

# Using urban food system governance to drive healthy food procurement for cities in low- and middle-income countries

## Case studies on Addis Ababa Students Feeding Agency and Pune Sassoon General Hospital Meal Programme



Julian Xie, MD/MPP Candidate

Duke University Sanford School of Public Policy

Master's Project for **Global Alliance for Improved Nutrition**

Faculty advisor: **Kelly Brownell**, Director, Duke World Food Policy Center

May 2020

**Cover Photos:** Addis Ababa school feeding, Dagim Terefe/Reuters and Sassoon General Hospital meal programme, Ganapathi Trust

This 2020 student paper was prepared in partial completion of the graduation requirements for the Master of Public Policy Program at the Duke University Sanford School of Public Policy. The research, analysis, and policy recommendations contained in this paper are the work of the student who authored the document, and do not represent the official or unofficial views of the Sanford School of Public Policy or Duke University. Without specific permission of its author, this paper may not be used or cited for any purpose other than to inform the client organization about the subject matter. The author relied in many instances on data provided by the client and related organisations and makes no independent representations as to the accuracy of the data. If you want to get in touch, please email me at [julian.xie@duke.edu](mailto:julian.xie@duke.edu)

## **Acknowledgements**

As a musician, I find it funny that behind each performance – which lasts just a matter of minutes – is years of learning, numerous teachers, and hours of practice. Similarly, a tree's roots are just as large, if not larger, than the tree itself. In the same vein, many people contributed to this report. First and foremost, I thank the individuals who agreed to interviews. Their time, stories, and expertise in serving their communities are what made this project possible.

This project was conducted in partnership with Global Alliance for Improved Nutrition. It has been an engaging, exciting, and educational time working with GAIN, and I am grateful to have had the opportunity to contribute to their mission. I am especially thankful to the following team members for their guidance, feedback, connections to stakeholders, and logistical support along the way:

- Kathrin Demmler, Knowledge Leadership
- Laura Platenkamp, Urban Governance for Nutrition
- Mirjam Kneepkens, Workforce Nutrition

Additionally, none of this would be possible had I not met Greg Garrett at the 2019 World Health Assembly, who put me in touch with Lynette Neufeld and Sharelle Pollack who set up this opportunity for me. In turn, this connection wouldn't be possible without my World Food Programme Geneva Office team (particularly Brian Lander and Benjamin Van Syme Ameringen) and the Duke Geneva Program led by Annalisa Kristoffersen, Sarah Burrichter, and Gavin Yamey. I am grateful to my advisor Kelly Brownell who provided a strong helping hand in writing, editing, and guiding my thinking. Kelly deserves credit as the person who got me interested in food policy.

I would also like to express infinite gratitude to my partner Elizabeth who supported me throughout the project and guided the thought process around synthesizing hours of interview information and literature into a logical framework about healthy food procurement. I would also like to thank my family for their support and assistance.

**Sanford Master's Project class small group advisor:** Charles Clotfelter

**Prospectus committee reader:** Tom Allin

**Peer reviewers and technical assistance:** Elizabeth Onstwedder, Hannah Bartlebaugh, Mona Dai, Niisoja Torto, Willis Wong

## Table of Contents

<b>Executive Summary</b> .....	<b>1</b>
Recommendations for GAIN and partner cities .....	2
<b>Background and objective to the report: a focus on urban food systems</b> .....	<b>6</b>
<b>Healthy food procurement can improve nutrition for vulnerable people</b> .....	<b>8</b>
<b>Key themes on healthy food procurement implementation</b> .....	<b>11</b>
Dedicated food procurement governance .....	12
Nutrition standards and public food procurement .....	13
The case for universal coverage .....	14
Private sector institution participation in healthy food procurement .....	14
Sustainable funding for food procurement .....	15
Decentralisation or centralisation for procurement models .....	15
Need for food infrastructure development .....	16
Defining and measuring success .....	17
<b>Case Study: Addis Ababa City Administration Students Feeding Agency</b> .....	<b>19</b>
Initial state of nutrition in Addis Ababa .....	20
Stakeholder motivations: responding to urban poverty and child malnutrition .....	22
Dedicated food procurement governance with multistakeholder coordination .....	23
Funding and assets .....	25
Implementation Plan: the Addis Ababa school feeding procurement model .....	25
Evaluation and improvement .....	27
Enabling factors for Addis Ababa Students Feeding Agency .....	28
Challenges and areas for growth: Addis Ababa school feeding programmes .....	29
<b>Case Study: Sassoon General Hospital Meal Programme in Pune, India</b> .....	<b>31</b>
Initial state: growing double burden of malnutrition in India .....	32
Stakeholder motivations: improving hospital food .....	32
Funding: state government and philanthropic contributions .....	34
Implementation Plan: Sassoon General Hospital food procurement .....	34
Enabling Factors for Sassoon General Hospital’s Meal Programme .....	35
Challenges and areas for growth for Sassoon General Hospital .....	35
<b>Discussion: Areas for more research, coordination, and shared learning</b> .....	<b>37</b>
<b>Appendix: Detailed Background and Explanation of Methods</b> .....	<b>39</b>
Literature Analysis Protocol .....	39
Formulating an urban food procurement implementation framework .....	40
Guides and policy documents on urban food systems and public food procurement .....	45
Interview Plan .....	47
<b>Works Cited</b> .....	<b>50</b>

## Executive Summary

This project provides recommendations for how the Global Alliance for Improved Nutrition (GAIN) can assist urban governments and stakeholders to implement institutional healthy food procurement in low- and middle-income countries (LMIC). **Public food procurement** refers to when governments purchase and provide food to defined populations. **Institutional food procurement** refers to food purchasing and provision by organizations like schools, hospitals, care homes, youth clubs, prisons, and workplaces. **Urban governments often manage public food procurement at these institutions**, serving food to students, patients, employees, and their families. Institutional food provision can benefit an individual's experience at that institution while improving their health and nutritional status. For instance, a student's nutrition status affects school performance. A hospital patient's food access may affect their recovery.

**Healthy food procurement** refers to designing food procurement to prioritize the purchase and provision of nutritious food. Since food procurement programmes serve a high volume of people, healthy food procurement represents an opportunity for institutions to promote nutrition, whilst also reshaping the broader food system to be healthier and more sustainable. **Many countries face the double burden of malnutrition**, with high rates of undernourishment and obesity, especially in urban areas. Urban policymakers are increasingly recognizing institutional healthy food procurement as an opportunity to address malnutrition. However, there is a need to share more experiences and best practices on healthy food procurement among urban stakeholders in LMIC.

This report presents a synthesis of literature analysis and key stakeholder interviews on urban public food procurement. Beyond the recommendations in this summary, this report discusses:

1. **Why urban public food procurement is an important tool** to improve food and nutrition security
2. **A proposed implementation framework / menu of actions for healthy food procurement**, with key themes on design and implementation of healthy food procurement policies taken from literature analysis and interviews on successful examples such as New York City and Brazil
3. **Two urban public food procurement case studies to explore enabling factors and barriers for healthy food procurement**: A city government-led school feeding programme in Addis Ababa, Ethiopia and a hospital feeding programme at Sassoon General Hospital in Pune, India. This section discusses the two case studies through the lens of the proposed implementation framework. These two case studies were selected because they demonstrate success stories in LMIC and illustrate key policy considerations around healthy food procurement.

### Key Messages

1. GAIN can support urban healthy food procurement with a nutrition-sensitive approach.
2. Best practices in healthy food procurement include dedicated food procurement governance, use of dietary guidelines in menu-planning, universal coverage and inclusivity, and private sector participation.
3. Invest in institutional food safety; water, sanitation, and hygiene (WASH); and cold chain infrastructure for fresh foods.
4. Create political buy-in for healthy food procurement by highlighting win-win opportunities from perspectives of "customers" and non-nutrition sectors.

## Recommendations for GAIN and partner cities

### 1. GAIN can support urban healthy food procurement with a nutrition-sensitive approach.

The following proposed implementation framework draws upon the two urban case studies, literature analysis, and interviews. **Potential opportunities for GAIN to contribute, based on its comparative advantages, are shown in green.**



## 2. GAIN and partner stakeholders might consider the following components as part of core public food procurement policies and practices

**A dedicated food procurement governing body:** Effective urban food system governance relies on multistakeholder coordination. This report contains several examples of dedicated food policy and food procurement agencies. Addis Ababa City Administration Students Feeding Agency is one such example. The centralized school feeding governance intends to improve coordination across the city's schools and the involved City Administration departments. Similarly, the Brazil national government and New York City government have dedicated food policy offices.

**Support nutrition guidelines and standardized menus, and promote workforce development of nutrition professionals who can support healthy menu development:** Although cost is a constraint, menu development should follow national or municipal dietary guidelines, and evidence-based nutrition guidelines around nutrient and caloric needs. Agricultural availability, crop seasonality, and local culture and taste can also support healthy menu development. New York's Food Standards shows how a city government can bring public institutions to follow healthy food guidelines. The New York City government passed food standards that exceed US national dietary guidelines. As more institutions and producers followed these standards, more food suppliers followed along to maintain access to the institutional market – thereby growing healthy food production. In Pune's Sassoon General Hospital meal programme, hospital nutritionists contribute to setting the menu in a way that considers patient diet-related medical conditions.

**Aim for universal coverage and inclusivity.** Programmes should explicitly and affirmatively include marginalized groups including girls and women, people with disabilities, and people living with chronic conditions such as diabetes or HIV: The urban case studies in this report (Addis Ababa Students Feeding Agency, Pune Sassoon General Hospital Meal Programme, Brazil national school feeding, and New York City public institutions) guarantee food to institution clients, regardless of income. Targeting programmes to serve those most in need is helpful for maximizing resource use and practical for conducting pilot programmes. However, the targeting process can take extra resources and worsen stigmatization against individuals who are visibly receiving social assistance.

**Create opportunities for private sector institution participation:** Municipal governments should encourage private sector institutions to follow public food procurement guidelines. In New York, the City Health Department led a voluntary programme for private hospitals to follow its food standards. This led to the majority of the city's hospitals complying with the NYC Food Standards.

Develop sustainable funding and human resources plan, with consideration for including smallholder farmers, small and medium enterprises, and women: Procurement programmes create numerous market access opportunities for farmers, and job opportunities in food distribution and preparation. Addis Ababa Students Feeding Agency hires unemployed mothers of students to procure and prepare food. Hiring and purchasing locally can often be attractive for economic and agricultural development governmental departments. Therefore, inclusive practices can actually help build coalitions who advocate for sustainable funding.

**Support monitoring, evaluation, and learning for healthy food procurement:** The case studies within this report provide examples of participatory monitoring and evaluation. In the Addis Ababa and Brazil's school feeding programmes, committees of students, parents, and teachers provide feedback and governance. Schoolteachers help make sure feeding is carried out according to standardized specifications. Relationships with local universities, domestic and international consulting firms, and international organizations can support effective impact evaluation.

GAIN and its partners may consider supporting information systems for monitoring and evaluation, both for managing food supply chains and for tracking beneficiary outcomes. For instance, the Et Alim Trading evaluation of the Addis Ababa Enat Weg Charitable Association Smiling Children school feeding programme recommended creating a digital database to track student outcomes.

**Consider contract structure and compliance tools:** Different tools can ensure compliance and accountability to criteria about food quality and sourcing. These should be determined according to local context and legal framework, as well as ultimately supporting the goal of good nutrition. In more formalized procurement systems, these can take the form of set-asides (i.e. quotas to purchase from certain suppliers), qualification criteria, subcontracting conditions, price preferences for certain types of suppliers or products, or points systems where procuring entities assign more points to producers or businesses who comply with certain criteria. Forward contracts and advanced payments can insulate farmers from market uncertainty and provide them upfront resources to invest, but also creates risk for both farmers and the procuring institution.

**Consider whether purchasing is centralised:** Neither centralised nor decentralised systems are wholly superior. In some cases, a central government authority procurement responsibility or private sector foodservice contractor may increase efficiency through bulk purchasing. Centralised systems are often well-suited for staples that need to be processed and potentially fortified.

Meanwhile, decentralised models can increase community participation, local control, and accountability. Decentralised systems may also be appropriate for fresh products, especially to shorten supply chains. Decentralisation can also increase flexibility for small producers to participate where larger-scale procurement processes may exclude them.

### **3. Invest in institutional food safety; water, sanitation, and hygiene (WASH); and cold chain**

Healthy food procurement relies on well-trained stakeholders and safe facilities to distribute, prepare, and serve food to end consumers. In both Addis Ababa and Pune, stakeholders identified kitchen and cafeteria capacity and cleanliness as barriers. To increase the quality of public food procurement programmes, GAIN could assist with improving urban infrastructure for food safety and quality, including cold chain for fresh foods.

In Addis Ababa, the City Administration Health Bureau gives food handling training to mothers to safely cook food for schoolchildren. The Addis Ababa Education Bureau and Construction Bureau partnered to renovate school kitchens and canteens so that there would be adequate spaces to cook and eat food. In Pune's Sassoon General Hospital, the Ganapathi Trust contributed resources to building a modernized kitchen and purchasing serving carts to bring food to patients. These investments are necessary to enable serving food to a large number of people safely.

#### 4. Create political buy-in for healthy food procurement by highlighting win-win opportunities from perspectives of “customers” and non-nutrition sectors.

Even though achieving good nutrition is GAIN’s key mandate, GAIN and its partners should consider where they can link healthy food programming to progress in other sectors. Some of these outcomes may be beyond the conventional scope of food and nutrition security. Doing so can add complementary resources and personnel to a pro-nutrition coalition. For example, win-win opportunities can be achieved in some of the following sectors:

**Education:** In Addis Ababa, the City Administration responded primarily to concerns about students’ learning experience – a common theme across interviews was the image of students fainting in class. The customer-centric view also observed how lack of supplies, poverty stigma, and gender stigma prevented students from going to or staying at school. For this reason, Addis Ababa structured the Students Feeding Agency mandate so that food was not its only responsibility. The Agency also provided school supplies, uniforms, and menstrual pads, which will make the student experience more welcoming, especially for girls.

Communicating about return on investment and multiplier effects is also important. The World Food Programme (WFP) estimates that for every dollar invested in school feeding, there is a return of three to ten dollars.<sup>1</sup> The WFP School Feeding Centre of Excellence frames school feeding as an investment in human capital development, with benefits from improved health, household economic savings, and increased productivity thanks to education and improved nutrition.

**Healthcare:** In Pune, Sassoon General Hospital demonstrates how good nutrition improves patient and family experience. The provision of free meals to all patients helps with patient recovery. The potential to speed up patient recovery can alleviate hospital bed shortages, which is attractive for hospital administrators and healthcare providers. Additionally, meal provision reduces financial and logistical burden for families who would otherwise bring food to the hospital for patients.

**Agriculture:** In Brazil and New York, as well as in several high-income countries, a focus on smallholder farmer inclusion can bring agricultural and economic development stakeholders to support healthy food procurement. In particular, Brazil’s PNAE and PAA programmes set aside quotas for purchasing from local smallholder farms. The focus on smallholder farmers enabled Brazil to jointly promote domestic smallholder farm production and nutritious food provision.

**Environment:** Public food procurement can support progress on sustainable diets by promoting foods that are both nutritious and better for the environment to produce. For instance, legumes are a good plant-based protein source, and their production can create fewer emissions, groundwater pollution, and land use than other protein sources.<sup>2</sup>

<sup>1</sup> “Cost-Benefit Analysis School Feeding Investment Case” (WFP, 2016), <https://docs.wfp.org/api/documents/86593db964f34dada0840ec47d2bad3d/download/>.

<sup>2</sup> “UNSCN Discussion Paper Urban-Rural Linkages for Nutrition. Territorial Approaches for Sustainable Development” (UNSCN, 2020), 44, <https://www.unscn.org/en/unscn-publications?idnews=2024>.



## Background and objective to the report: a focus on urban food systems

This report supports the Global Alliance for Improved Nutrition (GAIN) Knowledge Leadership, Urban Governance for Nutrition, and Workforce Nutrition teams. The report was developed in partnership with GAIN's **Urban Governance for Nutrition** programme, which promotes multisector food system engagement in cities. This report also received input from GAIN's **Workforce Nutrition** programme, which focuses on improving nutrition among workers and farmers.

Comparatively little literature and global guidance exists on urban healthy food procurement, especially in LMIC.<sup>3</sup> To transform urban food systems, there is a need for more learning among urban stakeholders, best practice sharing, and multisectoral collaboration. This report integrates perspectives on urban public food procurement based on literature analysis and stakeholder interviews. To view these themes in action, this report presents two case studies on the intersection of urban food system governance and food procurement: the Addis Ababa Students Feeding Agency and Pune Sassoon General Hospital Meal Programme. GAIN identified the case studies through Food for Cities, an urban food systems community of practice.

### This report focuses on urban food system governance for two main reasons

1. Extreme inequality in urban environments drives the double burden of malnutrition.
2. Cities are well-positioned to make positive impact through food procurement.

Cities are often considered a laboratory for innovation when national policies are not yet well-developed.<sup>4</sup> Urban public food procurement can benefit not only the city, but also its surrounding peri-urban and rural areas. Compared to national governments, urban governments may have opportunities to share power, spaces for input, and governance processes with the communities they serve. Participatory governance can help ensure public food procurement is responsive to the needs of vulnerable populations, as well as those of private sector and civil society.<sup>5</sup>

### Urban areas experience high levels of double burden of malnutrition

55% of the world population lives in urban areas, and this will increase to 68% by 2050. 90% of this new urban population growth will likely occur in Africa and Asia. Therefore, countries need to foster sustainable urban development to prevent even more strain on systems for food, housing, transportation, energy, education, employment, and healthcare.<sup>6</sup> Climate change and conflict also drive migration and internal displacement, especially from rural into urban areas.

Urban areas have high spatial and socioeconomic inequality. This manifests as food deserts, where food is physically and financially inaccessible. Urban areas also have food swamps, where the majority of available food is calorie-dense but not nutritious. Food insecurity is associated with lack of transportation, unpredictable food prices, concentration of power in the global food trade,

<sup>3</sup> See appendix for an author-created table of urban food procurement documents

<sup>4</sup> "Food & Cities: The Role of Cities for Achieving the Sustainable Development Goals" (Barilla Center for Food & Nutrition Foundation and Milan Urban Food Policy Pact, 2018), [http://www.milanurbanfoodpolicycompact.org/wp-content/uploads/2019/04/food\\_cities.pdf](http://www.milanurbanfoodpolicycompact.org/wp-content/uploads/2019/04/food_cities.pdf).

<sup>5</sup> "FAO Framework for the Urban Food Agenda" (Food and Agriculture Organization, 2019), <http://www.fao.org/3/ca3151en/CA3151EN.pdf>.

<sup>6</sup> "68% of the World Population Projected to Live in Urban Areas by 2050, Says UN," United Nations Department of Economic and Social Affairs, May 16, 2018, <https://www.un.org/development/desa/en/news/population/2018-revision-of-world-urbanization-prospects.html>.

prevalence of junk food and fast food, and insufficient social safety nets.<sup>7</sup>

As a result, cities are vulnerable to the double burden of malnutrition – the simultaneous occurrence of undernourishment, and overweight and obesity – due in part to common forces that drive all forms of food insecurity and malnutrition. Cities can be dependent on imported food, with longer and more complex food chains, especially for healthy foods.

Undernourishment can occur due to lack of healthy food access, availability, and affordability. At the same time, highly processed calorie-dense foods are becoming more widely available in cities.<sup>8</sup> Urban lifestyles may also have fewer opportunities for physical activity. Together, these factors contribute to weight gain and noncommunicable disease risk.

