, 11:58, 14:30, 16:24, 19:07	Language/Dialogue	Black teen girl has high and raspy voice
8:31	Tropes/Stereotypes	Black henchman says he “hasn’t been to school since sixth grade”
18:40	Physicality, Costuming	Black teen has large lips and is wearing a cap and sunglasses inside

Batman Beyond Season 2, Episode 6- “Bloodsport”

<u>Timestamp</u>	<u>Type of observed message</u>	<u>Description</u>
1:20, 7:01, 11:53, 12:34, 13:07, 16:22	Physicality	Black man has large lips and wide nose
1:50, 4:50, 7:33, 13:19, 15:07	Language/Dialogue	Black man has deep voice

3:42	Physicality, Costuming	Black man has large lips and is wearing sunglasses inside
5:00, 15:00	Tropes/Stereotypes	Black man has transformed hotel room into more primitive looking space complete with drawing reminiscent of cave art
5:39, 6:00, 7:01, 9:24, 10:10, 11:53, 13:07	Costuming, Tropes/Stereotypes	Black man is dressed in tribal African looking attire complete with body paint and large gages, also carries blow dart and javelin like weapon
9:34, 13:35	Physicality	Black teen girl has large lips
9:47, 13:35	Language/Dialogue	Black teen girl has high and raspy voice
11:19	Language/Dialogue, Physicality	Black cop has deep voice, large lips, and extra broad shoulders
12:34	Costuming	Black man is dressed in poacher's outfit with slain lion behind him
15:02	Costuming	Black man is wearing fur of slain panther
18:36	Tropes/Stereotypes	Black man says he'll drink the blood of his enemy

Batman Beyond Season 2, Episode 17- "Armory"

<u>Timestamp</u>	<u>Type of observed message</u>	<u>Description</u>
1:26, 2:47, 9:12, 9:53, 15:30, 19:54	Physicality, Costuming	Two black men have large lips and one is wearing sunglasses inside at night while wearing a durag looking hat
1:34, 9:47	Physicality	Black teen girl has large lips
1:42, 2:50, 7:57, 9:12, 15:45, 17:20	Physicality	Black parents both have large lips
1:43	Language/Dialogue, Tropes/Stereotypes	Black woman talks in stereotypical "black voice"

Batman Beyond Season 3, Episode 10- "The Curse of the Kobra: Part 1"

<u>Timestamp</u>	<u>Type of observed message</u>	<u>Description</u>
------------------	---------------------------------	--------------------

1:22, 19:34	Physicality, Costuming, Language/Dialogue	Black man has large lips, gold earrings, and speaks in a stereotypical “street voice”
4:45, 7:20, 15:59	Physicality	Asian woman has slanty eyes
4:49	Language/Dialogue, Perceived Intelligence	Asian woman speaks in heavy accent and is presented as if she struggles with English
5:39, 11:37	Physicality, Costuming	Black man has large lips and wears dreads
6:46, 9:58, 12:54, 17:33, 19:30	Physicality	Black teen girl has large lips
10:44	Physicality	Black man has large lips
13:43, 17:33	Language/Dialogue	Black teen girl has high, raspy voice with an overly sassy tone
14:12	Physicality	Black man has large lips
16:39	Physicality	Black man has large lips

References

- Baker, Kaysee, and Arthur A. Raney. 2007. "Equally Super?: Gender-Role Stereotyping of Superheroes in Children's Animated Programs." *Mass Communication & Society* 10(1):25-41.
- Bauer, Matthew, Andrew Georgeson, Tonya S. King, Caitlin McNamara, Robert P. Olympia, and Bryan H. Wakefield. 2017. "Positive and Negative Themes Found in Superhero Films." *Clinical Pediatrics* 56(14):1293-1300.
- Behm-Morawitz, Elizabeth, and Hillary Pennell. 2015. "The Empowering (Super) Heroine? The Effects of Sexualized Female Characters in Superhero Films on Women." *Sex Roles* 72:211-220.
- Brown, Jeffrey A. 2016. "The Superhero Film Parody and Hegemonic Masculinity." *Quarterly Review of Film and Video* 33(2):131-150.
- Cho, Hyesun, Peter Johnson. 2020. "Racism and Sexism in Superhero Movies: Critical Race Media Literacy in the Korean High School Classroom." *International Journal of Multicultural Education* 22(2):66-86.
- Claverie, Ezra. 2017. "Ambiguous Mr. Fox: Black Actors and Interest Convergence in the Superhero Film." *The Journal of American Culture* 40(2):155-168.
- Collier, Kevin M., Sarah M. Coyne, David A. Nelson, Eric E. Rasmussen, and Jennifer Ruh Linder. 2014. *Sex Roles* 70:416-430.
- Czopp, Alexander M. 2008. "When is a Compliment Not a Compliment? Evaluating Expressions of Positive Stereotypes." *Journal of Experimental Social Psychology* 44(2):413-420.

- Dallacqua, Ashley K., and David E. Low. 2021. "Cupcakes and Beefcakes: Students' Readings of Gender in Superhero Texts." *Gender and Education* 33(1):68-85.
- Dovidio, John F., Nancy Evans, and Richard B. Tyler. 1986. "Racial Stereotypes: The Contents of Their Cognitive Representations." *Journal of Experimental Social Psychology* 22(1):22-37.
- King, Tonya S., Justin Loloi, Annie Moroco, John N. Muller Jr., Robert Olympia, Austin Portolese, and Bryan H. Wakefield. 2020. "Violence Depicted in Superhero-Based Films Stratified by Protagonist/Antagonist and Gender." *Cureus* 12(2).
- Kirsh, Steven J. 2006. "Cartoon Violence and Aggression in Youth." *Aggression and Violent Behavior* 11(6):547-557.
- Klein, Hugh, and Kenneth S. Shiffman. 2011. "Bang Bang You're...Not Dead and You're...NOT Even Hurt?! Messages Provided by Animated Cartoons About Gun Violence." *International Journal of Child and Adolescent Health* 4(3):265-276.
- Kort-Butler, Lisa A. 2012. "Rotten, Vile, and Depraved! Depictions of Criminality in Superhero Cartoons." *Deviant Behavior* 33(7):566-581.
- Kurinec, Courtney A., and Charles A. Weaver. 2021. "'Sounding Black': Speech Stereotypicality Activates Racial Stereotypes and Expectations About Appearance." *Frontiers in Psychology* 12(785283).
- Ramasubramanian, Srividya, and Erica Scharrer. 2015. "Intervening in the Media's Influence on Stereotypes of Race and Ethnicity: The Role of Media Literacy Education." *Journal of Social Issues* 71(1):171-185.

Thompson, Kimberly M., and Fumie Yokoya. 2000. "Violence in G-Rated Animated Films."

The Journal of the American Medical Association 283(20):2716-2720.

Turkmen, Mustafa. 2016. "Violence in Animate Feature Films: Implications for Children."

Educational Process: International Journal 5(1):22-37.