### Public food procurement can improve urban food and nutrition security

Public food procurement can drive complementary improvements in food and nutrition security, food system investments, and poverty reduction. Food procurement can also positively influence a food system's environmental sustainability, human rights, animal welfare, local economic development, and many other valuable dimensions. This project focuses primarily on supporting GAIN's goal to achieve better nutrition.<sup>9</sup>

Public food procurement programmes have varied histories and mandates, often with food security for vulnerable people as a priority. Governments sometimes use public food procurement as a tool to support and stabilize agricultural markets. For instance, Bangladesh and India's governments purchase rice and wheat at guaranteed prices, and then provide these staples to poor households.<sup>10</sup> The UN World Food Programme (WFP) Purchase for Progress programme supplements and replaces imported food aid with locally procured staple food crops. Hence, its primary goals are to address food security efficiently while simultaneously supporting regional smallholder farmer livelihoods.<sup>11</sup>

It is now more important than ever to bring procurement programmes in line with nutrition security priorities – with more focus on sufficient quantity, nutrient content, dietary diversity, and food safety.<sup>12</sup> For instance, Indonesia has begun reforming its *Rastra* safety net rice procurement and voucher-based distribution system to provide foods consistent with national dietary guidelines. *Rastra* has started providing eggs alongside rice, but it remains to be seen how the programme will integrate vegetables and other proteins.<sup>13</sup>

<sup>7</sup> Jess Halliday, Laura Platenkamp, and Yota Nicolarea, "A Menu of Actions to Shape Urban Food Environments for Improved Nutrition" (GAIN, MUFPP, and RUAF, 2019), <https://www.gainhealth.org/sites/default/files/publications/documents/gain-mufpp-ruaf-a-menu-of-actions-to-shape-urban-food-environments-for-improved-nutrition-october-2019.pdf>.

<sup>8</sup> Global Panel on Agriculture and Food Systems for Nutrition, "Food Systems and Diets: Facing the Challenges of the 21st Century" (IFPRI, 2016), <http://www.ifpri.org/publication/food-systems-and-diets-facing-challenges-21st-century>.

<sup>9</sup> See appendix for further elaboration on defining healthy food procurement and variations on this term.

<sup>10</sup> Shrayana Bhattacharya Vanita Leah Falcao Raghav Puri, "The Public Distribution System in India: Policy Evolution and Program Delivery Trends," in *The 1.5 Billion People Question: Food, Vouchers, or Cash Transfers?*, ed. Shrayana Bhattacharya, Vanita Leah Falcao, and Raghav Puri, 0 vols. (The World Bank, 2017), 43–105, [https://doi.org/10.1596/978-1-4648-1087-9\\_ch2](https://doi.org/10.1596/978-1-4648-1087-9_ch2).

<sup>11</sup> "Purchase for Progress," World Food Programme, 2019, <https://www.wfp.org/purchase-for-progress>.

<sup>12</sup> "Coming to Terms with Terminology" (Committee on World Food Security, 2012), <http://www.fao.org/3/MD776E/MD776E.pdf>.

<sup>13</sup> Sonja Vermeulen et al., "Healthy Diets from Sustainable Production: Indonesia" (Chatham House Hoffman Centre for Sustainable Resource Economy, EAT, 2019), <https://www.chathamhouse.org/sites/default/files/images/2019-01-24-Vermeulenetal.pdf#page=36>.

## Healthy food procurement can improve nutrition for vulnerable people

This section presents literature analysis that describes why public food procurement is an important tool to address urban food system challenges. Public procurement accounts for an estimated 10 to 15 percent of global gross domestic product (GDP). This proportion is highest in low-income countries at 14.4 percent of GDP. South Asia and Sub-Saharan Africa have the highest proportions by region, at 19.3 and 14.9 percent respectively.<sup>14,15</sup> This represents a significant amount of purchasing power on behalf of a high number of people. Therefore, governments and institutions that engage in food procurement have a strategic tool to shape food demand.

Nutrition-sensitive public food procurement programmes around the world have promoted dietary diversity. Purchase from Africans for Africa (PAA Africa) is an example of how a pilot institutional procurement programme in LMIC can jointly promote demand for healthy foods and crop production diversification. PAA Africa was created by the Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations (FAO), the World Food Programme (WFP), the Brazilian government, and the UK Department for International Development. The programme connected local farmers, farmer organisations, and school feeding programmes in 5 African countries.

Through this partnership, small farmers began producing more diversified crops to meet school demands for cereals, pulses, vegetables, tubers, fruit, and meat. In Malawi and Mozambique, PAA Africa introduced legumes, vegetables, and fruits into school menus. In Ethiopia, PAA Africa added high protein foods including fava beans and haricot beans. However, fresh fruits and vegetables were not a consistent part of PAA Africa implementation across its participating countries.<sup>16, 17</sup>

As an example of nutrition outcomes outside of the institution, the Brazilian National School Meal programme (PNAE) has positively influenced diets outside of school. A study in Belo Horizonte found that students who consumed two or three school meals were more likely to eat more fresh foods and fewer processed foods. In fact, students who ate three school meals a day consumed 26% fewer processed foods.<sup>18</sup>

When institutions provide affordable and nutritious food, they can help improve nutrition for marginalized and vulnerable populations who may otherwise not be able to access or afford good food. In turn, providing good nutrition for such clients can then improve the benefit they receive from that institution's services. This can be particularly true at schools, hospitals, nursing homes, childcare sites and orphanages, universities, and government agencies. Hence, both institutions and individuals they serve may benefit from a healthy institutional food environment.

<sup>14</sup> Simeon Djankov, "How Large Is Public Procurement in Developing Countries?," Peterson Institute for International Economics, November 7, 2016, <https://www.piie.com/blogs/realtime-economic-issues-watch/how-large-public-procurement-developing-countries>.

<sup>15</sup> "Is Public Procurement a Rich Country's Policy?," World Bank Blogs, 2016, <https://blogs.worldbank.org/governance/public-procurement-rich-country-s-policy>.

<sup>16</sup> "Schools as a System to Improve Nutrition A New Statement for School-Based Food and Nutrition Interventions" (United Nations System Standing Committee on Nutrition, 2017), <https://www.unscn.org/uploads/web/news/document/School-Paper-EN-WEB.pdf>.

<sup>17</sup> Mario Gyoeri, Ana Carla Miranda, and Fábio Veras Soares, "Linking Vulnerable Smallholder Farmers to School Feeding Programmes: The Experience of PAA Africa" (International Policy Centre for Inclusive Growth, UNDP, 2016), 12, [https://www.ipc-undp.org/pub/eng/PIF36\\_Food\\_and\\_nutrition\\_security.pdf](https://www.ipc-undp.org/pub/eng/PIF36_Food_and_nutrition_security.pdf).

<sup>18</sup> Bruna M. A. Bento et al., "A Higher Number of School Meals Is Associated with a Less-Processed Diet," *Jornal De Pediatria* 94, no. 4 (August 2018): 404–9, <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jped.2017.07.016>.

## School feeding is pro-poor and achieves cross-sector wins, including for gender equity

School feeding has a wide base of evidence and experience to support its role in addressing inequality. School feeding programmes help increase the enrolment of girls, who are disproportionately deprived of schooling.<sup>19</sup> This helps alleviate problems of school absenteeism since providing food at school serves an incentive to attend.

Gender-sensitive school feeding policies can break cycles of gendered intergenerational malnutrition.<sup>20</sup> Early marriage and pregnancy often cause adolescent girls to drop out of school. Indeed, the Ethiopian government reported that early marriage was the top reason for girls to leave school, accounting for 29% of urban girls who left school.<sup>21</sup>

An evaluation of two WFP School Feeding programmes in Ethiopia found increased enrolment including female enrolment, reduction in grade repetition, and increased attendance.<sup>22</sup> Another evaluation of a WFP-Ministry of Education school feeding programme in Boricha district found that participating children had better dietary diversity, nutrition status measured through body mass index and height for age, and class attendance measured by days of absence.<sup>23</sup> These findings show how school feeding can support female empowerment and educational attainment.

## Healthy food in healthcare settings helps address malnutrition and chronic illness

Healthy food procurement can help address hospital malnutrition, an often-undetected problem. For instance, in Canada, an estimated 45% of patients admitted to hospitals are malnourished.<sup>24</sup> Hospital care can cause malnutrition or exacerbate existing malnutrition, which in turn worsens health outcomes. According to multiple studies in different countries, malnutrition can increase hospital stay length, likelihood of readmission, hospitalization cost, and likelihood of death following hospitalization.<sup>25</sup> Patients may not want to consume hospital food if they perceive low quality, bad taste, or lack of cultural appropriateness. Therefore, hospitals need to not only perform nutrition screening, but also provide palatable, affordable, and acceptable patient food.

Providing healthy food in healthcare settings can also support noncommunicable disease prevention and management. The World Health Organization recommends providing low-sodium options in public hospitals, schools, workplaces, and nursing homes as a “Best Buy” (highest cost effectiveness) policy for preventing noncommunicable diseases.<sup>26</sup>

<sup>19</sup> Donald Bundy et al., “Re-Imagining School Feeding: A High-Return Investment in Human Capital and Local Economies” (World Bank, 2018), <http://dcp-3.org/schoolfeeding>.

<sup>20</sup> “Legislating for Adequate Food and Nutrition in Schools” (FAO, 2019), <http://www.fao.org/3/CA3520EN/ca3520en.pdf>.

<sup>21</sup> “National School Health and Nutrition Strategy” (Ministry of Education, Ethiopia, 2012), [https://www.iapb.org/wp-content/uploads/Ethiopia\\_National-School-Health-Nutrition-Strategy.pdf](https://www.iapb.org/wp-content/uploads/Ethiopia_National-School-Health-Nutrition-Strategy.pdf).

<sup>22</sup> “Final Evaluation of WFP’S USDA McGovern-Dole International Food for Education and Child Nutrition Programme’s Support in Afar and Somali Regions in Ethiopia 2013–2017” (WFP, 2018), <http://mokoro.co.uk/wp-content/uploads/WFP-0000101695.pdf>.

<sup>23</sup> Mastewal Zenebe et al., “School Feeding Program Has Resulted in Improved Dietary Diversity, Nutritional Status and Class Attendance of School Children,” *Italian Journal of Pediatrics* 44, no. 1 (2018): 16, <https://doi.org/10.1186/s13052-018-0449-1>.

<sup>24</sup> Celia Laur et al., “Becoming Food Aware in Hospital: A Narrative Review to Advance the Culture of Nutrition Care in Hospitals,” *Healthcare* 3, no. 2 (June 2015): 393–407, <https://doi.org/10.3390/healthcare3020393>.

<sup>25</sup> Su Lin Lim et al., “Malnutrition and Its Impact on Cost of Hospitalization, Length of Stay, Readmission and 3-Year Mortality,” *Clinical Nutrition* 31, no. 3 (June 1, 2012): 345–50, <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.clnu.2011.11.001>; Kelly A. Tappenden et al., “Critical Role of Nutrition in Improving Quality of Care: An Interdisciplinary Call to Action to Address Adult Hospital Malnutrition,” *Journal of the Academy of Nutrition and Dietetics*, 2013, <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jand.2013.05.015>.

<sup>26</sup> “‘Best Buys’ and Other Recommended Interventions for the Prevention and Control of Noncommunicable Diseases” (World Health Organization, 2017), [https://www.who.int/ncds/management/WHO\\_Appendix\\_BestBuys.pdf](https://www.who.int/ncds/management/WHO_Appendix_BestBuys.pdf).

### Workforce nutrition programmes can improve health and productivity

Workplace food environment change has the potential to improve the well-being, productivity, and dignity for a large number of people.<sup>27</sup> Since 58% of the world's population spends one third of their time at work in their adult life, the workplace and its surrounding area significantly influences an individual's diet. Workplace nutrition plays out through spaces such as workplace cafeterias, snack sources, vending machines, and street vendors.

Nutrition education, workplace health checks, and breastfeeding support can all contribute to a healthier work environment and improved health outcomes. Beyond nutrition, workforce nutrition can improve job satisfaction, employee productivity, and wages. Workforce nutrition can also reduce sick days taken by employees, medical costs, and rates of accidents and mistakes.<sup>28</sup>

Healthy food procurement, which can include restrictions on unhealthy foods, can help improve workforce nutrition. At a San Francisco hospital, a workplace ban on sugar-sweetened beverages (SSB) was associated with reduction in SSB intake and waist circumference among 214 employees who participated in the study.<sup>29</sup> In other words, interventions that increase healthy food access and decrease unhealthy product access can have a large effect on employee behaviours and health.

### Public food procurement and local procurement may improve crisis resilience

Healthy food procurement policies are sometimes paired with policies that promote buying from local farmers and farm organizations, with the intention of supporting local economies and improving environmental sustainability through reducing food transport distance. School meal provision in the Andhra Pradesh state in India for example helped improve height-for-age and weight-for-age for children from families affected by a severe drought.<sup>30</sup>

Local and regional purchasing can also improve crisis resilience by shortening the supply chain for emergency food assistance. As an example of shorter supply chains, Home Grown School Feeding (HGSF) in rural Ethiopia provides school meals in areas affected by drought, creating a safety net against climate shocks. HGSF programmes around the world connect local smallholder farms to schools as buyers of food to provide free meals to students. HGSF creates structured demand for food; in other words, guaranteed access to market for farmers. This in turn improves the income stability and food security of the farmers themselves.

<sup>27</sup> Global Alliance for Improved Nutrition (GAIN), "Better Nutrition for a Healthier Workforce" (Global Alliance for Improved Nutrition (GAIN), July 2019), <https://doi.org/10.36072/cp.1>.

<sup>28</sup> Christina Nyhus Dhillon and Bärbel Weiligmann, "The Evidence for Workforce Nutrition Programmes" (Global Alliance for Improved Nutrition (GAIN), 2019), <https://www.gainhealth.org/sites/default/files/publications/documents/evidence-for-workforce-nutrition-programmes-overview-2019.pdf>.

<sup>29</sup> Elissa S. Epel et al., "Association of a Workplace Sales Ban on Sugar-Sweetened Beverages With Employee Consumption of Sugar-Sweetened Beverages and Health," *JAMA Internal Medicine*, October 28, 2019, 1–8, <https://doi.org/10.1001/jamainternmed.2019.4434>.

<sup>30</sup> Abhijeet Singh, Albert Park, and Stefan Dercon, "School Meals as a Safety Net: An Evaluation of the Midday Meal Scheme in India," *Economic Development and Cultural Change* 62, no. 2 (2014): 275–306, [https://econpapers.repec.org/article/ucpecdecc/doi\\_3a10.1086\\_2f674097.htm](https://econpapers.repec.org/article/ucpecdecc/doi_3a10.1086_2f674097.htm).

## Key themes on healthy food procurement implementation

The following implementation framework synthesizes the two urban case studies, literature analysis, and stakeholder interviews. See the Appendix for details on public food procurement guides and other documents that fed into this framework.



This section uses New York City and Brazil as reference points for key healthy food procurement themes. The New York City government serves 260 million meals a year with an annual budget of 500 million USD (out of a city budget of 95 billion USD<sup>31</sup>), making the City the number two largest US meal provider after the US military. New York City provides food through institutions like schools, childcare centres, after-school programmes, public hospitals, senior centres, and jails.

Brazil's National School Feeding Programme (Programa Nacional de Alimentação, PNAE) was established in 1955 to guarantee meals to all public school students. Today, PNAE serves 42.6 million students at least one free meal cooked from scratch regardless of family income.<sup>32,33</sup> Since the 1980s, PNAE has delegated programme administration to the local level with state and municipal School Feeding Committees. Through that system, the federal government distributes funds to Brazil's municipalities to pay for food. Therefore, some aspects of Brazil's public food procurement can be viewed through an urban governance lens.

The Brazilian Food Purchase Programme (PAA), founded in 2003, extends the country's experience with School Feeding to other forms of public food procurement. PAA purchases food from small farmers and distributes it through hospitals, schools, daycare centres, shelter homes, food banks, prisons, military bases, and university restaurants.

## Dedicated food procurement governance

A dedicated city government authority on food policy can facilitate better coordination and action on food and nutrition. Municipal governments provide convening power and data analysis capability, while the advocacy community puts pressure on government and private sector to adopt healthier food procurement practices. The New York City Mayor's Office of Food Policy convenes a Food Policy Task Force (with representatives from ten City agencies, the City Council, the non-profit GrowNYC, Department of Citywide Administrative Services, Department of Health and Mental Hygiene, and the Mayor's Office of Contract Services). Similarly, in Washington DC, a dedicated city food policy office convenes governmental and nongovernmental food system actors to design its institutional food procurement programmes in schools, senior centres, homeless shelters, and correctional facilities. That body then responds to community advocacy.

In Brazil, the federal government created the Council of Food and Nutrition Security (CONSEA), a centralised food and nutrition governance body within the President's office. Before it was dissolved in 2019, CONSEA convened government and civil society stakeholders to act in an advisory role for the President. Using this convening power, CONSEA helped facilitate different federal ministries to communicate with each other and collaborate on food and nutrition security.

One key lesson from CONSEA was that including the Ministry of the Economy helped further a food and nutrition security agenda. Their involvement helped communicate to other stakeholders that healthy public food procurement could promote local economic development. This led to the

<sup>31</sup> Melanie Hartzog, "The City of New York Preliminary Budget Fiscal Year 2021" (New York City Office of Management and Budget, 2020), <https://www1.nyc.gov/assets/omb/downloads/pdf/sum1-20.pdf>.

<sup>32</sup> "Brazil's Policies to Guarantee Food Rights" (The Food Foundation, Institute of Development Studies, 2017), [https://foodfoundation.org.uk/wp-content/uploads/2017/07/5-Briefing-Brazil\\_vF.pdf](https://foodfoundation.org.uk/wp-content/uploads/2017/07/5-Briefing-Brazil_vF.pdf).

<sup>33</sup> Kaori Kitaoka, "The National School Meal Program in Brazil: A Literature Review," *The Japanese Journal of Nutrition and Dietetics* 76, no. Supplement (July 1, 2018): S115–25, <https://doi.org/10.5264/eiyogakuzashi.76.S115>.

calculation that investing \$1 in school feeding leads to an economic multiplier of \$7 because of tax revenue associated with increased incomes and consumption. In other words, inclusion of finance and economic development actors helped reframe the problem.

### **Community inclusion in urban governance for nutrition**

Urban food policy multistakeholder coordinating bodies can provide a space for community members and beneficiaries to participate in decisionmaking. From 1998 onwards, Brazil's National School Feeding Programme (Programa Nacional de Alimentação, PNAE) created local school nutrition councils to provide oversight and menu creation input.<sup>34</sup> These councils include parents, students, teachers, community members, and members of government. These participatory governance mechanisms help ensure that school meals and the programme itself are delivered in a way that is most appropriate for the population being served.

### **Nutrition standards and public food procurement**

Dietary guidelines can increase the focus on nutrition in food procurement and provision.

#### **New York City's Food Standards and Healthy Food Procurement**

The New York City government created city-wide healthy Food Standards for all public institutional food procurement in 2008 to prevent obesity and diet-related disease. The policy follows in the wake of New York's calorie labelling rules in 2006 and trans-fat ban from restaurants in 2007.<sup>35</sup>

These standards are consistent with and in some cases exceed the US Dietary Guidelines for Americans. The standards apply to cafeteria meals, vending machines, meetings and events, and meals for hospitalized patients. The standards require fruit and vegetable options, and limit maximum calories, sugar, salt, and fat. In addition, there are recommended proportions for nutrients: protein (as 10-35% of total calories), carbohydrates (as 45-65% of calories), an upper limit on cholesterol, and minimum levels of potassium, calcium, and iron. Patient meals are required to be tailored for populations with special nutrition needs such as children or seniors. Hospitals are encouraged to educate patients, staff, and visitors through labelling or other mechanisms.

There are also regulations around advertising and product positioning. For example, advertisements of high calorie beverages on vending machines is prohibited. Water is required to be placed in the highest physical selling position (with high calorie beverages most far from eye level). In addition, the standards recommend stocking vending machines with only water and low calorie beverages, and setting lower prices for these healthier beverages.

#### **Brazil's Nutrition Standards in School Feeding and Institutional Purchasing Programmes**

Brazil's National Food and Nutritional Security Policy created school meal nutrition standards. These standards include maximum recommended limits for salt, sugar, and saturated fat. The standards set mandatory minimum fruit and vegetable portions, and restricted processed foods with high levels of salt and saturated fat. The standards exclude all sugary drinks except for 100%

<sup>34</sup> Kitaoka.

<sup>35</sup> "Bringing the Good Food Purchasing Program to NYC," CUNY Urban Food Policy Institute, 2019, <https://www.cunyurbanfoodpolicy.org/news/2019/5/23/bringing-the-good-food-purchasing-program-to-nyc>.



fruit juice.<sup>36</sup> A 2009 mandate required nutrition education to be integrated into school curriculums.

### Evolution to sustainable diets and values-based purchasing

In 2019, New York City began participation in the Good Food Purchasing Program (GFPP), which provides a model for improving public procurement standards for nutrition, environmental sustainability, labour, local economic development, and animal rights. According to a stakeholder interview, New York's institutions are moving away from a purely lowest-cost bidding towards a values-based model. When a City department releases a Request for Proposals from food vendors, the bidding model includes not only cost efficiency and a requirement to comply with the New York Food Standards, but also a point system that rewards vendors for adhering to GFPP values. GFPP is embedded into New York City's plan to become carbon neutral by 2050.

In 2009, the Brazilian government revised PNAE to include a 30% quota for food purchased from local small farmers. This policy pivoted PNAE to not only be a social safety net, but also a way to increase public sector demand for locally produced and nutritious food. To implement the change, PNAE simplified the procurement model to suit small suppliers instead of using the traditional public sector bidding process.<sup>37</sup>

### The case for universal coverage

Both New York City and Brazil's have universal public school meal coverage. Targeting programmes to serve the most in need is helpful for maximizing resource use. It is also a practical way to conduct pilot programmes. However, there are arguments to design programmes to be universal, or to have a plan to transition them to universal provision. In particular, programme targeting can exacerbate poverty and gender-related stigma. Stigma is particularly common in school settings, and targeted programmes can exacerbate mistreatment against individuals who are visibly receiving safety net assistance. Students may bully or exclude poor when their socioeconomic status is revealed by coming to school without food, bringing low quality food, or eating free school-provided meals when children from wealthier families bring higher quality food.

Despite the goal to reduce programme costs, focused targeting can itself take extra resources. The experience in Washington DC has been that the logistical and financial cost of targeting does not lead to meaningful savings.<sup>38</sup>

Universal coverage helps articulate food as a human right and a popular cultural expectation. And Brazil integrated its school feeding programme to align with its national 2003 Zero Hunger strategy and 2010 National Policy for Food and Nutritional Security.

### Private sector institution participation in healthy food procurement

New York City has demonstrated its ability to bring private sector institutions to follow its healthy food procurement policies. The NYC Health Department offers free technical assistance to help hospitals implement these standards, including assistance from a registered dietician for menu

<sup>36</sup> "Brazil's Policies to Guarantee Food Rights."

<sup>37</sup> Siobhan Kelly and Luana Swensson, *Leveraging Institutional Food Procurement for Linking Small Farmers to Markets: Findings from WFP's Purchase for Progress Initiative and Brazil's Food Procurement Programmes*, FAO Agricultural Development Economics Technical Study 1 (Rome: Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations, 2017).

<sup>38</sup> According to interview.

review and staff education. A total of public and private 40 NYC hospitals (out of over 60 hospitals in the city<sup>39</sup>) committed to implement the Food Standards voluntarily between 2012 and 2014. Another 20 community organizations have committed to implementing the standards.<sup>40</sup>

As an example of public food procurement's market-shaping potential, New York City placed specifications about chicken for school meals that shifted the market for chickens. The City entered the Urban School Food Alliance with several other cities and called on chicken vendors to provide chicken raised humanely without antibiotics or animal byproducts in feed.<sup>41</sup> Since making these commitments in 2014, US chicken companies in the last several years have increased their production of chicken that complies with these demands. In turn, this has enabled other US city school districts to follow suit in demanding chicken of higher standards.

## Sustainable funding for food procurement

As with all policies, healthy food procurement requires sustainable funding. There are promising examples of school feeding programmes transition from international aid to domestic resource mobilization. The WFP School Feeding Center for Excellence has helped several countries take over their school feeding programmes.

For example, by 2018, Kenya transitioned its WFP-led school feeding programme to be fully government funded and government-run. In 2019, Kenya allocated 2.4 billion Ksh (22.5 million USD) to school feeding and 2 billion Ksh (19.7 million USD) in 2019.<sup>42</sup> WFP is working with the Kenyan government to envision how to "ring-fence" the School Meal Program budget. WFP has been working with the Kenyan government to embed the School Meal Program in the National Safety Net Program to make its funding more predictable and protected from reallocation.

Brazil's Institutional Purchase Programme (PAA) gets funding through the Ministry of Agrarian Development and the Ministry of Social Development and Fight Against Hunger. What is unique about this is that the two ministries have different mandates – one for smallholder agricultural development, and one for promoting food security through social safety nets.<sup>43</sup> Meanwhile, Brazil's school feeding programme (PNAE) is guaranteed funding because of school feeding having been established as a universal right in the country's constitution. PNAE's roughly 3.8 billion Real (1.7 billion USD) budget is funded through income taxes and a federal lottery.<sup>44</sup>

## Decentralisation or centralisation for procurement models

Centralisation refers to whether a single entity conducts food purchasing on behalf of one or more institutions. There are pros and cons of decentralised and centralised procurement systems, so there should be careful consideration about which system makes more sense for the institutions

<sup>39</sup> "62 Acute Care Hospitals in New York City," 2014, <https://www.beckershospitalreview.com/lists/62-acute-care-hospitals-in-new-york-city.html>.

<sup>40</sup> "Nutrition: At Work and in City Facilities - NYC Health," 2020, <https://www1.nyc.gov/site/doh/health/health-topics/healthy-workplaces.page>.

<sup>41</sup> "Nation's Largest School Districts to Procure Antibiotic-Free Chicken," NRDC, 2014, <https://www.nrdc.org/media/2014/141209-0>.

<sup>42</sup> "BUDGET The 'Mwananchi' Guide 19/20" (Kenya National Treasury and Planning, 2019), <http://www.treasury.go.ke/component/jdownloads/send/201-2019-2020/1443-budget-highlights-19-20.html>.

<sup>43</sup> Luana Swensson, *Institutional Procurement of Food from Smallholder Farmers: The Case of Brazil*, 2015.

<sup>44</sup> Lesley Drake et al., "Global School Feeding Sourcebook: Lessons from 14 Countries" (The World Bank, January 1, 2016), <http://documents.worldbank.org/curated/en/764611468197374242/Global-school-feeding-sourcebook-lessons-from-14-countries>.

and types of foods being purchased. Decentralised and centralised procurement systems are not mutually exclusive. Centralised systems can often be useful when a food is not available locally, needs to be fortified in bulk, or cannot be procured locally in a cost-effective way.<sup>45</sup>

The benefit of a centralised system is that the procuring entity may benefit from economies of scale and more negotiating power as a larger entity making higher volume purchases. A centralised system can increase standardization, especially when there may be a lack of local funding, or administrative or technical capacity.

In a comparison of three institutional procurement case studies in New York City, the more centralised systems of the NYC Public School System and Department of Corrections had more healthy foods as compared to the New York Department for the Aging. Centralised procurement allowed for negotiating better food prices through volume discounting. However, delivery fees from a central purchasing body can offset the reduced costs of centralised procurement.<sup>46</sup>

Centralised procurement can help put pressure on food producers to meet nutrition standards. The NYC Department of Education Office of School Food and Nutrition Services, and the Department of Corrections both create centrally planned menus. As a result, vendors have reformulated menu items to be healthy enough to meet the New York Food Standards.<sup>47</sup>

Decentralisation increases flexibility for local governments, institutions, and small-scale suppliers to adapt to local preferences and needs. An efficient and short supply chain can potentially accelerate delivery of fresher foods.<sup>48</sup> Despite this flexibility, procurement authorities can still set nutrition standards, as is the case for Brazil. Nonetheless, decentralised systems have a risk of local leaders abusing the system because of procurement responsibility and funding flows being diffused across many actors. Brazil's programmes have faced challenges around corruption and lack of availability of small local producers to serve larger cities.<sup>49</sup> Another issue is local noncompliance with food safety standards, which threatens the provision of safe meals.<sup>50</sup>

## Need for food infrastructure development

Since institutions purchase food to serve hundreds or even thousands of people, they face unique challenges in procuring and serving a high volume of food.

There is a need for investment in transport systems, cold storage, and information systems that allow for better functioning of markets for perishable products such as fruits and vegetables, and livestock products. These issues are often compounded for small and medium-sized farms and enterprises that may lack access to credit, technical assistance, and tools to avoid food loss and waste.<sup>51</sup> It is also important for there to be an entity or forum that enables farmers to bargain as a

<sup>45</sup> Kelly and Swensson, *Leveraging Institutional Food Procurement for Linking Small Farmers to Markets*.

<sup>46</sup> E. K. Tsui et al., "Institutional Food as a Lever for Improving Health in Cities: The Case of New York City," *Public Health* 129, no. 4 (April 1, 2015): 303–9, <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.puhe.2014.12.006>.

<sup>47</sup> Tsui et al.

<sup>48</sup> Kelly and Swensson, *Leveraging Institutional Food Procurement for Linking Small Farmers to Markets*, 28.

<sup>49</sup> "Brazil's Policies to Guarantee Food Rights."

<sup>50</sup> Kitaoka, "The National School Meal Program in Brazil."

<sup>51</sup> "Systemic Food Assistance: WFP's Strategy for Leveraging Food Assistance to Improve Food System Performance" (World Food Programme, 2018), <https://www.wfp.org/publications/systemic-food-assistance-wfp%E2%80%99s-strategy-leveraging-food-assistance-improve-food-system-perfo>.

collective with institutions. These forms of infrastructure, logistics, and finance are vital for farmers to participate in food procurement programmes.<sup>52</sup>

In LMIC, a lot of food reaches consumers through informal systems. Therefore, urban governments need to provide regulations and surveillance that balance food safety and livelihoods. Similarly, water, sanitation, and hygiene (WASH) investments are critical to ensure food safety in food procurement supply chains. However, institutions in LMIC face WASH challenges. For instance, one study found that about 50% of healthcare facilities in low- and middle-income countries lack piped water. Combined with the lack of handwashing and bathroom facilities, it can be harder to prepare and consume food safely.<sup>53</sup>

The World Bank has noted that public procurement faces several challenges. Lack of e-procurement (online procurement) platforms reduces efficiency for institutional buyers. Payment delays from institutional buyers can harm much-needed income for small- and medium-sized farmers and producers. Lack of complaint mechanisms makes it harder for actors along the value chain to raise issues. For healthy food procurement, this is particularly important for raising issues about food safety and quality.<sup>54</sup> Together, these tools could help increase transparency, efficiency, and accountability, whilst preventing corruption.

To improve its food procurement infrastructure, New York City State has invested 15 million USD in expanding an urban food hub. The food hub will provide space for institutional food procurement programmes to aggregate, refrigerate, process, and distribute regionally-procured food.<sup>55</sup>

## Defining and measuring success

Measuring changes to public procurement is now part of the global agenda. UN Sustainable Development Goal 12 on Sustainable Consumption includes indicator 12.7.1 to measure the number of countries implementing sustainable public procurement policies and action plans, though this methodology is still under development. The Milan Urban Food Policy Pact, which has 206 signatory cities committed to improve urban food governance, includes an indicator to measure the proportion of food procurement expenditure by public institutions on food from sustainable, ethical sources and shorter (local/regional) supply chains.<sup>56</sup> Monitoring and evaluation should occur in line with general best practises on food and nutrition security, though the exact design would be dependent on local context.

<sup>52</sup> "Sector Policies for Better Food Security and Nutrition Results: Public Food Procurement" (FAO, 2018), <http://www.fao.org/3/CA2281EN/ca2281en.pdf>.

<sup>53</sup> Ryan Cronk and Jamie Bartram, "Environmental Conditions in Health Care Facilities in Low- and Middle-Income Countries: Coverage and Inequalities," *International Journal of Hygiene and Environmental Health* 221, no. 3 (April 1, 2018): 409–22, <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijheh.2018.01.004>.

<sup>54</sup> "Why Modern, Fair and Open Public Procurement Systems Matter for the Private Sector in Developing Countries," World Bank, 2018, <https://www.worldbank.org/en/news/feature/2018/05/16/why-modern-fair-and-open-public-procurement-systems-matter-for-developing-countries>.

<sup>55</sup> "Bringing the Good Food Purchasing Program to New York City Barriers and Facilitators for Select Institutions" (CUNY Urban Food Policy Institute, 2019), [https://static1.squarespace.com/static/572d0fcc2b8dde9e10ab59d4/t/5d12735703f941000147c234/1561490267771/GFPP\\_NoVo\\_Report\\_06-24-2019\\_Full\\_Report\\_June.pdf](https://static1.squarespace.com/static/572d0fcc2b8dde9e10ab59d4/t/5d12735703f941000147c234/1561490267771/GFPP_NoVo_Report_06-24-2019_Full_Report_June.pdf).

<sup>56</sup> "Milan Urban Food Policy Pact Monitoring Framework, Indicator 38: Proportion of Food Procurement Expenditure by Public Institutions on Food from Sustainable, Ethical Sources and Shorter (Local/Regional) Supply Chains," 2018, <http://www.milanurbanfoodpolicypact.org/wp-content/uploads/2018/08/Food-supply-distribution-Indicator-38-Procurement-expenditure-on-food-V3.pdf>.

Programme Logic to Guide Healthy Food Procurement Evaluation
<p><b>Inputs</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Governance: Creation of multistakeholder coordination body</li> <li>▪ Budget for food procurement and staffing</li> <li>▪ Training value chain stakeholders in procurement – farmers, cooperatives, wholesalers, purchasing agents, foodservice staff, consumers and their families</li> <li>▪ Connecting procuring bodies and suppliers</li> <li>▪ Raising awareness through publicity campaigns</li> </ul>
<p><b>Outputs</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Procurement agreements</li> <li>▪ Quantity, nutrition content, and safety of food provided in through public procurement and institutional settings</li> <li>▪ Compliance with food safety and quality requirements</li> <li>▪ Inclusion of women and marginalized groups in the value chain</li> </ul>
<p><b>Short and Medium-Term Outcomes</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Individual and household consumption of nutritious food (energy, micronutrients, dietary diversity) for target population</li> <li>▪ Perceived food security for target population</li> <li>▪ Behavioural change for target population, food attitudes and behaviours</li> <li>▪ Cross-sector outcomes for target population such as school attendance, patient satisfaction, gender-specific outcomes</li> <li>▪ Upgrades to food infrastructure – adoption of information technology, cold storage, e-procurement</li> <li>▪ Income stability for smallholder farmers and small- and medium enterprises</li> </ul>
<p><b>Long term outcomes</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Health and nutrition status for target population (height, weight), other health outcomes, disaggregated by gender and race</li> <li>▪ Socioeconomic outcomes for target population – educational attainment, lifetime income, healthcare spending, quality of life</li> <li>▪ Shifts in food markets towards production and marketing of healthier foods</li> <li>▪ Community resilience against shocks</li> <li>▪ Nutrition-sensitive policy commitments at local, regional, and national levels</li> </ul>

In the following sections, the urban case studies will be evaluated through the lens of this proposed framework and other key themes identified in this preceding section.

## Case Study: Addis Ababa City Administration Students Feeding Agency

The City Administration launched a city government-run universal school feeding programme in 2019. They passed legislation to convert it into the dedicated Students Feeding Agency in 2020.<sup>57</sup> The Students Feeding Agency will feed all public school students from preschool to eighth grade, about 351,000 students at 250 schools (80% of public school students).<sup>58</sup> The Agency aims to improve educational experiences by increasing energy and attendance, while reducing school dropout rates. The Agency will also provide uniforms, books, and menstrual pads.<sup>59</sup>



<sup>57</sup> "Addis Ababa to Set up Agency to Run Free Meal Program – Ethiopian Monitor," 2020,

<https://ethiopianmonitor.com/2020/01/25/addis-ababa-to-set-up-agency-to-run-free-meal-program/>.

<sup>58</sup> "Addis Renewing Schools, Building Feeding Facilities for the New Academic Year," *Ethiopian Press Agency* (blog), 2019, <https://www.press.et/english/?p=9468>.

<sup>59</sup> "Addis Ababa City to Establish 'Students Feeding Agency,'" *Ezega News*, 2019,

<https://www.ezega.com/News/NewsDetails/7554/Addis-Ababa-City-to-Establish-Students-Feeding-Agency->

## Initial state of nutrition in Addis Ababa

Malnutrition is a serious problem for Ethiopia, though by some measures, urban undernutrition is less severe than in rural areas. Child stunting, underweight, wasting, and anaemia are higher in rural areas than for urban areas. Vitamin A supplementation and appropriate complementary feeding are also more common in urban areas.<sup>60</sup> Nonetheless, child undernutrition is highly visible in Addis Ababa. The Addis Ababa Bureau of Education and Bureau of Women and Children's Affairs have found that a quarter of Addis Ababa children are getting one meal a day, and 15% report not having at least a meal every day.<sup>61</sup>

Ethiopia is also beginning to experience overnutrition-related problems, especially in urban areas. Addis Ababa has the highest rates of overweight and obesity in the country. Between 2000 and 2016, the proportion of women in Ethiopia who are overweight or obese increased from 3% to 8%. The data shown below appears in the Global Nutrition Report Country Nutrition Profile and the Ethiopia Demographic and Health Survey.<sup>62, 63</sup>

National Child Stunting (%)	National Under-5 Child Overweight (%)	National Adult Female Overweight/Obesity (%)	National Adult Female Diabetes (%)
34	2.9	28	5.0

Urban Child Stunting (%)	Urban Under-5 Child Overweight (%)
25.4	3.1

Rural overweight or obese women (%)	Urban overweight or obese women (%)	Addis Ababa overweight or obese women (%)
3.5	21.4	29.4

## Ethiopian nutrition legislation

In 2012, Ethiopia launched a National School Health and Nutrition Strategy to address a range of health issues.<sup>64</sup> Among these issues are inadequate food consumption and malnutrition, iodine and vitamin A deficiency, and low awareness about the connection between health, nutrition, and ability for children to learn. One of the objectives of the plan is:

*“To ensure mechanisms are put in place for ownership and sustainability of SHN programmes (such as school feeding programmes and other promotive nutrition interventions, cooking demonstrations and school gardens) thereby, increasing*

<sup>60</sup> “Ethiopia Demographic and Health Survey” (Central Statistical Agency Addis Ababa, Ethiopia, 2017), <https://dhsprogram.com/pubs/pdf/FR328/FR328.pdf>.

<sup>61</sup> Abiy Yohannes, “The Effect of School Feeding Program on the School Performance of Primary Public School Children in Arada Sub City, Addis Ababa” (Thesis, Addis Ababa University, 2017), <http://etd.aau.edu.et/handle/123456789/1176>.

<sup>62</sup> “Country Nutrition Profiles,” Global Nutrition Report, 2020, <https://globalnutritionreport.org/resources/nutrition-profiles/>.

<sup>63</sup> Teshale Darebo, Addisalem Mesfin, and Samson Gebremedhin, “Prevalence and Factors Associated with Overweight and Obesity among Adults in Hawassa City, Southern Ethiopia: A Community Based Cross-Sectional Study,” *BMC Obesity* 6 (2019), <https://doi.org/10.1186/s40608-019-0227-7>.

<sup>64</sup> “National School Health and Nutrition Strategy.”

*access and completion rates by reducing dropout and absenteeism prevalent in chronically food insecure areas of the country.”*

In 2015, the Government of Ethiopia announced the Seqota Declaration, a plan to end child malnutrition by 2030.<sup>65</sup> The Government made the Declaration a part of its National Growth and Transformation Plan, which makes it a high-level commitment. The Government allocated 477 million Birr (16.3 million USD) towards achieving the Seqota Declaration. A Coordination Body and Technical Committee on nutrition created the “New Food and Nutrition Policy” in 2019.<sup>66</sup>

Dietary guidelines are under development in Ethiopia, with a technical guideline drafting workshop held in 2019. The guidelines aim to increase dietary diversity in order to address micronutrient and protein deficiencies, and to prevent noncommunicable diseases. The involved stakeholders included the Ethiopian Public Health Institute, FAO, and CGIAR Research Program on Agriculture for Nutrition and Health. The guidelines may also help facilitate cooperation between the agriculture, health, and nutrition sectors.<sup>67</sup>

### Existing Ethiopian school feeding programmes

Though the Addis Ababa programme is unique in that it is a city government-run programme, Ethiopia and Addis Ababa already have various existing school feeding efforts. Ethiopia and WFP created a school feeding programme that relies on in-kind food aid in 1994.<sup>68</sup> Ethiopia started a Home-Grown School Feeding initiative in 2012 to serve the Southern Nations, Nationalities and People’s Region (SNNPR), and Oromia in partnership with WFP and FAO. In 2015, the Ethiopian federal government created the Emergency HGFSF programme to fund meals in rural schools during droughts, adapting where services are provided based on drought severity and location.

According to one interview, the perception is that most donor and implementing agency energy has gone towards rural school feeding. Prior to 2019, various Addis Ababa NGOs provided school meals for targeted segments of the school population, or about 30 thousand students.<sup>69</sup> The most prominent example is the Enat Weg Charitable Association Smiling Children Initiative founded in 2015 by Ethiopian First Lady Roman Tesfaye to serve a subset of Addis Ababa primary schools.

In another example, the Ethiopia School Meal Initiative (ESMI) conducts school feeding to 3000 students across the country. ESMI created a programme to keep cows at schools to provide access to milk for students. The schools then sell surplus milk to the local community and use the revenue to cover other school expenses.<sup>70</sup>

<sup>65</sup> “Ethiopia Commits to Ending Undernutrition by 2030 with the Seqota Declaration,” *SUN* (blog), July 21, 2015, <https://scalingupnutrition.org/news/ethiopia-commits-to-ending-under-nutrition-by-2030-with-the-seqota-declaration/>.

<sup>66</sup> “Ethiopia,” Global Nutrition Report, 2019, <https://globalnutritionreport.org/resources/nutrition-growth-commitment-tracking/ethiopia/>.

<sup>67</sup> “A Milestone in Developing Food-Based Dietary Guidelines for Ethiopia,” 2019, <https://a4nh.cgiar.org/2019/07/10/a-milestone-in-developing-food-based-dietary-guidelines-for-ethiopia/>.

<sup>68</sup> Luana Swensson, “Aligning Public Procurement Rules and Practices to Support the Implementation of Home-Grown School Feeding (HGFSF) Initiatives: The Case of Ethiopia” (FAO, 2019), 14, <http://www.fao.org/3/CA3614EN/ca3614en.pdf>.

<sup>69</sup> According to an interview.

<sup>70</sup> “Feature: ‘Feeding School Children Is Not Charity, It Is Our Duty and It Is Their Right’: Frealem Shibabaw,” *Addis Standard*, November 19, 2019, <https://addisstandard.com/feature-feeding-school-children-is-not-charity-it-is-our-duty-and-it-is-their-right-frealem-shibabaw/>.



## Stakeholder motivations: responding to urban poverty and child malnutrition

Addis Ababa often experiences food price inflation and fluctuations. The Ethiopian food supply relies mainly on rain-fed agriculture, which makes farming vulnerable to extreme weather. Lower crop yields have resulted in a declining urban food supply. El Niño caused extreme weather in 2015 to 2016, which further exacerbated droughts.<sup>71</sup>

From the 1990s to 2000s, Ethiopia achieved major reductions to rural poverty and improvements to food security. Stunting decreased by 38% between 2011 and 2016, and underweight reduced from 29 to 23% nationally.<sup>72</sup>

During this same time, income inequality in urban Ethiopia has increased. Urban young people face high poverty and housing shortages.<sup>73</sup> An estimated 80% of Addis Ababa residents live in urban slums. In 2011, UNICEF estimated that 12,000 children live on the street in Addis Ababa.<sup>74</sup>

School feeding plays an important social protection role in Addis Ababa. Government-run schools have high proportions of poor students, since students from wealthier families have the option to attend private schools. Public school students are more likely to be poor, orphaned or with a single parent, affected by HIV, affected by disabilities, and/or migrant.<sup>75</sup> In addition, Addis Ababa's HIV prevalence is 7 times as high in rural settings and twice as high in women as compared to men.<sup>76</sup>

Addis Ababa stakeholders have recognized how food insecurity leads students to perform poorly academically, repeat grades, be absent from school, or drop out entirely. In a state of hunger, children may stay at home and look for food or work. **A common theme across interviews was that teachers have witnessed their students faint due to lack of energy.**

### Political champions and community demand for school meals

Several advocates helped give rise to the Addis Ababa Students Feeding Agency. Frealem Shibabaw, Director of the Ethiopian School Meal Initiative NGO, raised the issue of school nutrition to the Ministry of Education, which gave rise to the Ethiopian government's Seqota Declaration.<sup>77</sup>

Former Ethiopian First Lady Roman Tesfaye created the Enat Weg Charitable Association (EWCA) "Smiling Children" school meal programme that served as the model for the Students Feeding Agency. EWCA receives funding from the China Foundation for Poverty Alleviation and corporate donors like Ethiopian Airlines and Ethio Telecom.<sup>78</sup> In 2019, the EWCA programme served 22,000

<sup>71</sup> "As Drought Stokes Urban Hunger, Ethiopia Dishes up Free School Meals," *Reuters*, July 8, 2019, <https://www.reuters.com/article/us-climate-change-ethiopia-drought-idUSKCN1U30RW>.

<sup>72</sup> "Ethiopia."

<sup>73</sup> "Study on Situation of Out of School Children (OOSC) in Ethiopia" (Ministry of Education and UNICEF, 2012), [https://www.unicef.org/ethiopia/media/1426/file/Study%20on%20Situation%20of%20Out%20of%20School%20Children%20\(OOSC\)%20in%20Ethiopia.pdf](https://www.unicef.org/ethiopia/media/1426/file/Study%20on%20Situation%20of%20Out%20of%20School%20Children%20(OOSC)%20in%20Ethiopia.pdf).

<sup>74</sup> "Ethiopia Country Programme Document 2012-2015" (UNICEF, 2011), [https://www.unicef.org/about/execboard/files/Ethiopia\\_final\\_approved\\_2012-2015\\_20\\_Oct\\_2011.pdf](https://www.unicef.org/about/execboard/files/Ethiopia_final_approved_2012-2015_20_Oct_2011.pdf).

<sup>75</sup> Based on an interview.

<sup>76</sup> Melaku Adal, "Systematic Review on HIV Situation in Addis Ababa, Ethiopia," *BMC Public Health* 19, no. 1 (December 2019): 1544, <https://doi.org/10.1186/s12889-019-7885-8>.

<sup>77</sup> AWiB, "Frealem Shibabaw," AWiB, 2016, <https://www.awib.org.et/currency/pinnacle/item/919-frealem-shibabaw.html>; Board on Global Health et al., *Supporting Family and Community Investments in Young Children Globally: Summary of a Joint Workshop*, ed. Jocelyn Widmer (Washington, D.C.: National Academies Press, 2016), <https://doi.org/10.17226/21883>.

<sup>78</sup> "Ethio-Telecom Donates 5.2 Million Birr for School Feeding (WIC)," *HumanitarianResponse*, 2015, <https://www.humanitarianresponse.info/en/operations/ethiopia/article/ethio-telecom-donates-52-million-birr-school-feeding-wic>;

students in 42 Addis Ababa primary schools with a budget of 170,000 USD. It also hired 1200 mothers to supply, prepare, and serve food.<sup>79</sup>

First Lady Tesfaye raised awareness about school feeding to the Addis Ababa Bureaus of Education, Women and Children's Affairs, and Health, to local organisations, and to the media. She often speaks about the importance of supporting child nutrition to improve student learning and reduce their susceptibility to both communicable and noncommunicable diseases.<sup>80</sup>



Students eating in an Addis Ababa school with Mayor Takele Uma (Photo: Ethiopia Press Agency)

The City Administration school feeding programme received key support from Mayor Takele Uma. After he took office in 2018, the outgoing First Lady Tesfaye and Prime Minister Hailemariam Desalegn invited the Mayor to a meeting where they presented on the EWCA programme and encouraged him to make it a priority. With Mayor Takele Uma's support, the Addis Ababa Education Bureau launched a school feeding programme in

2019. The programme fed 70,000 students at a cost of 169 million birr (5.5 million USD).<sup>81</sup>

Before 2019, the Addis Ababa Education Bureau faced challenges in convincing the City Administration to fund school feeding. However, the Mayor's support and media coverage have increased acceptance among high-level officials for government spending on school feeding. In addition, parents have been vocal in advocating for school feeding. Families and the general public have expressed positive feedback about the new City Administration programme. In early 2020, the City Administration passed a bill to convert the Education Bureau's programme into the dedicated Students Feeding Agency.

## Dedicated food procurement governance with multistakeholder coordination

Following successful creation of the Students Feeding Agency, Meti Tamrat, Director of the Students Feeding Agency, now leads a staff of 10. The Students Feeding Agency is led by a board that includes leaders of NGO school feeding who have influenced programme design (such as Frealem Shibabaw's guidance to hire mothers to prepare food), researchers from Addis Ababa University, and local artists who advocate for the Agency.

The Office of the Mayor oversees Students Feeding Agency activities. As a dedicated governing body, the Agency acts as a multi-stakeholder coordinator for Addis Ababa City Administration departments and existing school feeding organizations, who previously did not follow a common standard. Each department's responsibilities are outlined below.<sup>82</sup>

<sup>79</sup> "Ethiopian Signs MoU with Office of the First Lady and 'Ye Enat Weg' Charity Organization to Feed School Children Who Need Help - November 13, 2015," Ethiopian Airlines, 2015, <https://corporate.ethiopianairlines.com/Press-release-open-page/ethiopian-signs-mou-with-office-of-the-first-lady-and-ye-enat-weg-charity-organization-to-feed-school-children-who-need-help---november-13-2015>.

<sup>80</sup> Semonegna, "First Lady Roman Tesfaye, CFP Promote the Welfare of Women & Children," *Semonegna Ethiopia* (blog), January 16, 2019, <https://semonegna.com/first-lady-roman-tesfaye-cfp-promote-women-children-welfare/>.

<sup>81</sup> Semonegna.

<sup>82</sup> "As Drought Stokes Urban Hunger, Ethiopia Dishes up Free School Meals."

<sup>82</sup> Addis Negari Gazeta of the City Government of Addis Ababa, "Addis Ababa City Government School Feeding Agency Procedure Regulation," Pub. L. No. Regulation No.112/2020 (2020), Available on request.

<b>Addis Ababa School Feeding Multistakeholder Coordination</b>	
<b>Students Feeding Agency</b> core responsibilities	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Ensure programme continuity</li> <li>▪ Conduct programme monitoring from school to school</li> <li>▪ Gather resources to execute school feeding</li> <li>▪ Create school food menu and ensure schools are providing food in accordance with the menu</li> <li>▪ Contract with associations or individuals for food preparation services</li> <li>▪ Carry out evaluations on student learning, behaviour, and development</li> </ul>
<b>Student-Parent Committees</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Check for food quality</li> <li>▪ Contribute to menu creation</li> </ul>
<b>Education Bureau</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Share student information</li> <li>▪ Monitor daily school feeding provision through school human resources</li> <li>▪ Distribute school supplies and uniforms</li> <li>▪ Ensure services consider the needs of students with disabilities</li> <li>▪ Improve availability of sufficient kitchens and cafeterias in schools</li> </ul>
<b>Finance Bureau</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Issue directives on school feeding, and procurement of uniforms and school supplies</li> <li>▪ Ensure appropriate use of budget and reliable financial procedures</li> <li>▪ Provide prompt financial consultation</li> </ul>
<b>Health Bureau</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Check that medical examinations conducted for cooks is standardized and credible, and/or provide examinations for cooks</li> <li>▪ Raise awareness on food preparation, serving, and hygiene for cooks and other stakeholders involved in food handling</li> <li>▪ Strengthen relationship between Students Feeding Agency and Addis Ababa subcity health offices</li> </ul>
<b>Women and Children Affairs Bureau</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Provide support to train mothers/parents to be the main food preparers, including, including vocational training on catering</li> <li>▪ Organize and recognize food suppliers to assist their feeding business</li> </ul>
<b>Food and Pharmaceutical Controlling Authority</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Inspect and correct quality standards in kitchens, cafeterias, and warehouses</li> <li>▪ Monitor the quality and safety of supplies used for food preparation</li> <li>▪ Check on cooks' medical examination certifications</li> <li>▪ Carry out sudden food safety inspections</li> </ul>
<b>Trade Bureau</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Create conditions that enable market links between food preparers and wholesalers</li> </ul>
<b>Solid Waste Management Agency</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Coordinate disposal of leftover food and solid waste</li> <li>▪ Raise awareness about solid waste disposal and sewage among stakeholders involved in school feeding</li> </ul>
<b>Water and Sewage Authority</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Provide water for students</li> <li>▪ Ensure adequate sewage disposal</li> </ul>

## Funding and assets

The Students Feeding Agency will manage an annual budget set aside by the City Administration. The Agency has a per-student budget allocation of 16 birr per day (about USD \$0.50), up from 14 Birr in 2019. The total annual budget to feed 351,000 students for every school day is approximately 1.4 billion Birr (43.4 million USD).<sup>83</sup> The 2019 City Administration budget was 44.7 billion Birr (13.7 billion USD), making school feeding about 3% of the City budget.<sup>84</sup> The City Administration plans to link the Agency's funding to City tax policy to guarantee predictable future funding. Mayor Takele Uma will seek donations from wealthy individuals and companies, similar to the donations that Enat Weg Charitable Association has received.

## Implementation Plan: the Addis Ababa school feeding procurement model

### Standard menu for Addis Ababa schools

The Students Feeding Agency aims to increase consistency across schools in Addis Ababa. For both the Addis Ababa City Administration and the EWCA programmes, the main priorities are to address short-term hunger, maximize number of students served using a limited budget and foods available within Ethiopia, and provide foods that are culturally familiar and palatable. The menu provided by the Students Feeding Agency is as follows:<sup>85</sup>

Day	Type of food
<b>Breakfast</b>	
Monday	Enjera firfir (Enjera with onion, oil and red pepper powder sauce) and tea
Tuesday	Traditional bread and tea
Wednesday	Bread with jam and tea
Thursday	Enjera firfir
Friday	Any of listed above
<b>Lunch</b>	
Monday	Enjera with lentils sauce
Tuesday	Rice with bread
Wednesday	Enjera with potato sauce
Thursday	Enjera with pea powder sauce and egg
Friday	Any of listed above

### Addis Ababa School Feeding Value Chain

Farmers	State-owned enterprises	Ye-Shemachoch Maheber (Consumer Association Shops)	Teams of mothers	Students
Food production	Food processing and aggregation	Food wholesaling	-Food purchasing -Meal preparation	Consume meals

<sup>83</sup> Based on author's calculation and confirmed through interview, but exact budget numbers are not known yet

<sup>84</sup> "Ethiopia: Addis Allocates 44b Br Budget," allAfrica.com, July 17, 2018, <https://allafrica.com/stories/201807170719.html>.

<sup>85</sup> Menu provided by GAIN Ethiopia Country Office and Students Feeding Agency.

The Addis Ababa Students Feeding Agency procurement model is decentralised. Although all schools follow the same menu, no central body purchases food for all the schools. Instead, the Agency hires teams of mothers of students at each school to purchase ingredients and prepare food. The mothers are given the Students Feeding Agency menu and are then expected to purchase food themselves.

### Ye-Shemachoch consumer association shops

Teams of mothers purchase cooking oil, wheat flour, and sugar from “consumer association shops”, a form of retail outlet run by the Ethiopian government. Ethiopia’s cereal sector largely operates through local mills, shops, and cooperative retail outlets. The Ethiopian government subsidizes the sale of wheat, palm oil, and sugar. The government then sells these goods through these consumer association shops. According to a 2013 report, there were 221 consumer association shops in Addis Ababa, of which half engaged in wholesaling.<sup>86</sup>

The consumer association shops offer ingredients at what was described by interviewees as fair prices cheaper than other markets. Indeed, these consumer association shops tend to charge lower prices than other outlets.<sup>87</sup> The consumer association shops are instructed to give priority to the school feeding programme, though they also sell to some private consumers as well.

### Food purchasing and preparation by mothers

The Addis Ababa programme employs students’ mothers to prepare the meals.<sup>88</sup> In 2019, the City Administration school feeding programme hired 10,000 mothers in the city. Approximately one mother is responsible for preparing food for 30 to 50 children.

The Addis Ababa Health Bureau provides training to the mothers on safe food handling, at least for 1 or 2 mothers per school. Trained mothers are then tasked with training other mothers on the cooking team on food safety practices. Typically, mothers will purchase ingredients over the weekend and then get a reimbursement by bank transfer from the Education Bureau. They then cook inside the school kitchens. In addition, the school principal plays a role in monitoring the school feeding.

The employment of mothers reinforces the incentive to practice good food safety because the mothers are serving food to their own children. Moreover, this model provides empowerment for women who were previously unemployed, many of whom are poor and marginalized.

### Universal coverage: strengthening schooling in a gender-sensitive way

The Addis Ababa Students Feeding Agency has universal coverage for students in grades 1 through 8. Importantly, the law establishing the Agency explicitly mandates equal application of the law to girls.<sup>89</sup>

<sup>86</sup> “Urban Food Retail in Africa: The Case of Addis Ababa, Ethiopia” (Ethiopian Development Research Institute and IFPRI, 2013), [http://essp.ifpri.info/files/2011/04/ESSP\\_WP50\\_UrbanFoodRetail.pdf](http://essp.ifpri.info/files/2011/04/ESSP_WP50_UrbanFoodRetail.pdf).

<sup>87</sup> “Urban Food Retail in Africa: The Case of Addis Ababa, Ethiopia.”

<sup>88</sup> “Feature: ‘Feeding School Children Is Not Charity, It Is Our Duty and It Is Their Right’: Frealem Shibabaw.”

<sup>89</sup> Addis Negari Gazeta of the City Government of Addis Ababa, Addis Ababa City Government School Feeding Agency Procedure Regulation.

The Students Feeding Agency recognizes that increasing school engagement and reducing absenteeism is vital for education. Low access to sanitary pads, lack of cleanliness, and lack of private bathrooms make it more likely for menstruating girls to stay at home or drop out of school.<sup>90</sup> Therefore, the Agency will provide several products to improve the education experience beyond food. The Agency will provide school supplies, uniforms, and menstrual pads. With similar uniforms across schools, the Agency expects student socioeconomic status to be less visible, such as when a uniform change signals that a student has transitioned from one school to another.

School absenteeism is also driven in part by poverty stigma. Students feel ashamed of going to school when they do not have food. One interviewee told a story about children bringing empty lunch boxes to school to mask their poverty. Universal coverage helps reduce poverty stigma by ensuring uniformity between students' meals (or previous lack thereof).

In addition to school supplies, the Addis Ababa Education Bureau is repairing hundreds of schools to create cleaner classrooms, bathrooms, and kitchen facilities. The Mayor's Office allocated 1 billion Birr (29.5 million USD) for these construction efforts and non-food supplies for students.<sup>91</sup>

## Evaluation and improvement

A study conducted by the consulting firm Et Alim Trading helped demonstrate the positive impact of Enat Weg Charitable Association's school feeding programme. This study found that at the 11 schools sampled, the number of student dropouts reduced from 79 in 2013 to 19 in 2018 – a 76% decrease in dropouts. Students with absenteeism decreased by 59%. Student academic scores improved by 14% between 2013 and 2018. School enrolment increased by 9%. The study also found that children had a 22% increase in body weight and 4% in height among participating students compared to control group students.<sup>92</sup>

The Et Alim Trading evaluation also pointed out how the ECWA programme had duplicative monitoring and evaluation efforts. EWCA, Addis Ababa Education Bureau, and Addis Ababa Women and Children's Affairs Bureau all contribute to monitoring and evaluation. However, according to Et Alim Trading, those efforts were not well-coordinated. These coordination issues are compounded by a lack of a digital database for student health and nutrition data.<sup>93</sup>

Moving forward, the Students Feeding Agency plans to collaborate with Addis Ababa University researchers to conduct evaluation research.

<sup>90</sup> Teketo Kassaw Tegegne and Mitike Molla Sisay, "Menstrual Hygiene Management and School Absenteeism among Female Adolescent Students in Northeast Ethiopia," *BMC Public Health* 14 (October 29, 2014), <https://doi.org/10.1186/1471-2458-14-1118>.

<sup>91</sup> "Addis Renewing Schools, Building Feeding Facilities for the New Academic Year."

<sup>92</sup> "Addis' School Feeding Program Eyeing to Downsize Dropouts," *Ethiopian Press Agency* (blog), 2019, <https://www.press.et/english/?p=14207>; "Impact of School Feeding Program Case of Ye Enat Weg Charitable Association and CFPA" (Et Alim Trading Plc, 2018), <https://agriprofocus.com/post/5d9acfbf26b72a36856608c5> (full report available by request).

<sup>93</sup> "Impact of School Feeding Program Case of Ye Enat Weg Charitable Association and CFPA."

## Enabling factors for Addis Ababa Students Feeding Agency

### Successful NGO precursors that evolved into dedicated governing agency

The Enat Weg Charitable Association school feeding programme provided a template for success. The Students Feeding Agency is now navigating the transition from NGO-led school-feeding to government-managed school feeding. The Agency plans to develop a framework that enables partnerships between government and NGO. In 2019, the City Administration devoted some of its school feeding budget to the Enat Weg Charitable Association programme.

Ultimately, the Students Feeding Agency will provide a unified management structure over programmes, sharing of best practices, and common standard of food provided (whether by the Students Feeding Agency or by an NGO or business it contracts). The Agency also coordinates multiple Addis Ababa City Administration departments to carry out school feeding.

### Political champions and high-level commitments

The Addis Ababa Students Feeding Agency has benefitted from high-level political support from Former First Lady Tesfaye and Mayor Takele Uma. Ethiopia already had existing national school feeding programmes and commitments to improve nutrition, which also created an enabling environment for the Addis Ababa programme.

The Ethiopian federal government hopes to expand school meals to all primary school students nationally. The Ethiopian Ministry of Education is preparing a national school feeding strategy. To this end, the Students Feeding Agency hopes to serve as a replicable model in Ethiopia.

### Involvement of beneficiaries at multiple levels

The Addis Ababa Students Feeding Agency involves beneficiaries in synergistic ways. Families have continually advocated for school feeding, thereby putting pressure on the City Administration. By hiring mothers of children, the programme improves their livelihoods and could therefore be improving household food security through both the student and mother.

### Government-subsidised food procurement

The Students Feeding Agency benefits from procuring food through government-subsidised cooperative association shops that source staples from Ethiopian farmers. Stakeholders reported that doing so helped minimize costs.

In 2019, Ethiopia revised its national home grown school feeding public procurement policies to accommodate smallholders and their representative organizations. Through a federal government proclamation, procuring entities like schools will be required to award a 15 percent preference in the price evaluation process for goods produced in Ethiopia. Small and medium enterprises will receive a further 3 percent preference.<sup>94</sup> It remains to be seen how these new changes apply to the Addis Ababa school feeding programme.<sup>95</sup>

<sup>94</sup> "Government Revises Public Procurement for School Feeding Program," *Ethiopian Press Agency* (blog), 2019, <https://www.press.et/english/?p=15644>.

<sup>95</sup> Interviewees were not sure if Addis Ababa Students Feeding Agency benefitted from these new procurement guidelines, but did note how Consumer Association Shops are themselves government subsidized and largely source from Ethiopian farmers.

## Challenges and areas for growth: Addis Ababa school feeding programmes

### Inconsistent quality of school kitchens and canteens



Mothers cooking at an Addis Ababa school  
(Photo: Belayneh Zelelew Negash)

Many Addis Ababa public schools lack adequate kitchen and canteen facilities to enable school feeding. This limits food preparation efficiency and makes it difficult to provide a welcoming space for students to eat in. It also threatens cleanliness, creating food safety risks. The issues include unreliable electricity, lack of space, and lack of chairs.

Therefore, the City Administration has begun renovating schools so that in 2020, all primary schools will have a standardized kitchen and canteen. The Addis Ababa Construction Bureau is hiring local residents to participate in the renovations, which also produces a positive local economic effect. Furthermore, the World Bank is expected to contribute 25 million USD towards school kitchen construction and renovation.

### Barriers to increasing nutrition and dietary diversity of food – especially cost

The experience of the Enat Weg Charitable Association demonstrates the continual challenges of adding nutritious, diverse, and fresh foods to its procurement model. Although ECWA's programme would ideally like to add foods like fresh fruits, vegetables, and animal products, they identified four key barriers that Addis Ababa school feeding programmes have in common:

1. **High cost of fresh products**, especially dairy
2. **Lack of cold storage infrastructure** at schools. Stakeholders described food storage infrastructure as insufficient (pictured to the right). School food storage spaces may involve keeping food on the floor or in improvised areas that make the most of limited space.
3. **Lack of time in the mother's workflow**. They usually procure ingredients during the weekend but do not have time on weekdays because they need to be cooking. Therefore, it may be challenging to purchase fresh products during the weekend that may go bad before the end of the schoolweek.
4. **Religious preference and plant-based diets** in Ethiopia are a barrier to dairy consumption.



Food storage at an Addis Ababa school  
(Photo: Belayneh Zelelew Negash)

### According to the Students Feeding Agency, a future priority is to add diversified and nutritious foods.

Some nutritional diversity comes from the wat sauce served with the injera, which is made with chickpeas and lentils, as well as with the serving of egg once a week. The Students Feeding Agency plans to explore adding milk and eggs as regular menu items. The Students Feeding Agency is also exploring how to add fruits and vegetables, possibly through school gardens.



There will need to be well thought-out school garden intervention design. Previously, Enat Weg Charitable Association has not had success with school gardens due in part to limited space within the city. Another interviewee expressed food safety concerns around poorly managed gardens. Similarly, there may be perceptions that fortified or packaged foods are safer than fresh foods.

Another cost-related barrier experienced by Enat Weg Charitable Association is the programme's vulnerability to market fluctuations. There is a relative lack of budgetary flexibility in the contracts made between the Association and the mothers. This can lead to disruptions in service when mothers then cannot afford to purchase ingredients.

### Ethiopia's national school feeding shares similar challenges around fresh food provision

The national HGSF programme collaborated with WFP's Purchase for Progress Programme and the Purchase from Africans for Africa programme to link schools and local farmers. Although the programme had intended to serve diversified foods including fruits and vegetables, the schools mainly served meals with cereals and pulses. Meanwhile, some fresh produce is provided at schools with gardens, but this is not consistent or systematic. Nonetheless, the national HGSF programme recognizes that it is important to provide diversified meals. In addition, smallholder farmers can benefit from fresh produce procurement since vegetable production can generate 3 to 5 times higher economic returns than grains and pulses. An FAO report suggested that fresh product procurement may require a more decentralised model where municipalities or schools have the main procurement authority. Decentralisation and a less burdensome contracting scheme could reduce barriers to participating in the school food procurement supply chain for local produce farmers.<sup>96</sup>

In this vein, one interviewee expressed that Addis Ababa would be a good place to develop urban local fruit, vegetable, poultry, and dairy farming to support public food procurement programmes. They suggested that demand and awareness around healthy food exists, but there needs to be more donor and NGO support.

***"They know there is a need, but they might not think about it because of budget limitation. We can do it, it's not a problem. It's poverty driven malnutrition, nothing else."** – Addis Ababa Interviewee*

GAIN, with support from the Danish government, is starting a pilot programme in partnership with Arla Foods Ingredients to provide fortified yoghurt as a mid-morning snack.<sup>97</sup> This project will reach 500 students, 4 times a week. An interviewee noted that for this project as well, predictable multi-year funding would be a very helpful enabling factor. Programmes like this will serve as a proof of concept for providing more fresh nutritious foods in Addis Ababa's institutional settings.

<sup>96</sup> Luana Swensson, "Aligning Public Procurement Rules and Practices to Support the Implementation of Home-Grown School Feeding (HGSF) Initiatives: The Case of Ethiopia."

<sup>97</sup> "Ethiopia: Yoghurt Enhance Poor Farmers' Income and Delivers Improved Nutrition," DANIDA, 2017, <http://etiopien.um.dk/en/danida-en/stories-and-result-1/ethiopia-yoghurt-boosting-poor-farmers-earnings-and-ensures-better-nutrition/>.

## Case Study: Sassoon General Hospital Meal Programme in Pune, India

In 2013, Sassoon General Hospital, a Maharashtra state-run hospital, implemented a meal programme that provides breakfast and evening meals for all admitted patients, or up to 1400 patients.<sup>98</sup> The programme is jointly funded by the Maharashtra government and philanthropic organizations, mainly the Ganapathi Trust and Society of Friends of Sassoon Hospital.

\*It should be noted that during this research, the Covid-19 pandemic escalated significantly, and it was not possible to reach certain stakeholders to gather further details about the programme.



<sup>98</sup> "Smart Nutrition Cities Building on What's Gone before" (The Food Foundation, 2019), <https://foodfoundation.org.uk/wp-content/uploads/2019/10/Nutrition-Smart-Case-Studies.pdf>.

## Initial state: growing double burden of malnutrition in India

Pune is another city where urbanisation has been associated with an increasing wealth gap. Rural to urban migration to seek better livelihoods has driven rapid urbanisation.<sup>99</sup> Pune, as with India overall, is experiencing the double burden of malnutrition.

Child undernutrition is a major issue in Pune. In addition to the data above from the Indian government, a 2012 study of child malnutrition found a 34% underweight rate, 58% stunting rate, and 18% wasting rate in children under 5 in Pune urban slums.<sup>100</sup> There is some evidence from a Maharashtra Public Health Department survey that Pune's malnutrition rates are underreported compared to national government surveys.<sup>101</sup>

Overnutrition also affects Pune and India as a whole, with undernutrition issues decreasing since 2005 but overnutrition issues increasing in prevalence. In fact, non-communicable diseases contribute to 60% of all deaths in India.<sup>102</sup> About one third of adults in Pune are overweight or obese. Although most nutrition initiatives focus on undernutrition, Pune has also recently launched a childhood obesity initiative.<sup>103</sup>

### National-level data<sup>104</sup>

Child Stunting (%)	Child (Under 5 years) Overweight (%)	Adult Female Overweight and Obesity (%)	Adult Female Diabetes Rate
38	6.1	26.6	8.3

Urban Child Stunting (%)	Urban Child (Under 5 years) Overweight (%)
30.6	3.2

### Pune-specific data (based on National Family Health Survey 2015-2016)<sup>105</sup>

Pune Child Stunting (under 5 years) (%)	Pune Female Overweight and Obesity (%)
22	30

## Stakeholder motivations: improving hospital food

Hospitals are an important place where healthcare providers should address malnutrition. A study

<sup>99</sup> Courtney Scott, "Pune Nutrition Situation and Stakeholder Mapping" (The Food Foundation, 2018), <https://foodfoundation.org.uk/wp-content/uploads/2019/10/Pune-situation-analysis.pdf>.

<sup>100</sup> Megha S Mamulwar et al., "Nutritional Status of Under-Five Children in Urban Slums of Pune," *International Journal of Medicine and Public Health* 4, no. 3 (2014): 247, <https://doi.org/10.4103/2230-8598.137710>.

<sup>101</sup> "Malnutrition Cases in Maharashtra Under-Reported, Finds Survey," *The Indian Express* (blog), 2018, <https://indianexpress.com/article/india/malnutrition-cases-in-maharashtra-under-reported-finds-survey-nfhs-4-5138960/>.

<sup>102</sup> Suzanne Nethan, Dharendra Sinha, and Ravi Mehrotra, "Non Communicable Disease Risk Factors and Their Trends in India," *Asian Pacific Journal of Cancer Prevention : APJCP* 18, no. 7 (2017): 2005–10, <https://doi.org/10.22034/APJCP.2017.18.7.2005>.

<sup>103</sup> Courtney Scott, "Pune Nutrition Situation and Stakeholder Mapping."

<sup>104</sup> "India Nutrition Profile," Global Nutrition Report, 2020, <https://globalnutritionreport.org/resources/nutrition-profiles/>.

<sup>105</sup> Courtney Scott, "Pune Nutrition Situation and Stakeholder Mapping."

of under-five children who were admitted to a hospital in Pune in a one-month period found that 47 out of 118 suffered from malnutrition. Among those 47 children, the moderate or severe malnutrition rate was higher for girls. The disparity may be due to gender bias and neglect of female children. Among those children, acute diarrheal disease was the most common co-morbid illness. Many children had suboptimal feeding, such as 30 percent having been breastfeeding exclusively for less than 6 months. The mothers had high illiteracy rates and low schooling levels, which may contribute to lack of knowledge about child nutrition in combination with cost barriers to practicing good nutrition.<sup>106</sup>

At the same time, overnutrition is a serious problem in Pune. In peri-urban areas surrounding Pune, there is low dietary diversity, and high rates of vitamin B12 deficiency and anaemia. And in those areas, higher food access is correlated with higher weight among adolescents.<sup>107</sup> Sassoon General Hospital sees a large number of patients coming in for the largely diet-related conditions of heart attacks, joint replacements, and kidney and liver failure.<sup>108</sup> According to an interviewee, there is also concern in the Indian medical community around the “thin-fat Indian” problem. That is, some Indian people are considered to be normal in body type based on their body mass index, but actually have unhealthy body fat levels. In other words, there is a possibility that obesity and noncommunicable disease risk can be more hidden.

### Improving food provision at Indian government-run hospitals

While some government-run hospitals in India provide food to patients, the food is often of limited quantity and quality. In such settings, the food preparation and sanitation may not be of a professional standard. Furthermore, the food may not be palatable for patients either, which can lead them to not want to consume that food.

The Sassoon programme provides a more stable and high-quality source of food for patients. Patients who are well-nourished tend to recover faster. Faster patient recovery helps alleviate the strain on the state-run hospital, since it serves mostly poor patients.

Both the Ganapathi Trust and Society of Friends of Sassoon Hospital have pre-existing philanthropic relationships with Sassoon General Hospital. The Ganapathi Trust is a major local religious charity that supports hospitals and programmes serving orphans. The Ganapathi Trust has contributed to renovations and creation of new hospital wards, such as a neonatal facility finished in 2017.<sup>109</sup> The Ganapathi Trust has developed public visibility and respect through organizing an annual Ganesh Festival. Providing food for the needy is considered a core part of their mission and has high community acceptance. The Ganapathi Trust is distributing food to people in rural and tribal areas during the Covid-19 pandemic. The Ganapathi Trust also distributes food to transgender people in Pune.

<sup>106</sup> Dhruvajyoti J Debnath and Chandrakant V Parulekar, “Profile of Under-Five Malnourished Children Admitted in a Tertiary Care Teaching Hospital in Pune, India,” *International Journal of Preventive Medicine* 5, no. 7 (July 2014): 882–86, <https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC4124566/>.

<sup>107</sup> Ganpule-Rao Av et al., “Food Access and Nutritional Status of Rural Adolescents in India: Pune Maternal Nutrition Study.,” *American Journal of Preventive Medicine*, January 22, 2020, <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.amepre.2019.10.017>.

<sup>108</sup> According to an interview.

<sup>109</sup> “NICU Inaugurated at Sassoon Hospital in Pune,” *Web India* 123, 2017, <https://news.webindia123.com/news/articles/India/20170417/3094814.html>.

The Society of Friends of Sassoon Hospital created the Shreevatsa childcare centre and orphanage that neighbours Sassoon General Hospital. The centre provides food and nutritional supplements to children with disabilities and life-threatening illnesses.<sup>110</sup> The Society also runs an outpatient nutrition clinic attached to Sassoon General Hospital, where it provides nutrition supplements for those affected by diseases like HIV and tuberculosis (a common cause of wasting).<sup>111</sup>

### Funding: state government and philanthropic contributions

The Sassoon General Hospital Meal Programme has joint funding from Maharashtra state government and philanthropic organizations. The programme is funded by donations from the Ganapathi Trust, a local temple trust, and the Society of Friends of Sassoon Hospital, a charitable trust started by the hospital's social workers.

Prior to the Ganapathi Trust's involvement, the government spent 30 to 40 million Rupees per year (397 to 529 thousand USD) on patient meal provision at Sassoon General Hospital. The government now spends about 36 to 42 million Rupees per year on the programme (487 to 568 thousand USD). At the time the meal programme was founded, the Ganapathi Trust planned to allocate 100 million Rupees per year (1.3 million USD).<sup>112</sup> Construction of the new kitchen cost 12.5 million Rupees (175 thousand USD)<sup>113</sup>. Hence, Sassoon General Hospital benefitted from a higher combined budget thanks to state government and philanthropic funding.

### Implementation Plan: Sassoon General Hospital food procurement



Sassoon Hospital meal programme's kitchen and roti machine (Photo: Ganapathi Trust)

The Ganapathi Trust procures ingredients for the food and prepares the meals at the hospital.<sup>114</sup> Some of the food is sourced from local farmers connected to the Trust.<sup>115</sup> The kitchen includes a mechanised roti maker that can prepare 1000 roti an hour. The Ganapathi Trust also contributed funding to a dishwasher and 36 trolleys to deliver meals to patient rooms in the hospital wards.<sup>116</sup>

### Nutritionist-developed menus and medically tailored meals

The hospital's nutritionists make recommendations to set the menu.<sup>117</sup> Rotis are a main part of the meals provided through the Sassoon General Hospital Meal Programme. The meals also include pulses, vegetables, seasonally available local fruit. Patients receive milk, buttermilk, and tea with

<sup>110</sup> "Shreevatsa," n.d., <http://www.sofosh.org/shreevatsa/>.

<sup>111</sup> "Annual Report 2016-2017" (Society of Friends of the Sassoon Hospital, 2017), <http://barnpajorden.org/Files/Tara%20Reports/SOFOSH%20Annual%20Report%202016-17.pdf>.

<sup>112</sup> "With Free Meal, Dagdusheth Trust Reaches out to Sassoon Patients," The Indian Express, 2013, <http://archive.indianexpress.com/news/with-free-meal-dagdusheth-trust-reaches-out-to-sassoon-patients/1142824/>.

<sup>113</sup> "New Kitchen at Sassoon Hospital to Cater to 1,200 Patients Daily," The Times of India, 2013, <https://timesofindia.indiatimes.com/city/pune/New-kitchen-at-Sassoon-hospital-to-cater-to-1200-patients-daily/articleshow/22044818.cms>.

<sup>114</sup> Mayuri Phadnis and 10:09 Ist, "Old Hand Donates Rs 21k to New Sassoon Kitchen," Pune Mirror, 2013, <https://punemirror.indiatimes.com/pune/cover-story/Old-hand-donates-Rs-21k-to-new-Sassoon-kitchen/articleshow/31261933.cms>.

<sup>115</sup> According to interview.

<sup>116</sup> "Sassoon: A Healthy Relationship," Ganpati Trust (blog), 2019, <http://social.dagdushethganpati.com/sassoon/>.

<sup>117</sup> "New Kitchen at Sassoon Hospital to Cater to 1,200 Patients Daily."

their meals. Patients who need a high protein diet receive eggs.

The hospital provides meals with some medical tailoring. Specifically, the catering service tailors meals for patients with high blood pressure (low sodium), diabetes (low sugar, high protein), kidney disease (low sodium, potassium, and protein), or liver disease (low fat, sugar, and salt).<sup>118</sup>

Sassoon General Hospital also provides subsidised meals for relatives of admitted patients, including undernourished children who are at the hospital with their parents.<sup>119</sup>

***“Food comes to anybody as medicine, as far as the healing is concerned.”***

– Pune interviewee

The Covid-19 coronavirus outbreak has exacerbated nutrition concerns in Sassoon and other hospitals. Both undernutrition and overnutrition weaken people’s immune systems, which makes them more likely to have infections.

## Enabling Factors for Sassoon General Hospital’s Meal Programme

### Strong NGO and philanthropic motivation

The Ganapathi Trust and Society of Friends of Sassoon Hospital both have an established history of charitable food programmes with public visibility. Therefore, they have helped drive partnerships with Pune’s healthcare facilities to provide nutritious food to patients.

### Nutrition workforce

The inclusion of nutritionists in menu creation helps with medical tailoring of food for specific patients and the illnesses they have. In addition, a focus on nutrition could potentially help make the programme more attractive and valuable for healthcare providers and the healthcare system.

### Investments in food safety and WASH infrastructure

The Sassoon General Hospital meal programme made key upfront investments in food safety and WASH, such as kitchen renovation. The programme also acquired meal carts to allow delivery of food to patient rooms. These investments enable the programme to serve a high patient volume.

## Challenges and areas for growth for Sassoon General Hospital

### Enhancing medical tailoring

One interviewee expressed that the hospital’s meals could be more health-oriented with better medical tailoring. Screening information must then be linked to menu development, at which point it is important to consider the financial costs and logistical barriers to procure medically appropriate foods.

<sup>118</sup> Menu details came from an interview.

<sup>119</sup> “Smart Nutrition Cities Building on What’s Gone before.”

### Monitoring and evaluation

It is unclear if there is any systematic monitoring and evaluation for this programme beyond the monitoring needed to carry out meal provision. There are already anecdotal improvements to patient experience. According to an interviewee, Sassoon's programme has been well-received because hospital meal provision has reduced the pressure on patients' families to bring food from the outside. That interviewee noted that Indian people are very family-oriented, especially around health. Reducing the need for families to provide food for hospitalized family members then reduces their stress, and indirectly improves their economic and food security. Therefore, it would be valuable to measure household food security changes in response to hospital meal provision.

However, there is a need for more systematic evaluations. One interviewee suggested conducting comparisons between Sassoon and other hospitals without robust meal programmes. These studies could assess outcomes such as patient food security, patient satisfaction, patient recovery times, and disease-specific health metrics such as blood pressure or blood sugar control.

Some studies have looked at how hospital meal provision can increase patient satisfaction and in-hospital nutritional outcomes. In Bangladesh, a study found that food quality influences patient satisfaction, especially in the context of bad odours, bugs in food, and poor menus.<sup>120</sup> A study in a private hospital in India found that cancer patients who received high quality patient-centred meals experienced more appropriate weight gain, higher protein intake, and patient satisfaction.<sup>121</sup> Such studies could be replicated at Sassoon to assess how tasty, culturally relevant, nutritious, and medically-tailored meals affect patient experience.

### Ensuring government buy-in

One stakeholder mentioned that the Indian government is increasingly expecting NGOs, philanthropy, and corporate social responsibility entities to conduct social protection via food procurement. Therefore, it will be important to encourage the Pune and Maharashtra governments continue to invest in initiatives like the Sassoon General Hospital meal programme.

In 2018, Pune and Birmingham, England started a joint Smart Nutrition City Initiative with support from the UK-based Food Foundation. Pune's Smart City Strategy states that it would like to:

*"...create cities with smart physical, social, institutional and economic infrastructure including clean technology use, widespread information and communication technology reliance, financing via public private partnerships and private sector investments, improved citizen consultation and 'smart' or e-governance initiatives"*

This partnership facilitates city-city learning on urban food systems, and could be a potential channel to share best practices on hospital meal programmes and expand healthy food procurement across Pune institutions.

<sup>120</sup> Laila Ashrafun and Mohammad Jasim Uddin, "Factors Determining Inpatient Satisfaction with Hospital Care in Bangladesh," *Asian Social Science* 7, no. 6 (May 31, 2011): p15, <https://doi.org/10.5539/ass.v7n6p15>.

<sup>121</sup> Esther Sathiaraj et al., "Patient-Centered Foodservice Model Improves Body Weight, Nutritional Intake and Patient Satisfaction in Patients Undergoing Cancer Treatment," *Nutrition and Cancer* 71, no. 3 (April 3, 2019): 418–23, <https://doi.org/10.1080/01635581.2018.1506490>.

## Discussion: Areas for more research, coordination, and shared learning

### 1. Potential need for a unified framework, guidance document, or process for South-South cooperation on public food procurement across multiple urban institutions. There is also a need for more coordination between food procurement and workforce nutrition.

Thanks to significant progress on LMIC school feeding, FAO and WFP have developed strong guidance on school feeding such as the Home Grown School Feeding Resource Framework.

However, there is comparatively less guidance and research on urban public food procurement for institutions like hospitals, clinics, daycare centres, senior centres, homeless shelters, and prisons that are tailored to the specific institution. Brazil's Food Acquisition Programme and the US Good Food Purchasing Program are examples of adapting successful school feeding programmes to other institutions – these experiences need to be documented and replicated. See Appendix on guidance documents that relate to urban food procurement.

GAIN could consider assessing the need for such a resource among urban food system stakeholders and workplaces. An urban public food procurement guide would need to be developed in a demand-driven and participatory manner, so that the guide can account for the assets and challenges of operating in LMIC contexts.

### 2. Explore opportunities for private sector business development in healthy food procurement.

Private sector enterprises have numerous opportunities to be involved with healthy food procurement along the food supply chain. In the Addis Ababa and Pune case studies, a combination of government, government-subsidized private sector stakeholders, NGOs, and community members contributed to their food procurement programmes.

There are roles for private sector businesses in healthy food procurement. In some cities, urban governments contract out institutional food procurement to dedicated foodservice companies. For instance, New York's public food procurement occurs through a mix of government-run channels and private foodservice companies. Ghana and Togo outsource school meal provision to catering businesses, some of which are managed by local women.<sup>122</sup> Therefore, formalized private sector actors can act as food procurement contractors for urban governments.

Beyond dedicated food procurement and foodservice, GAIN could consider working with the business sector to build food aggregation and processing capacity. Doing so could create a stronger enabling environment for healthy food procurement.

### 3. Research healthy food procurement effects on city, regional, and global food systems, in order to maintain policy coherence and avoid unintended consequences.

Institutional food procurement still represents a minority of the food system, yet it can affect both supply and demand profoundly. More research is needed on how public food procurement affects the production, market development, availability, and prices of food in the private sector that is produced and sold for individual consumption.

<sup>122</sup> "Sector Policies for Better Food Security and Nutrition Results: Public Food Procurement."



It would also be important to understand how urban food procurement interacts with government agricultural market controls, such as subsidised staple production. In Ethiopia, government-funded cooperatives handle most cereal wholesaling. Many other countries also have subsidized commodity markets or state-run enterprises.

There is also a need for research on how urban public food procurement affects peri-urban food security, since the transition from subsistence farming to selling agricultural production to an institutional market can change farmer household diets. At the same time, participation as a supplier to food procurement can increase income stability. Therefore, value chain analysis is necessary to anticipate food system-wide consequences of food procurement programmes.

More research could be done on how urban food procurement shapes individuals' demand for different types of food. There is evidence from Brazil and other case studies that school feeding programmes can increase healthy food consumption and decrease non-nutritious foods even outside of school. Understanding how healthy food procurement may shift attitudes, demand, and consumption can help urban stakeholders address the double burden of malnutrition.

Food procurement programmes also need to be put in the context of other food assistance and social safety net programmes. There are benefits and drawbacks of institutional food procurement as compared to in-kind food aid or cash transfer programming. There are also nutrition incentive programmes, particularly in the US, that subsidize food assistance beneficiaries to consume more fruits and vegetables. A multistakeholder food system coalition could do more to envision which intervention(s) is most appropriate for a given situation.

#### 4. Investigate how to increase resilience to shocks for healthy food procurement programmes

Urban food procurement programmes can be vulnerable to price shocks and market fluctuation. Programmes could potentially be insulated through increasing amounts of urban agriculture. Community gardens and farms at institutions (e.g. school farms or hospital gardens), including raising animals, are one such way to protect the supply chain by shortening it dramatically.

Contract design, capacity-building, and insurance for public food procurement is another area for further learning, both to understand maximizing programme quality and for insulating against market shocks. Increased information transparency and anticipatory financing can potentially help stakeholders adjust to otherwise unpredictable market forces.

In response to the Covid-19 pandemic, urban food system actors have adapted their public procurement programmes to serve vulnerable people. The Addis Ababa Students Feeding Agency is now coordinating with food banks to provide take home rations to students since schools are closed. New York City and other cities have dramatically scaled up home food deliveries. Institutions have altered their food provision, such as schools providing take-home rations instead of cafeteria meals.<sup>123</sup> Hence, Covid-19 is bringing about novel food provision models using repurposed food procurement infrastructure.

<sup>123</sup> Kathryn Garcia, "Feeding New York the Plan for Keeping Our City Fed During the Covid-19 Public Health Crisis" (New York City Department of Sanitation, 2020), <https://www1.nyc.gov/assets/home/downloads/pdf/reports/2020/Feeding-New-York.pdf>.

## Appendix: Detailed Background and Explanation of Methods

### Literature Analysis Protocol

#### Initial Research Questions

1. What are best practices in design and implementation of healthy food procurement policies that apply to institutions such as schools, hospitals, and workplaces – including lessons from high-income country urban contexts such as New York City?
2. What policy approaches are available for urban governments in low- and middle-income countries to promote healthy food procurement in institutions, and by what process should those approaches be selected?
3. What lessons about city healthy food procurement can we learn from the successes and failures of past healthy food procurement programmes in low- and middle-income countries?
4. What is the state of healthy food procurement and workplace nutrition in the urban case studies? How does this compare to the best practices identified in research question #1?
5. For city government officials in the urban case studies and in GAIN partner countries, what are the enabling factors and barriers to creating, implementing, and monitoring healthy food procurement policies? What can GAIN do to maximize enabling factors and opportunities, while addressing barriers?

Keywords for literature search included but were not be limited to the following within peer-reviewed and grey literature:

- **Healthy food procurement and values-based food procurement:** “good food purchasing”, “nutrition standards”, “institutional food procurement”, “healthy food procurement”, “public procurement”, “foodservice,” “procurement transparency”, “inclusive procurement”, “values-based purchasing”, “green procurement”, “city food standards”, “urban food procurement”, “food supply chain”
- **Institution-based programmes:** “[home grown] school feeding”, “school meals”, “hospital food procurement”, “canteen”, “hospital malnutrition”, “hospital meal program patient satisfaction”
- **Workforce nutrition:** “healthy cafeterias”, “workplace food environment”, “workplace health programme”, “healthy vending”

The two **urban case studies** were identified thanks to GAIN contacting the Food for Cities listserv, an FAO-curated community of urban food policy practitioners. They were chosen for inclusion based on being examples of urban food system governance intersecting with healthy food procurement in a low or middle income country intervention.

#### Defining healthy food procurement for institutions

Public procurement refers to purchasing by the public sector for all goods and services (including but not limited to food), usually from private sector actors. Public food procurement is often linked with food provision through institutions like schools, hospitals, care homes, youth clubs, prisons, and workplaces. However, food procurement programmes can also provide food through other channels such as home food deliveries to seniors or people with disabilities.

Multiple terms describe the process of improving food procurement: healthy food procurement, good food purchasing, inclusive public food procurement, local and regional procurement, and sustainable public procurement to name a few. Institutional food procurement can also be performed by private sector organizations.

Urban food systems scholar Kevin Morgan uses the term “public plate” to refer to “institutional meals and snacks prepared and served by city agencies, and meals and snacks partially or wholly funded by city funds (or by federal or state funds administered by a city agency) but prepared and served by private entities.”<sup>124</sup>

There are diverse pathways to food procurement improvement. The Good Food Purchasing Program, which originated in the Los Angeles Food Policy Council, assists US cities with institutional procurement policies. They consider five values: local economies, nutrition, valued workforce, environmental sustainability, and animal welfare.<sup>125</sup> The Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations (FAO) defines its Home Grown School Feeding model as serving food that is “safe, diverse and nutritious” and “sourced locally from smallholders.”<sup>126</sup>

Healthy food procurement supports the procuring, distributing, selling, and/or serving of healthier food in public settings to establish a healthier food environment.<sup>127</sup> Therefore, the term focuses on health and nutrition. Health Care Without Harm, an NGO that supports hospital food procurement improvement, focuses on promoting “environmental nutrition” in hospitals, which is similar to the Lancet Commission’s Sustainable Diets concept.

Sustainable public procurement, as defined by the UN Environment Programme and Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development, refers to, “A process whereby organisations meet their needs for goods, services, works and utilities in a way that achieves value for money on a whole life basis in terms of generating benefits not only to the organisation, but also to society and the economy, whilst minimising damage to the environment.”<sup>128</sup> Institutional purchasing can create a better product, while supporting health and sustainability for all supply chain members.

## Formulating an urban food procurement implementation framework

This report’s proposed implementation framework was created through synthesizing several frameworks on urban food system governance and healthy food procurement. Several key examples are highlighted here. The table on urban food procurement guides provides more detail on policy documents that discuss urban food systems or healthy food procurement. Common themes were brought together from across these frameworks as well as the urban case studies.

<sup>124</sup> Kevin Morgan, “Greening the Realm: Sustainable Food Chains and the Public Plate,” *Regional Studies* 42, no. 9 (November 1, 2008): 1237–50, <https://doi.org/10.1080/00343400802195154>.

<sup>125</sup> “Good Food Purchasing Program – Center for Good Food Purchasing,” 2019, <https://goodfoodpurchasing.org/program-overview/#values>.

<sup>126</sup> Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations and World Food Programme, *Home-Grown School Feeding: Resource Framework*, 2018.

<sup>127</sup> Raine Kim D. et al., “Healthy Food Procurement and Nutrition Standards in Public Facilities: Evidence Synthesis and Consensus Policy Recommendations,” *Health Promotion and Chronic Disease Prevention in Canada: Research, Policy and Practice* 38, no. 1 (January 2018): 6–17, <https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC5809107/>.

<sup>128</sup> “Sustainable Public Procurement Implementation Guidelines” (UNEP, 2012), <http://www.unep.fr/scp/procurement/docsres/ProjectInfo/UNEPIImplementationGuidelines.pdf>.

## GAIN Framework on Urban Governance for Nutrition

GAIN proposes a framework for strengthening nutrition governance in cities as follows:<sup>129</sup>

<b>Who –</b> Decisionmaking, coordination, and accountability	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Decisionmaking structures</li> <li>• Stakeholders involved in the political process</li> <li>• Formal and informal business sector representatives</li> <li>• Civil society organizations</li> <li>• Academics and researchers</li> <li>• Food producers and distributors, farmer organizations</li> <li>• Media</li> </ul>
<b>What –</b> Government Functions at national, subnational, and/or city levels	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Public spaces, infrastructure</li> <li>▪ Urban planning</li> <li>▪ Urban agriculture</li> <li>▪ Health, social services</li> <li>▪ Government facilities</li> <li>▪ Economic development</li> <li>▪ Waste management</li> <li>▪ Food safety, water and sanitation</li> </ul>
<b>How –</b> Policy tools to promote provision of more nutritious food	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Taxation, subsidies, or incentives</li> <li>• Public procurement specifications</li> <li>• Planning ordinances, licensing, permits, and institutional accreditation<sup>130</sup></li> <li>• Policies for government facilities</li> <li>• Guidelines, voluntary or mandatory</li> <li>• Education campaigns</li> <li>• Technical assistance</li> </ul>
<b>Where</b>	<p><b>Urban food environment</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <i>Cafes and eateries at facilities including public institutions</i></li> <li>• <i>Workplaces</i></li> <li>• <i>Childcare</i></li> <li>• <i>Schools and universities</i></li> <li>• Grocery stores and retail – small or large-scale</li> <li>• Street vendors</li> <li>• Markets</li> <li>• Urban agriculture, such as community gardens</li> </ul> <p><b>Household and individual</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Food security for nutritious food – access, affordability, ability to use food, stability</li> <li>• Food storage and cooking capability</li> <li>• Social and cultural context, preferences</li> </ul>
<b>Implementation of the Framework</b>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. <b>Identify political champions</b>, their motivations, and where they fit into the policymaking process</li> <li>2. <b>Assess the food environment</b>, government tools, and stakeholders</li> <li>3. <b>Establish a governance mechanism</b></li> <li>4. <b>Develop actions</b> and recommendations for action</li> <li>5. <b>Monitor activities, outputs, and governance outcomes</b></li> </ol>

### FAO Public Food Procurement Guidance Note

The FAO report on “Strengthening Sector Policies for Better Food Security and Nutrition Results

<sup>129</sup> Sharelle Polack, Laura Platenkamp, and Mduduzi N.N. Mbuya, “Strengthening Governance for Better Nutrition in Cities: A Framework for Assessment and Action” (GAIN, 2019),

<https://www.gainhealth.org/sites/default/files/publications/documents/strengthening-governance-for-better-nutrition-in-cities-october-2019.pdf>.

<sup>130</sup> Raine Kim D. et al., “Healthy Food Procurement and Nutrition Standards in Public Facilities: Evidence Synthesis and Consensus Policy Recommendations,” *Health Promotion and Chronic Disease Prevention in Canada : Research, Policy and Practice* 38, no. 1 (January 2018): 6–17, <https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC5809107/>.

on Public Food Procurement” discusses public food procurement with a focus on supporting smallholder farming to participate in programmes that aid food security and nutrition. The conceptual framework recommends the following steps:

1. **Conduct a situation analysis** on food production, food processing and storage, and food trade and marketing. Situation analysis should also assess which government agencies buy food, including what types, the basket provided, distribution method, frequency of provision, and where food is provided. Policymakers should map poverty and food security to identify how to best target food procurement programmes.
2. **Map the policy landscape** on policies that affect public food procurement. In particular, policymakers should assess the current state of **public procurement requirements**: Governments likely require farmers and farmer organizations to have registration (through legal, taxation, or banking entities) to ensure they can participate in contracting processes with procurement entities. Bid securities and performance guarantees set forth the procuring entity’s expectations on food producers. There may also be food safety and quality regulations that apply to food producers. Food procurement specifications put requirements on what types of foods should be produced and purchased.
3. **Address barriers to entry** for smallholder farmer participation in public procurement. There are a number of procurement mechanisms that give smallholders a competitive advantage. Doing so makes it more possible for public food procurement programmes to include smallholders.
  - **Reservation:** Set-asides, qualification criteria, and subcontracting conditions all act to reserve a certain quota of purchasing to come from a defined category of supplier, such as smallholder farmers. For example, Brazil’s home grown school feeding programme requires a quota of government purchases to come from smallholders. The School Milk Programme in Thailand is an example of a subcontracting condition. The government does not directly purchase the food; instead, a subcontractor must follow a fixed quota for purchasing from targeted producers.
  - **Preferencing:** Bid price preference and award criteria make certain types of food suppliers more competitive under point or weight systems. European Union government food purchases and Peru’s school feeding are examples of award criteria where suppliers receive additional points if they meet specific socioeconomic or environment criteria.

In summary, **public food procurement programmes need to consider the following aspects of their relationships with food suppliers**: registration requirements, bid securities and performance guarantees, food safety and quality standards, food procurement specification, ensuring on-time payments, ensuring access to information, forward contracts and advance payments, and eligibility and targeting criteria to define who are preferred food suppliers.

4. **Ensure cross-sector coordination**: a major part of public food procurement is aligning production and ideal food basket consumption. This includes following national food based dietary guidelines, and then establishing nutrition guidelines for the target groups of public food procurement. These are developed through nutritional needs assessments, and nutrient and calorie targets. Guidelines for public food procurement that apply to food suppliers should be developed with nutritional targets in mind, as well as agricultural factors

like seasonality and agro-ecological zone. Local culture and tastes should be taken into account as well. Policymakers should also consider gender-sensitive approaches to establishing the food basket. For instance, women and men tend to produce different crops, and food baskets should include women's crops.

### FAO School Feeding Legislation framework

FAO has put forth possible provisions for what school food and nutrition laws should address.<sup>131</sup>

1. **Scope and objectives, and legal definitions** to express who and what settings are covered by the law, such as canteens, kiosks, etc.
2. **Guiding principles** should include "participation, accountability, non-discrimination, transparency, human dignity, empowerment, rule of law" and protection for vulnerable people, including children with food allergies, diabetes, disabilities, or other special needs.
3. **Entitlements:** to recognize school meals as a legal entitlement for all children attending school.
4. **Institutional arrangements:** to define the roles of national and decentralized institutions
5. **Food procurement, with preference clause for local procurement:** to set forth regulatory mechanisms to link school food with local smallholder production (such as a percentage goal of the procurement budget) and to affirmatively prioritize buying from women, indigenous communities, and youth farmers.
6. **Compliance with food safety legislation and food safety requirements:** the law should include regulations to minimize risks from unsafe water, sanitation, processing, or cooking.
7. **Compliance with nutrition guidelines and standards:** the law should require that foods in the meal programmes, kiosks, and vending machines are compliant with national Food-based Dietary Guidelines and meet appropriate amounts of energy and nutrients.
8. **School Food and Nutrition Education:** the law should define how schools will integrate nutrition education into the school's curriculum.
9. **Food marketing at school:** there should be regulations around advertising and marketing targeted at children, especially for highly processed foods.
10. **Food retailing rules** ensure foods sold in schools are safe and align with nutritional guidelines.
11. **Student, parent, teacher, and community involvement** in creating menus and exercising accountability.
12. **Monitoring, accountability, and transparency, with sanctions and penalties for noncompliance.** There should be provisions that enable the public the right to information, grievance mechanisms, and the right to appeal.
13. **Budget provisions** that make clear how the programme would be financed. FAO suggests including the Ministry of Finance in annual budget reviews, and reaffirming a child's right to food at school even during times of budgetary cuts.
14. **Final and transitory provisions:** to establish a clear plan for amending and reviewing regulations

<sup>131</sup> "Legislating for Adequate Food and Nutrition in Schools" (FAO, 2019), <http://www.fao.org/3/CA3520EN/ca3520en.pdf>.

Beyond these provisions for a school feeding law, FAO recommends the implementation strategy:

1. **Create a parliamentary alliance on food security and nutrition**, and find opportunities to bring up food and nutrition in the general political agenda and parliamentary process.
2. **Ensure policy coherence** with existing legislation on nutritional standards, food safety and quality, nutrition education, and financial incentives around food and agriculture.
3. **Revise budgets to enable sustainable public funding** for food and nutrition in schools, with monitoring over expenditures and identification of spending gaps.
4. **Establish a participatory multisector drafting, consultation, and budgeting processes** that includes civil society, human rights experts, academia, local producer organizations (including women producers), child advocacy groups, teacher groups, and parent groups.
5. **Develop knowledge through training and capacity-building and South-South cooperation**

### African Procurement Law Unit framework on sustainable procurement

The following mechanisms are adapted from the African Procurement Law Unit's framework on driving sustainable procurement:<sup>132</sup>

1. **Supplier development:** City, regional, and national governments can build the capacity of farmers and food producers to enter the institutional supplier market, which may depend on creating farmer organizations who can increase collective bargaining power for small farmers.<sup>133</sup>
2. **Demand management:** Governments can create rules about procurement to meet particular institutions' needs.
3. **Bid specifications:** Criteria within institution's bidding processes.
4. **Qualification of suppliers:** Governments and institutional purchasers can require that suppliers meet a certain profile, such as a certain portion being small businesses or local. Purchasers can also exclude suppliers based on concerns about sustainability or corruption.
5. **Performance management, monitoring, feedback, and capacity building:** This includes reporting rules, and rules around training officials and staff to respond to feedback.
6. **Contract implementation:** Rules to check that contracts are being implemented as agreed.
7. **Subcontracting:** Rules on subcontracting can help encourage larger suppliers or supplier organizations to engage with smaller local farmers or producers. Subcontracting rules also prevent abuse or mismanagement of funds.

<sup>132</sup> Based on interview and webinar delivered by Geo Quinot

<sup>133</sup> Kelly and Swensson, *Leveraging Institutional Food Procurement for Linking Small Farmers to Markets*. Kelly and Swensson.

## Guides and policy documents on urban food systems and public food procurement

	Specific to urban food policy	Global context	Specific to LMIC context	Discusses food procurement	Types of institutions	Technical guidance on procurement	Summary notes
GAIN " <a href="#">Strengthening governance for better nutrition in cities</a> "	Yes	Yes	No	No	N/A	Yes	Describes a general framework for creating urban multi-stakeholder governance and developing enacting policy as part of Urban Governance for Nutrition activities
GAIN-MUFFP-RUAF " <a href="#">A menu of actions to shape urban food environments for improved nutrition</a> "	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Schools, hospitals	No	Describes wide range of case studies and potential urban food policy actions
MUFPP Monitoring Framework, <a href="#">Indicator 38 on public food procurement</a>	Yes	Yes	No	No	All public institutions	Yes – provides tools to measure good food purchasing	One of many documents proposing some guidance on how to measure MUFPP commitments
FAO " <a href="#">Strengthening Sector Policies for Better Food Security and Nutrition Results: Public Food Procurement</a> "	No, but discusses local/regional multisectoral governance	Yes	Yes	Yes	All public institutions	Yes	Provides a high-level technical guide to creating public food procurement policies, with inclusion of legal instruments for procurement
FAO/WFP " <a href="#">Home Grown School Feeding Resource Framework</a> "	No, but discusses decentralised systems	Yes	Yes	Yes	Schools	Yes	Provides technical guidance on home grown school feeding, with case studies pulled mainly from African countries



	Specific to urban food policy	Global context	Specific to LMIC context	Discusses food procurement	Types of institutions	Technical guidance on procurement	Summary notes
<a href="#">EAT Shifting Urban Diets</a> (forthcoming) and <a href="#">C40 Good Food Cities Declaration</a>	Yes	Yes	No	Maybe	Likely all public institutions AND private sector	No	EAT Forum encourages food procurement as part of achieving sustainable diets; it's included as part of C40 Good Food Cities Declaration. The Shifting Urban Diets project is newly launched and will focus on Copenhagen.
<a href="#">Good Food Purchasing Program - Report on NYC</a>	Yes	No – US only	No	Yes	All public institutions	Yes (if city participates in GFPP)	Assists US city governments and food policy councils with implementing public food procurement according to values-based guidelines
<a href="#">Health Care Without Harm – Healthy Food in Health Care programme</a>	No, but focuses on local and regional hospital systems	Yes	No	Yes	Hospitals and clinics	Yes	HCWH assists North American and European hospitals on healthy/sustainable food procurement
<a href="#">Soil Association Food for Life</a>	No, but sometimes focuses on single institutions like hospitals	No – UK only	No	Yes	Hospitals, schools, nurseries, care homes	Yes but some technical guidance depends on being a partner organization	Food for Life assists a variety of UK-based institutions to carry out healthy/sustainable food procurement
<a href="#">UNSCN Urban-Rural Linkages for Nutrition and UN Environment Urban Rural Linkages Guiding Principles</a>	Yes	Yes	Yes	No – only briefly discusses Brazil	N/A	No	Describes proposed urban-rural actions to improve nutrition, with brief discussion of food procurement.

## Interview Plan

This project is supported by a Duke University Institutional Review Board IRB-Exempt protocol #2020-0253. I will interview the stakeholders mentioned below and will analyse transcripts for key themes. I will reach out to as many as 5. Based on their recommendations for further contacts as part of “snowball sampling”, I will start a second round of expert interviews to bring the total interviews up to 10. The participants’ names, email addresses, phone numbers, and Skype/Zoom IDs, and organizational affiliations will be kept during the interviewing process. Those identifiers will be deleted after recruitment is complete unless the interviewee consents to staying in touch.

Interviews will be audio-recorded and transcribed, with audio files subsequently deleted once transcription and matching to notes is complete. All participants will be assigned an alphanumeric identifier, for which the key (which will contain names and organizational affiliations) will reside in a separate secured electronic file to minimize risk of disclosing participant information. In the final paper, the organizations and affiliations of participants will be reported in an aggregate manner with the participant’s consent, but without identifying any individual specifically.

The number of urban case studies (2 or 3) is small enough that the identities of certain stakeholders could be inferred from a report. However, we will maximize our efforts to ensure any opinions are expressed in general and diplomatic terms so as to minimize reputational risk.

### Interview recruitment script

Potential interviewees will be contacted via email as follows:

*“Dear [Name],*

*My name is Julian Xie, and I’m an MD/MPP dual degree student studying medicine and public policy at Duke University and writing a master’s project on institutional food procurement in partnership with the Global Alliance for Improved Nutrition. I am interviewing experts and key stakeholders to learn about current practices in institutional food procurement and what opportunities there are to elevate health and nutrition. [Contact] suggested I get in touch with you to talk more about this topic. Please let me know if you might have time for a 30 minute conversation about healthy food procurement?”*

### Interview guide

The following script will be used to introduce the project and ask for consent from interviewees:

*“Thank you making time to speak with me! I’m an MD/MPP dual degree student studying medicine and public policy at Duke University and writing a master’s project on healthy food procurement. I am interviewing experts and key stakeholders to learn about current practices in institutional food procurement and what opportunities there are to elevate health, nutrition, and sustainability. When we talk about institutional food procurement or good food purchasing, I am referring to policies that support or even require institutions like schools and hospitals to purchase healthy food from local farmers to provide to students, patients, and employees. The interview should take no more than 45 minutes. During this time, I will ask for your honest opinion. When I write up what we talk about, I will de-identify the information and use nicknames to make nothing can be identified directly as something you said. However, if you are comfortable having quotes and information attached to your name, please say so now and I will take note of that.*

*In addition, I would like to record audio of this interview so that I can revisit it and write notes. This recording will help speed up the interview so we don't have to repeat too many things, and will be used only for my research, but will not be released publicly. I plan to provide you a copy of my report after I have completed it. Is it okay if I record?"*

### Experts and stakeholders in high-income contexts

- **Geo Quinot**, Director of the African Procurement Law Unit, Professor in the Department of Public Law at Stellenbosch University, South Africa
- **Emily Johnson**, Cross Systems Planner, Washington DC Office of Planning, US
- **Kate MacKenzie**, Director of the New York City Office of Food Policy, US
- **Justin Varney**, Director of Public Health, City of Birmingham, UK
- **Alexa Delwiche**, Executive Director, Good Food Purchasing Program
- **Janet Poppendieck**, Professor of Sociology at Hunter College, City University of New York and author of "Free for All: Fixing School Food in America"
- **Daniel Balaban**, Director, World Food Programme (WFP) Home Grown School Feeding Center for Excellence

Each interview will include the following questions listed, but some questions may be omitted or added based on who the interviewee is or the direction of the discussion:

1. What are reasons for city governments to work towards healthier procurement practices and policies?
  - a. How should this role interact with that of national, regional, and international policies?
2. When you worked on [healthy food procurement policy relevant for expert], what was the process to develop that policy?
3. What technical assistance was needed? [What knowledge gaps were there?]
4. Who were the champions that helped advocate for the policy?
5. Are there parties who opposed or felt uncertain these changes?
6. How was this programme implemented?
7. Were there any challenges that took place with implementation? If so, what were they?
8. What funding was required to implement and sustain the policy, and what were those funds used for?
9. Who else would be important to discuss with to learn more about this issue?

### Supplemental questions

10. What exceptions or exemptions are appropriate to make policies flexible enough for smaller workplaces or institutions to be included?
11. How would you prioritize the different components of good food purchasing, such as healthiness, environmental sustainability, labour considerations, etc?
12. How did you balance potentially competing priorities, such as keeping food low-cost and affordable for the consumer vs. making sure there were healthy and fresh options?

### City case study stakeholder interviewees

GAIN reached out to a number of partners including through professional contacts and email lists to determine a potential set of cities in which to do interviews and focused case studies. GAIN will connect me to city officials, institution representatives, foodservice directors, and civil service organization representatives in countries where the Urban Governance for Nutrition and Workforce Nutrition programmes operate. The recruitment process will be for GAIN staff in country offices (or

GAIN contacts) to make electronic introductions between myself and the interviewee. This will be important in guiding GAIN's technical assistance to cities in assisting them with enacting urban food governance and workplace nutrition policy change. The interview will follow human-centred design principles to assess the needs, perspectives, and motivations or pain points for city officials in relevant ministries. The target number of city stakeholder interviews is 10.

### Addis Ababa

- **Meti Tamrat**, Director, Addis Ababa Students Feeding Agency
- **Belayneh Zelelew Negash**, Senior Monitoring and Evaluation Expert, Enat Weg Charitable Association
- **Hana Yemane Wodajo**, Senior Project Manager, GAIN Ethiopia
- **Esubalew Abate**, Assistant Professor, Addis Ababa University College of Development Studies
- **Abiy Johannes**, completed a masters thesis on Enat Weg Charitable Association school feeding

### Pune

- **Dr Bhushana Karandikar**, Research Collaborator and Development Consultant on Food Safety, Food Markets, and Nutrition Initiatives with Farmers' Associations
  - **Dr Jayashree Toddkar**, Bariatric Surgeon and Head of Maharashtra Obesity Task Force
1. Tell me about the work that you do and the people that you serve.
  2. How are healthy food procurement practices established now?
  3. How much have you worked on or thought about healthy food procurement? How important is this issue to you?
    - a. [What is the incentive to improve food procurement? What's in it for you?]
  4. Where do you get information about nutrition and making procurement nutrition-sensitive?
  5. Tell me about the partners you worked on to make healthy food procurement? Tell me more about what it was like to work with them.
    - a. What was the role of NGOs? Donors? Private sector?
    - b. [In the case of Addis Ababa, the city-run School Feeding programme is not the first of its kind, but rather scales up, complements, and possibly replaces NGO-run school feeding. We would like to understand better how this transition was.]
  6. What city outcomes are most relevant for you? What is your government looking for?
  7. How have your citizens/clients/beneficiaries/stakeholders responded to healthy food procurement?
  8. Thinking about outcomes, what are the things that matter to you and your department, for instance health outcomes, educational outcomes, farmer livelihood improvement, gender equality, reduction of government spending, etc?
  9. What factors help or restrict you to work on institutional food procurement? Why or why not?
    - a. [If interviewee needs to be prompted] Some examples include: funding, demand from citizens/constituents, knowledge about the issue itself, staff capacity, high-level political buy-in such as from a mayor, the promise of good outcomes, industry interference, and regional or national policies.
  10. Are there any incentives for you to collaborate with other government departments, civil society, or the private sector?
  11. For any healthy food procurement projects you work on, how do you plan to expand or scale up those projects, and ensure they are long-lasting?
  12. What else would be important to discuss? Do you have colleagues we should talk to?

## Works Cited

- "62 Acute Care Hospitals in New York City," 2014. <https://www.beckershospitalreview.com/lists/62-acute-care-hospitals-in-new-york-city.html>.
- United Nations Department of Economic and Social Affairs. "68% of the World Population Projected to Live in Urban Areas by 2050, Says UN," May 16, 2018. <https://www.un.org/development/desa/en/news/population/2018-revision-of-world-urbanization-prospects.html>.
- "A Milestone in Developing Food-Based Dietary Guidelines for Ethiopia," 2019. <https://a4nh.cgiar.org/2019/07/10/a-milestone-in-developing-food-based-dietary-guidelines-for-ethiopia/>.
- Adal, Melaku. "Systematic Review on HIV Situation in Addis Ababa, Ethiopia." *BMC Public Health* 19, no. 1 (December 2019): 1544. <https://doi.org/10.1186/s12889-019-7885-8>.
- Ezega News. "Addis Ababa City to Establish 'Students Feeding Agency,'" 2019. <https://www.ezega.com/News/NewsDetails/7554/Addis-Ababa-City-to-Establish-Students-Feeding-Agency->.
- "Addis Ababa to Set up Agency to Run Free Meal Program – Ethiopian Monitor," 2020. <https://ethiopianmonitor.com/2020/01/25/addis-ababa-to-set-up-agency-to-run-free-meal-program/>.
- Addis Negari Gazeta of the City Government of Addis Ababa. Addis Ababa City Government School Feeding Agency Procedure Regulation, Pub. L. No. Regulation No.112/2020 (2020). Available on request.
- Ethiopian Press Agency. "Addis Renewing Schools, Building Feeding Facilities for the New Academic Year," 2019. <https://www.press.et/english/?p=9468>.
- Ethiopian Press Agency. "Addis' School Feeding Program Eyeing to Downsize Dropouts," 2019. <https://www.press.et/english/?p=14207>.
- "Annual Report 2016-2017." Society of Friends of the Sassoon Hospital, 2017. <http://barnpajorden.org/Files/Tara%20Reports/SOFOSH%20Annual%20Report%202016-17.pdf>.
- "As Drought Stokes Urban Hunger, Ethiopia Dishes up Free School Meals." *Reuters*, July 8, 2019. <https://www.reuters.com/article/us-climate-change-ethiopia-drought-idUSKCN1U30RW>.
- Ashrafun, Laila, and Mohammad Jasim Uddin. "Factors Determining Inpatient Satisfaction with Hospital Care in Bangladesh." *Asian Social Science* 7, no. 6 (May 31, 2011): p15. <https://doi.org/10.5539/ass.v7n6p15>.
- Av, Ganpule-Rao, Roy D, Karandikar Ba, Yajnik Cs, and Rush Ec. "Food Access and Nutritional Status of Rural Adolescents in India: Pune Maternal Nutrition Study." *American Journal of Preventive Medicine*, January 22, 2020. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.amepre.2019.10.017>.
- AWiB. "Freallem Shibabaw." AWiB, 2016. <https://www.awib.org.et/currency/pinnacle/item/919-freallem-shibabaw.html>.
- Bento, Bruna M. A., Andressa da C. Moreira, Ariene S. do Carmo, Luana C. Dos Santos, and Paula M. Horta. "A Higher Number of School Meals Is Associated with a Less-Processed Diet." *Jornal De Pediatria* 94, no. 4 (August 2018): 404–9. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpmed.2017.07.016>.
- "'Best Buys' and Other Recommended Interventions for the Prevention and Control of Noncommunicable Diseases." World Health Organization, 2017. [https://www.who.int/ncds/management/WHO\\_Appendix\\_BestBuys.pdf](https://www.who.int/ncds/management/WHO_Appendix_BestBuys.pdf).
- Board on Global Health, Institute of Medicine, Division of Behavioral and Social Sciences and Education, and National Academies of Sciences, Engineering, and Medicine. *Supporting Family and Community Investments in Young Children Globally: Summary of a Joint Workshop*. Edited by Jocelyn Widmer. Washington, D.C.: National Academies Press, 2016. <https://doi.org/10.17226/21883>.
- "Brazil's Policies to Guarantee Food Rights." The Food Foundation, Institute of Development Studies, 2017. [https://foodfoundation.org.uk/wp-content/uploads/2017/07/5-Briefing-Brazil\\_vF.pdf](https://foodfoundation.org.uk/wp-content/uploads/2017/07/5-Briefing-Brazil_vF.pdf).
- "Bringing the Good Food Purchasing Program to New York City Barriers and Facilitators for Select Institutions." CUNY Urban Food Policy Institute, 2019. [https://static1.squarespace.com/static/572d0fcc2b8dde9e10ab59d4/t/5d12735703f941000147c234/1561490267771/GFPF\\_NoVo\\_Report\\_06-24-2019\\_Full\\_Report\\_June.pdf](https://static1.squarespace.com/static/572d0fcc2b8dde9e10ab59d4/t/5d12735703f941000147c234/1561490267771/GFPF_NoVo_Report_06-24-2019_Full_Report_June.pdf).
- CUNY Urban Food Policy Institute. "Bringing the Good Food Purchasing Program to NYC," 2019. <https://www.cunyurbanfoodpolicy.org/news/2019/5/23/bringing-the-good-food-purchasing-program-to-nyc>.
- "BUDGET The 'Mwananchi' Guide 19/20." Kenya National Treasury and Planning, 2019. <http://www.treasury.go.ke/component/jdownloads/send/201-2019-2020/1443-budget-highlights-19-20.html>.

- Christina Nyhus Dhillon, and Bärbel Weiligmann. "The Evidence for Workforce Nutrition Programmes." Global Alliance for Improved Nutrition (GAIN), 2019.  
<https://www.gainhealth.org/sites/default/files/publications/documents/evidence-for-workforce-nutrition-programmes-overview-2019.pdf>.
- "Cost-Benefit Analysis School Feeding Investment Case." WFP, 2016.  
<https://docs.wfp.org/api/documents/86593db964f34dada0840ec47d2bad3d/download/>.
- Global Nutrition Report. "Country Nutrition Profiles," 2020. <https://globalnutritionreport.org/resources/nutrition-profiles/>.
- Courtney Scott. "Pune Nutrition Situation and Stakeholder Mapping." The Food Foundation, 2018.  
<https://foodfoundation.org.uk/wp-content/uploads/2019/10/Pune-situation-analysis.pdf>.
- Cronk, Ryan, and Jamie Bartram. "Environmental Conditions in Health Care Facilities in Low- and Middle-Income Countries: Coverage and Inequalities." *International Journal of Hygiene and Environmental Health* 221, no. 3 (April 1, 2018): 409–22. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijheh.2018.01.004>.
- Darebo, Teshale, Addisalem Mesfin, and Samson Gebremedhin. "Prevalence and Factors Associated with Overweight and Obesity among Adults in Hawassa City, Southern Ethiopia: A Community Based Cross-Sectional Study." *BMC Obesity* 6 (2019). <https://doi.org/10.1186/s40608-019-0227-7>.
- Debnath, Dhruvajyoti J, and Chandrakant V Parulekar. "Profile of Under-Five Malnourished Children Admitted in a Tertiary Care Teaching Hospital in Pune, India." *International Journal of Preventive Medicine* 5, no. 7 (July 2014): 882–86. <https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC4124566/>.
- Donald Bundy, Susan Horton, Nilanthi de Silva, Dean Jamison, and George Patton. "Re-Imagining School Feeding: A High-Return Investment in Human Capital and Local Economies." World Bank, 2018.  
<http://dcp-3.org/schoolfeeding>.
- Drake, Lesley, Alice Woolnough, Carmen Burbano, and Donald A. P. Bundy. "Global School Feeding Sourcebook : Lessons from 14 Countries." The World Bank, January 1, 2016.  
<http://documents.worldbank.org/curated/en/764611468197374242/Global-school-feeding-sourcebook-lessons-from-14-countries>.
- Epel, Elissa S., Alison Hartman, Laurie M. Jacobs, Cindy Leung, Michael A. Cohn, Leeane Jensen, Laura Ishkanian, et al. "Association of a Workplace Sales Ban on Sugar-Sweetened Beverages With Employee Consumption of Sugar-Sweetened Beverages and Health." *JAMA Internal Medicine*, October 28, 2019, 1–8. <https://doi.org/10.1001/jamainternmed.2019.4434>.
- Global Nutrition Report. "Ethiopia," 2019. <https://globalnutritionreport.org/resources/nutrition-growth-commitment-tracking/ethiopia/>.
- allAfrica.com. "Ethiopia: Addis Allocates 44b Br Budget," July 17, 2018.  
<https://allafrica.com/stories/201807170719.html>.
- SUN. "Ethiopia Commits to Ending Undernutrition by 2030 with the Seqota Declaration," July 21, 2015.  
<https://scalingupnutrition.org/news/ethiopia-commits-to-ending-under-nutrition-by-2030-with-the-seqota-declaration/>.
- "Ethiopia Country Programme Document 2012-2015." UNICEF, 2011.  
[https://www.unicef.org/about/execboard/files/Ethiopia\\_final\\_approved\\_2012-2015\\_20\\_Oct\\_2011.pdf](https://www.unicef.org/about/execboard/files/Ethiopia_final_approved_2012-2015_20_Oct_2011.pdf).
- "Ethiopia Demographic and Health Survey." Central Statistical Agency Addis Ababa, Ethiopia, 2017.  
<https://dhsprogram.com/pubs/pdf/FR328/FR328.pdf>.
- DANIDA. "Ethiopia: Yoghurt Enhance Poor Farmers' Income and Delivers Improved Nutrition," 2017.  
<http://etiopien.um.dk/en/danida-en/stories-and-resulst-1/ethiopia-yoghurt-boosting-poor-farmers-earnings-and-ensures-better-nutrition/>.
- Ethiopian Airlines. "Ethiopian Signs MoU with Office of the First Lady and 'Ye Enat Weg' Charity Organization to Feed School Children Who Need Help - November 13, 2015," 2015.  
<https://corporate.ethiopianairlines.com/Press-release-open-page/ethiopian-signs-mou-with-office-of-the-first-lady-and-ye-enat-weg-charity-organization-to-feed-school-children-who-need-help---november-13-2015>.
- HumanitarianResponse. "Ethio-Telecom Donates 5.2 Million Birr for School Feeding (WIC)," 2015.  
<https://www.humanitarianresponse.info/en/operations/ethiopia/article/ethio-telecom-donates-52-million-birr-school-feeding-wic>.
- "FAO Framework for the Urban Food Agenda." Food and Agriculture Organization, 2019.  
<http://www.fao.org/3/ca3151en/CA3151EN.pdf>.

- Addis Standard. "Feature: 'Feeding School Children Is Not Charity, It Is Our Duty and It Is Their Right': Frealem Shibabaw," November 19, 2019. <https://addisstandard.com/feature-feeding-school-children-is-not-charity-it-is-our-duty-and-it-is-their-right-frealem-shibabaw/>.
- "Final Evaluation of WFP'S USDA McGovern-Dole International Food for Education and Child Nutrition Programme's Support in Afar and Somali Regions in Ethiopia 2013–2017." WFP, 2018. <http://mokoro.co.uk/wp-content/uploads/WFP-0000101695.pdf>.
- "Food & Cities: The Role of Cities for Achieving the Sustainable Development Goals." Barilla Center for Food & Nutrition Foundation and Milan Urban Food Policy Pact, 2018. [http://www.milanurbanfoodpolicypact.org/wp-content/uploads/2019/04/food\\_cities.pdf](http://www.milanurbanfoodpolicypact.org/wp-content/uploads/2019/04/food_cities.pdf).
- Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations, and World Food Programme. *Home-Grown School Feeding: Resource Framework*, 2018.
- Global Alliance for Improved Nutrition (GAIN). "Better Nutrition for a Healthier Workforce." Global Alliance for Improved Nutrition (GAIN), July 2019. <https://doi.org/10.36072/cp.1>.
- Global Panel on Agriculture and Food Systems for Nutrition. "Food Systems and Diets: Facing the Challenges of the 21st Century." IFPRI, 2016. <http://www.ifpri.org/publication/food-systems-and-diets-facing-challenges-21st-century>.
- "Good Food Purchasing Program – Center for Good Food Purchasing," 2019. <https://goodfoodpurchasing.org/program-overview/#values>.
- Ethiopian Press Agency. "Government Revises Public Procurement for School Feeding Program," 2019. <https://www.press.et/english/?p=15644>.
- "Impact of School Feeding Program Case of Ye Enat Weg Charitable Association and CFPA." Et Alim Trading Plc, 2018. <https://agriprofocus.com/post/5d9acbf26b72a36856608c5> (full report available by request).
- Global Nutrition Report. "India Nutrition Profile," 2020. <https://globalnutritionreport.org/resources/nutrition-profiles/>.
- World Bank Blogs. "Is Public Procurement a Rich Country's Policy?," 2016. <https://blogs.worldbank.org/governance/public-procurement-rich-country-s-policy>.
- Jess Halliday, Laura Platenkamp, and Yota Nicolarea. "A Menu of Actions to Shape Urban Food Environments for Improved Nutrition." GAIN, MUFPP, and RUAF, 2019. <https://www.gainhealth.org/sites/default/files/publications/documents/gain-mufpp-ruaf-a-menu-of-actions-to-shape-urban-food-environments-for-improved-nutrition-october-2019.pdf>.
- Kathryn Garcia. "Feeding New York the Plan for Keeping Our City Fed During the Covid-19 Public Health Crisis." New York City Department of Sanitation, 2020. <https://www1.nyc.gov/assets/home/downloads/pdf/reports/2020/Feeding-New-York.pdf>.
- Kelly, Siobhan, and Luana Swensson. *Leveraging Institutional Food Procurement for Linking Small Farmers to Markets: Findings from WFP's Purchase for Progress Initiative and Brazil's Food Procurement Programmes*. FAO Agricultural Development Economics Technical Study 1. Rome: Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations, 2017.
- Kim D., Raine, Atkey Kayla, Dana Lee Dana Lee, Ferdinands Alexa R., Beaulieu Dominique, Buhler Susan, Campbell Norm, et al. "Healthy Food Procurement and Nutrition Standards in Public Facilities: Evidence Synthesis and Consensus Policy Recommendations." *Health Promotion and Chronic Disease Prevention in Canada: Research, Policy and Practice* 38, no. 1 (January 2018): 6–17. <https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC5809107/>.
- Kitaoka, Kaori. "The National School Meal Program in Brazil: A Literature Review." *The Japanese Journal of Nutrition and Dietetics* 76, no. Supplement (July 1, 2018): S115–25. <https://doi.org/10.5264/eiyogakuzashi.76.S115>.
- Laur, Celia, James McCullough, Bridget Davidson, and Heather Keller. "Becoming Food Aware in Hospital: A Narrative Review to Advance the Culture of Nutrition Care in Hospitals." *Healthcare* 3, no. 2 (June 2015): 393–407. <https://doi.org/10.3390/healthcare3020393>.
- "Legislating for Adequate Food and Nutrition in Schools." FAO, 2019. <http://www.fao.org/3/CA3520EN/ca3520en.pdf>.
- Lim, Su Lin, Kian Chung Benjamin Ong, Yiong Huak Chan, Wai Chiong Loke, Maree Ferguson, and Lynne Daniels. "Malnutrition and Its Impact on Cost of Hospitalization, Length of Stay, Readmission and 3-Year Mortality." *Clinical Nutrition* 31, no. 3 (June 1, 2012): 345–50. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.clnu.2011.11.001>.
- Luana Swensson. "Aligning Public Procurement Rules and Practices to Support the Implementation of Home-Grown School Feeding (HGSF) Initiatives: The Case of Ethiopia." FAO, 2019. <http://www.fao.org/3/CA3614EN/ca3614en.pdf>.

- The Indian Express. "Malnutrition Cases in Maharashtra Under-Reported, Finds Survey," 2018. <https://indianexpress.com/article/india/malnutrition-cases-in-maharashtra-under-reported-finds-survey-nfhs-4-5138960/>.
- Mamulwar, Megha S, Hetalk Rathod, Sumit Jethani, Anjali Dhone, Tanu Bakshi, Balkrishna Lanjewar, Sudhir Jadhav, and Jitendra S Bhawalkar. "Nutritional Status of Under-Five Children in Urban Slums of Pune." *International Journal of Medicine and Public Health* 4, no. 3 (2014): 247. <https://doi.org/10.4103/2230-8598.137710>.
- Mario Gyoeri, Ana Carla Miranda, and Fábio Veras Soares. "Linking Vulnerable Smallholder Farmers to School Feeding Programmes: The Experience of PAA Africa." International Policy Centre for Inclusive Growth, UNDP, 2016. [https://www.ipc-undp.org/pub/eng/PIF36\\_Food\\_and\\_nutrition\\_security.pdf](https://www.ipc-undp.org/pub/eng/PIF36_Food_and_nutrition_security.pdf).
- Mayuri Phadnis, and 10:09 Ist. "Old Hand Donates Rs 21k to New Sassoon Kitchen." *Pune Mirror*, 2013. <https://punemirror.indiatimes.com/pune/cover-story/Old-hand-donates-Rs-21k-to-new-Sassoon-kitchen/articleshow/31261933.cms>.
- Melanie Hartzog. "The City of New York Preliminary Budget Fiscal Year 2021." New York City Office of Management and Budget, 2020. <https://www1.nyc.gov/assets/omb/downloads/pdf/sum1-20.pdf>.
- "Milan Urban Food Policy Pact Monitoring Framework, Indicator 38: Proportion of Food Procurement Expenditure by Public Institutions on Food from Sustainable, Ethical Sources and Shorter (Local/Regional) Supply Chains," 2018. <http://www.milanurbanfoodpolicypact.org/wp-content/uploads/2018/08/Food-supply-distribution-Indicator-38-Procurement-expenditure-on-food-V3.pdf>.
- Morgan, Kevin. "Greening the Realm: Sustainable Food Chains and the Public Plate." *Regional Studies* 42, no. 9 (November 1, 2008): 1237–50. <https://doi.org/10.1080/00343400802195154>.
- "National School Health and Nutrition Strategy." Ministry of Education, Ethiopia, 2012. [https://www.iapb.org/wp-content/uploads/Ethiopia\\_National-School-Health-Nutrition-Strategy.pdf](https://www.iapb.org/wp-content/uploads/Ethiopia_National-School-Health-Nutrition-Strategy.pdf).
- NRDC. "Nation's Largest School Districts to Procure Antibiotic-Free Chicken," 2014. <https://www.nrdc.org/media/2014/141209-0>.
- Nethan, Suzanne, Dhirendra Sinha, and Ravi Mehrotra. "Non Communicable Disease Risk Factors and Their Trends in India." *Asian Pacific Journal of Cancer Prevention : APJCP* 18, no. 7 (2017): 2005–10. <https://doi.org/10.22034/APJCP.2017.18.7.2005>.
- The Times of India. "New Kitchen at Sassoon Hospital to Cater to 1,200 Patients Daily," 2013. <https://timesofindia.indiatimes.com/city/pune/New-kitchen-at-Sassoon-hospital-to-cater-to-1200-patients-daily/articleshow/22044818.cms>.
- "NICU Inaugurated at Sassoon Hospital in Pune." *Web India* 123, 2017. <https://news.webindia123.com/news/articles/India/20170417/3094814.html>.
- "Nutrition: At Work and in City Facilities - NYC Health," 2020. <https://www1.nyc.gov/site/doh/health/health-topics/healthy-workplaces.page>.
- World Food Programme. "Purchase for Progress," 2019. <https://www.wfp.org/purchase-for-progress>.
- Ganpati Trust. "Sassoon: A Healthy Relationship," 2019. <http://social.dagdushethganpati.com/sassoon/>.
- Sathiaraj, Esther, Krishna Priya, Shalini Chakraborty, and Revathi Rajagopal. "Patient-Centered Foodservice Model Improves Body Weight, Nutritional Intake and Patient Satisfaction in Patients Undergoing Cancer Treatment." *Nutrition and Cancer* 71, no. 3 (April 3, 2019): 418–23. <https://doi.org/10.1080/01635581.2018.1506490>.
- "Schools as a System to Improve Nutrition A New Statement for School-Based Food and Nutrition Interventions." United Nations System Standing Committee on Nutrition, 2017. <https://www.unscn.org/uploads/web/news/document/School-Paper-EN-WEB.pdf>.
- "Sector Policies for Better Food Security and Nutrition Results: Public Food Procurement." FAO, 2018. <http://www.fao.org/3/CA2281EN/ca2281en.pdf>.
- Semonegna. "First Lady Roman Tesfaye, CFP Promote the Welfare of Women & Children." *Semonegna Ethiopia* (blog), January 16, 2019. <https://semonegna.com/first-lady-roman-tesfaye-cfp-promote-women-children-welfare/>.
- Shrayana Bhattacharya Vanita Leah Falcao Raghav Puri. "The Public Distribution System in India: Policy Evolution and Program Delivery Trends." In *The 1.5 Billion People Question: Food, Vouchers, or Cash Transfers?*, edited by Shrayana Bhattacharya, Vanita Leah Falcao, and Raghav Puri, 43–105. The World Bank, 2017. [https://doi.org/10.1596/978-1-4648-1087-9\\_ch2](https://doi.org/10.1596/978-1-4648-1087-9_ch2).
- "Shreevatsa," n.d. <http://www.sofosh.org/shreevatsa/>.



- Simeon Djankov. "How Large Is Public Procurement in Developing Countries?" Peterson Institute for International Economics, November 7, 2016. <https://www.piie.com/blogs/realtime-economic-issues-watch/how-large-public-procurement-developing-countries>.
- Singh, Abhijeet, Albert Park, and Stefan Dercon. "School Meals as a Safety Net: An Evaluation of the Midday Meal Scheme in India." *Economic Development and Cultural Change* 62, no. 2 (2014): 275–306. [https://econpapers.repec.org/article/ucpecdecc/doi\\_3a10.1086\\_2f674097.htm](https://econpapers.repec.org/article/ucpecdecc/doi_3a10.1086_2f674097.htm).
- "Smart Nutrition Cities Building on What's Gone before." The Food Foundation, 2019. <https://foodfoundation.org.uk/wp-content/uploads/2019/10/Nutrition-Smart-Case-Studies.pdf>.
- Sonja Vermeulen, Laura Wellesley, Sam Airey, Sudhvir Singh, Rina Agustina, Doddy Izwardy, and Diah Saminarsih. "Healthy Diets from Sustainable Production: Indonesia." Chatham House Hoffman Centre for Sustainable Resource Economy, EAT, 2019. <https://www.chathamhouse.org/sites/default/files/images/2019-01-24-Vermeulenetal.pdf#page=36>.
- "Study on Situation of Out of School Children (OOSC) in Ethiopia." Ministry of Education and UNICEF, 2012. [https://www.unicef.org/ethiopia/media/1426/file/Study%20on%20Situation%20of%20Out%20of%20School%20Children%20\(OOSC\)%20in%20Ethiopia.pdf](https://www.unicef.org/ethiopia/media/1426/file/Study%20on%20Situation%20of%20Out%20of%20School%20Children%20(OOSC)%20in%20Ethiopia.pdf).
- "Sustainable Public Procurement Implementation Guidelines." UNEP, 2012. <http://www.unep.fr/scp/procurement/docsres/ProjectInfo/UNEPImplementationGuidelines.pdf>.
- Swensson, Luana. *Institutional Procurement of Food from Smallholder Farmers: The Case of Brazil*, 2015.
- "Systemic Food Assistance: WFP's Strategy for Leveraging Food Assistance to Improve Food System Performance." World Food Programme, 2018. <https://www.wfp.org/publications/systemic-food-assistance-wfp%E2%80%99s-strategy-leveraging-food-assistance-improve-food-system-perfo>.
- Tappenden, Kelly A., Beth Quatrara, Melissa L. Parkhurst, Ainsley M. Malone, Gary Fanjiang, and Thomas R. Ziegler. "Critical Role of Nutrition in Improving Quality of Care: An Interdisciplinary Call to Action to Address Adult Hospital Malnutrition." *Journal of the Academy of Nutrition and Dietetics*, 2013. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jand.2013.05.015>.
- Tegegne, Teketo Kassaw, and Mitike Molla Sisay. "Menstrual Hygiene Management and School Absenteeism among Female Adolescent Students in Northeast Ethiopia." *BMC Public Health* 14 (October 29, 2014). <https://doi.org/10.1186/1471-2458-14-1118>.
- Tsui, E. K., J. Wurwarg, J. Poppendieck, J. Deutsch, and N. Freudenberg. "Institutional Food as a Lever for Improving Health in Cities: The Case of New York City." *Public Health* 129, no. 4 (April 1, 2015): 303–9. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.puhe.2014.12.006>.
- "UNSCN Discussion Paper Urban-Rural Linkages for Nutrition. Territorial Approaches for Sustainable Development." UNSCN, 2020. <https://www.unscn.org/en/unscn-publications?idnews=2024>.
- "Urban Food Retail in Africa: The Case of Addis Ababa, Ethiopia." Ethiopian Development Research Institute and IFPRI, 2013. [http://essp.ifpri.info/files/2011/04/ESSP\\_WP50\\_UrbanFoodRetail.pdf](http://essp.ifpri.info/files/2011/04/ESSP_WP50_UrbanFoodRetail.pdf).
- World Bank. "Why Modern, Fair and Open Public Procurement Systems Matter for the Private Sector in Developing Countries," 2018. <https://www.worldbank.org/en/news/feature/2018/05/16/why-modern-fair-and-open-public-procurement-systems-matter-for-developing-countries>.
- The Indian Express. "With Free Meal, Dagdusheth Trust Reaches out to Sassoon Patients," 2013. <http://archive.indianexpress.com/news/with-free-meal-dagdusheth-trust-reaches-out-to-sassoon-patients/1142824/>.
- Yohannes, Abiy. "The Effect of School Feeding Program on the School Performance of Primary Public School Children in Arada Sub City, Addis Ababa." Thesis, Addis Ababa University, 2017. <http://etd.aau.edu.et/handle/123456789/1176>.
- Zenebe, Mastewal, Samson Gebremedhin, Carol J. Henry, and Nigatu Regassa. "School Feeding Program Has Resulted in Improved Dietary Diversity, Nutritional Status and Class Attendance of School Children." *Italian Journal of Pediatrics* 44, no. 1 (2018): 16. <https://doi.org/10.1186/s13052-018-0449-1>.